Azadari; Mourning for Imam Hussain (as)

Work file: azadari.pdf
Project: Answering-Ansar.org Articles

Revisions:

No.	Date	Author	Description	Review Info
3.0.0	03.04.2009	Answering-Ansar.org	3rd Edition	
2.0.0	10.02.2005	Answering-Ansar.org	2nd Edition	
1.0.0	06.07.2004	Answering-Ansar.org	Created	

Contents

Table of Contents

1. Introduction

As soon as the moon of Muharam al-Haram appears, the Mullahs express their outrage at mourning for Imam Husayn (as) and pledge to get mourning processions banned. Nasibi websites are flooded with articles against mourning for Imam Husayn (as). These Nasibis dedicate pages to attack the Shi'a for being adherents of Bidah and produce their customary images of blood letting to create outrage in the minds of unsuspecting Sunnis. The perfect example comes from every Nasibi's most revered site Haq Char Yaar wherein we read the comments of their Mullah:

Haq Char Yaar

> Haq Char Yaar:
>
> THE HOLY PROPHET ASKED HIS FOLLOWERS TO RESPECT THIS DAY OF ASHURA BY OBSERVING FAST AND BY DEVOTION TO WORSHIP. THE SHI'ITES HAVE TURNED THIS DAY INTO A DAY OF MOURNING ON ACCOUNT OF THE UNFORTUNATE EVENTS OF KARBALA WHERE HAZRAT HUSAYN (R.A.) WAS MARTYRED. THE SHI'ITES DEVOTE THE MONTH OF MUHARRAM, ESPECIALLY THE FIRST 10 DAYS, TO MOURNING BY CELEBRATING EVENTS OF THE BATTLE OF KARBALA AND CRYING AND WEEPING, SHEDDING TEARS, BEATING CHESTS BY HANDS AND CHAINS, TAKING OUT TA'ZIA (REPLICA OF THE FUNERAL) AND YELLING "YA-HASAN, YA HUSEIN, YA ALI" ETC. ALL THESE ACTS ARE INNOVATIONS AND PROHIBITED BY THE TEACHINGS OF ISLAM. EVEN IN THE CASE OF NEAR AND DEAR ONES, CRYING ALOUD IS NOT PERMITTED AND MOURNING WITH TEARFUL EYES AND PAINFUL HEARTS IS ALLOWED ONLY FOR THREE DAYS AFTER DEATH. THERE AFTER IT IS STRICTLY PROHIBITED.

Why are these Nawasib desperate to prevent any commemoration of the martyrdom of Imam Hussain (as)? One of the main objectives of mourning Imam Husain (as) is to highlight the injustices that he (as) suffered at the hands of the brutal regime at the time. For us this provides Muslims to delve into history and analyze the tragedy and the horrific situation that the Imam (as) faced at the time. People can assess the people, the conditions and the political leadership at the time, all factors that help us to understand the era wherein the Imam (as) lived. Let us determine why a leading light of the post Modern Cyber Takfeeris was so desperate to author '**Why Sunnis Do Not Comemmorate Ashura'** wherein

> Ibn al Hashimi issued this moving plea:
>
> Sometimes the Shia of today will encourage the Sunnis to comemmorate Ashura, using and exploiting the fact that the Ahlus Sunnah also loves Hussain (رضّی الله عنه). We strongly urge our Muslim brothers not to fall into this trap of the Shia! They want us to take part in rituals that were designed to defame the Ahlus Sunnah, and nothing more. We cannot accept the Shia way of life.]

What was the real motive behind this plea? To explain it, we really cannot find a better explanation than by comparing his comments to the attitude adopted by those that opposed the establishment of *The Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC)* a tribunal established in South Africa following the abolition of apartheid. Anyone who felt that she was a victim of its violence was invited to come forward and be heard. Whilst the Commission was welcomed as a mechanism of healing the divided ethnic communities, it courted controversy and opposition from many figures that held State positions during the Apartheid era. Such individuals desperately opposed any inquiry into past incidents, as they feared that those State crimes of would be exposed exposed. This would happen quite naturally, after all when the oppression of the victim is heard; key follow up questions will immediately be asked:

- Who was the victim?
- What was his background?
- Did he have any position of influence / respect in the community?
- Was he a person of good character?
- Was he from any prominent family?
- Were there any mitigating factors that could merit his suffering?

Once the victim is identified and these questions are asked, the next questions will automatically be raised over those that oppressed him,

- Who was the perpetrator?
- What was his background?
- Was he a person of good character?
- Was he from any prominent family?
- Did he have any position of influence / respect in the community?

If it is established that the perpetrator held a key position in the State, then the following questions will be asked:

- How did he attain this position
- Who supported his appointment?
- Who supported his tenure in office, whether through word or deed?

The answers to such questions will uncover some uncomfortable truths and will force people to reassess how they think of the oppressor and those that supported him. At the same time their desire to stand up for the oppressed part will increase, because it is natural for people to support and have sympathy for victims and hate perpetrators of oppression. The closer one sympathizes with the victim the more one hates the oppressor and those that supported him, If there exist people in society that support oppressors it is not on account of any genuine love, it is due to financial inducements or high level positions.

There exist only two grounds that individuals thwart any commemoration that highlights the suffering of a victim and unveils the identity of his oppressors:

Ground One: When they, their relatives and / or friends have aided and abetted such injustice either through word or deed. Such individuals try their utmost to stifle any discussions of conduct fearing that their deeds, or those of their loved ones will be exposed. This is like those that opposed the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa.

Ground Two: A fear that such an inquiry will force people to re-evaluate how they think of the perpetrator and his supporters; this will alter traditional perceptions of such people which shall in effect change an established belief system.

So Ibn al Hashimi which of the above grounds force you to insist that Sunnis do not commemorate Ashura?

Why do we find that the sacrifice of Imam Hussain (as) and the lessons borne from it attracts all lovers of justice, crosses the boundaries of Sect, Nation States and even religion? Why does this tragedy move the hearts of Muslim and non Muslim alike? The answer is that man has an innate desire to affiliate himself with oppressed peoples and hate those that are oppressors. If man was left in his natural state he would be attracted to this reality. The closer one gets to the victims of oppression the more one sympathizes with them and hates those that oppressed them. That is why these Nasibi deem it a priority to silence talk of Imam Hussain (as) – since they wish to cover up the sins of their ancestors. Their thinking is in line with the narration of esteemed Sunni scholar Ibn Hajr al Makki who wrote in Sawaiqh al Muhriqa page 121.

Imam Ghazali said that to mention the martyrdoms of Hassan(r) and Husayn(r) is forbidden as the Martyrdom of Husnaayn (r) inflames malice against the companions of the Prophet.

This sums up the reason for their opposition. Why does hatred of the Sahaba arise while recollecting the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as)? The reason is that whosoever will listen to the assassination of Husayn (as) he will try to locate his killer who was Yazid. The next question will be 'how' he attained the seat as Khalifa over the Muslims, and who supported him? The answer, Mu'awiyah appointed him, who secured his appointment through men such as Abdullah ibn Umar. The next question will be who helped Mu'awiya to attain this seat? The answer, these favours were bestowed upon him during the reign of the Shaykhayn. The veils will be removed and the deeds of this party will be there for all to see. Its fearing this investigation that led to Ghazzali issuing this Fatwa; after all *prevention is better than cure*.

Ibn al Hashimi could it be that like Ghazzali you are fearful that the belief system of your Nasibi Sect might be exposed, if people stop and listen to the crimes of Yazeed when they pass by street processions that will in turn raise questions over the validity of these types of statements:

> Ansar.org:
>
> Many Companions gave him the allegiance as well. Al-Hafedh Abdulghani Al-Maqdisay says: "His (Yazeed's) caliphate is rightful, sixty of the companions of the prophet peace be upon him gave him the allegiance. Ibn`Umar was one of them."
> [Qayd Al-Shareed min Akhbar Yazeed, by Ibn Khaldoun, p.70]

> Azam Tariq stated
>
> YAZID WAS THE COMMANDER OF MUSLIM FORCES WHO MARCHED TO CAESAR'S CITY. … THIS WAS THE PIONEERING MUSLIM FORCE WHICH LANDED IN CAESAR'S CITY AND ACCORDING TO A HADITH NARRATED BY ABDULLAH BIN UMAR WHICH HAS BEEN RECORDED BY BUKHARI, RASUL-ALLAH SAID:
>
> "THE ARMY WHICH WILL FIRST EMBARK ON THE EXPEDITION OF CONTANTINOPLE WILL BLESSED." (BUKHARI).
>
> YAZID WAS THE COMMANDER OF MUSLIM

> FORCES ON THIS EXPEDITION WHO WAGED JIHAD IN CAESAR'S CITY AND AS SUCH HE FALLS WITHIN THE PARAMETER OF ABOVE HADITH OF THE PROPHET (SAW). IN VIEW OF THIS IT IS NOT BECOMING ON ANY MUSLIM TO CAST ASPERIONS ON YAZID AS THE ENTIRE ARMY WHICH TOOK PART IN THIS COMPAIGN HAS BEEN BLESSED BY ALLAH IN THE CONTEXT OF ABOVE HADITH.
>
> Azam Tariq citing Ghazzali:
>
> "AS REGARDS SAYING (RADIALLAHU ANHA) AFTER THE NAME OF YAZID, THIS IS NOT ONLY PERMISSIBLE BUT COMMENDABLE. IT IS RATHER INCLUDED IN OUR DUA WHEN WE PRAY FOR THE FORGIVENESS OF ALL MUSLIMS AND YAZID WAS CERTAINLY A MOMIN (BELIEVER)." (,BERIRUT, P. 288).

We now recognize why every form of gathering / congregation is accepted and tolerated, but Azadari somehow seems to be unpalatable to Deobandis and Salafis! This is because these rituals highlight the plight of the victims, the tyranny of their killers, and the 'names' of these killers come to light. When Yazeed is publicly condemned for his issuing orders to kill Imam Hussain (as) then it is natural that Sunnis who love the victim Hussain (as) will raise questions over the validity of the above cited statements, that will in turn bring Nasaibi beliefs about Yazeed crashing to the ground, and that is what forced Ibn al Hashimi to write his article . These gatherings and mourning rituals rightly lay bare the atrocities committed by these murderers, and Nawasib share physical and spiritual ancestry with these killers. After all they deem Yazid their Imam, and deem people like Ibn Ziyad & Ibn Sa'ad to be truthful narrators of [Sunni] Hadeeth. That is why these Nasibis try in vain, to quash the memory of Imam Husayn (as) from Sunni consciousness by declaring such Dhikr to be Haraam. Their efforts are doomed to fail, as truth will always overcome falsehood.

The time has come to answer these Nasibi in the language that only they understand. If Sunni readers feel tortured and tormented with these responses then we apologise in advance but we deem love for Rasulullah (s) and his Ahl'ul bayt (as) as our foremost duty and believe that all good deeds are accepted only if one has love for the descendants of the Prophet.

1. What was the practice of the Syrians on the martyrdom anniversary of Imam Husayn (as)?

Ibn Katheer al Nasibi writes in al Bidayah wa al Nihaya, Volume 8 Page 1108 published by Nafees Academy Karachi:

"In contrast to the Shi'a, the Syrians would prepare nice foods, adorn themselves with special clothes, wear perfumes and treat the day of martyrdom as day of great happiness (Eid). A variety of foods were cooked to show their great happiness and pleasure. The purpose behind all this was to act different to the Shi'a.

2. What was the practice of Shi'as on the martyrdom anniversary of Imam Husayn (as)?

On the same page Ibn Katheer writes:

"In 400 Hijri, during the reign of Aal Boia, the Shi'a crossed all limits. Drums were beaten (to inform the people about the great day of martyrdom) in Baghdad and other big cities. Ashes and the husk were thrown into the streets and roads. Black curtains were hung on shops. People declared their grief and sorrow. They wept and many of them abstained from drinking water because Husayn was martyred in a state of hunger. Shi'a women ventured out barefooted and bareheaded, they wept, lamented and mourned. This was done to defame Banu Ummaya as Husayn [r] was martyred during their reign"

al Bidayah wa al Nihaya Volume 8 Page 1108

The mourning and shedding of blood on the day of Ashura by the Shi'as is a protest against the oppression of Mu'awiyah and his descendants for their brutal treatment of the Ahl'ul bayt (as). Our protests shall Inshallah continue till the Day of Judgement, and we don't care what the Nasibis try to end it.

2. Commemorating Muharam

3. The recollection of grief is human nature

It is human nature that even when hardships end, recollecting those bad times reignites that pain and suffering again. People will often recollect their suffering in front of relatives and friends. It is on account of this natural instinct that people commemorate the important days of their ancestors or of religious leaders. Such days are observed internationally e.g the 1st of May, is observed to remember the oppressed workers of Chicago. Some anniversaries may only be celebrated by friends and relatives, while others may be celebrated by nations (such as independence e.g. Pakistan day) and some may be commemorated internationally such as Remembrance days (to remember the victims of war). Whenever the anniversary of Yusuf's departure came or when Yaqub (as) saw the tree of departure, Yaqub (as) would have no doubt remembered his hardships.

4. To remember the Martyrs is not only the Sunnah of Prophet(s) but also the practice of Sahaba

We read in Al Bidayah wa al Nihaya, Volume 4 page 45, published Beirut:

It is narrated by Abu Hurariah(r) that the Prophet(s) used to visit the graves of martyrs every year. When He(s) would reach the entrance of the mountain, He(s) would say (to the martyrs): 'Asalam alailekum Bima Sabartum'. This means 'peace be on you due to your patience and you have reached a pleasant place due to this.' Then after Prophet(s), Abu Bakar also used to come (every year), and after him Umar used to do the same and then Usman also did the same".

After this narration the word 'every year' is recorded in the narrations of Waqidi.

The Shi'a accordingly commemorate the memory of martyrs of Kerbala every year. The Prophet (s) and his companions would visit the graves of Uhud's martyrs every year. Similarly we like to go to the tomb of Imam Husayn (as) every year in Muharam.

If one cannot implement this practise by practically visiting Kerbala every Muharam there is no grounds to abandon it altogether, we seek to do as much as we can to remember our illtreated Imam. So we commemorate the day with the processions, conferences, and mourning to show our love and faith, though we cannot go to the tomb every year.

5. The remembrance of the first ten days of Muharam

By the Dawn And ten nights, And the Even and the Odd, and the night when it departeth,
Al-Qur'an, Surah Al-Fajr, Ayah 1-4, translated by Pickthal

We read in Tafseer Durre Manthur, Volume 6 page 346 under the commentary of this verse:

Abi Usman says that three periods of Ten days are venerable which are refered to in this verse. They are, first ten days of the month of Muharam, first ten days of the month of Zilhaj and last ten days of the month of Ramadan.

Dear readers we have proved the venerability of the ten days of Muharam from the Qur'an.

6. Ashura is Allah (swt)'s day

We read in Kanz al Ummal, Volume 4 page 320:

"The day of Ashura is Allah (swt)'s day"

The day of Ashura is Allah (swt)'s day, a day of torment for the Ahl'ul bayt (as) when the beloved grandson of Rasulullah (s) was starved and martyred, a day when horses trampled his arrow pierced body.

7. Question: Is it permissible to mourn Imam Husayn (as) every year?

Reply One - Remembering the days of Allah (swt)

We read in Surah Ibrahim verse 5:

PICKTHAL: We verily sent Musa with Our revelations, saying: Bring thy people forth from darkness unto light. And remind them of the days of Allah. Lo! Therein are revelations for each steadfast, thankful (heart).

What are the 'days' of Allah (swt)?

We read in Tafseer al Kabeer Volume 5 page 219:

"Allah (swt)'s days refer to the great events that happened in favour of Musa (as). This was a day when the Banu Israel were stuck in problems, entrapped by Pharaoh's injustice.

Reply Two - Umar's continual recollection of his brother's death

We read in al Bidaya wa al Nihaya, Volume 6 page 370:

كان عمر يقول ما هبت الصبا إلا ذكرتني زيد بن الخطاب، رضي الله عنه.

Umar said: 'whenever I venture out at sunrise I remember the death of my brother Zaid bin Khattab'

If the Shi'a commemorate the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as) every year why do these Nasibi raise objections? Look at the words of your Master Umar who remembered the death of his brother throughout his life.

8. The will of our Imam (as)

We read in al-Kafi, Volume 5 page 117:

Yunus bin Yaqoob narrated that Abu Abdullah (a) said: 'My father said to me: 'O Jaffar leave part of my money for the mourners to mourn me for ten years in Mena during the days of Mena'

If mourning had been Haraam, the Imam (as) would not have left a will to that effect.

9. The continual mourning by Adam (as) and Hawa (as) for their slain son

We read in Tareekh Yaqoobi, volume 1, page 3:

"The Father and Mother of humanity wept for their son Habeel for so long that their tears turned into a stream".

In Rodha tu Shuhdah, page 30 the same incident has been quoted by Mulla Husayn Wa'iz Kashifi who adds:

"Tears from Adam's (as) right eye were flowing like the River Dajla and like the River Euphrates from his left eye".

Nasibis say that mourning on the death of ones dear ones should be restricted to three days, but this reference proves that the Father of Mankind wept for such a long period that his tears became streams. If Adam (as) wept for his son in such a manner then Nasibis should know that we the Shi'a love Imam Husayn (as) more than our children and hence likewise continually shed tears for the suffering of Imam Husayn (as).

10. Rasulullah (s) declared an entire year to be the year of grief

The annals of Seerah are unanimous that the Holy Prophet(s) named the year in which Khadija (as) and Abu Talib (as) died as "Aam al Huzn" i.e. **'The Year of Grief'**.

What other reason could there be for naming a whole year as 'Aam al Huzn', other than the Prophet(s) dedicating it to commemorate the loss of his uncle and beloved wife? Is this act of the Prophet(s) a Sunnah or not? We the Shi'a mourn our Imam (as) for ten days, Rasulullah (s) mourned for an entire year. Even after the passage of a year Rasulullah (s) never got over this grief, and this was known to Ayesha who wanted him (s) to abandon his remembrance of his dead wife. We read in Saheeh al Bukharee Hadeeth: 5.166 this narration from Ayesha:

"I did not feel jealous of any of the wives of the Prophet as much as I did of Khadija though I did not see her, but the Prophet used to mention her very often, and whenever he slaughtered a sheep, he would cut its parts and send them to the women friends of Khadija. When I sometimes said to him, "(You treat Khadija in such a way) as if there is no woman on earth except Khadija," he would say, "Khadija was such-and-such, and from her I had children".

The testimony of Ahl'ul Sunnah's leading Lady is clear evidence that the Prophet (s) never got over grieving his wife and it is obvious that the Dhikr of Khadija (as) would also have taken place in presence of receptive ears. The process of Dhikr between a speaker and listener is called a congregation (Majalis). We likewise commemorate the deaths of Khadija (as) and Abu Talib (as) and the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as).

If Muslims have no issue with celebrating nights such as the Miraaj of our Prophet (s) then there is no reason to abandon the remembrance of calamities because both grief and happiness are important in life. Offering condolences is a Mustahab act so why the opposition? Conducting any Mubah or Masnoon act, carries no timing restrictions, it can be performed at any time with respect to circumstances and situations.

11. Ahl'ul Sunnah's year of mourning

A whole year's mourning over the death of a Sunni scholar

“Imam al Harmain” whose actual name was Abdal Malik having Ziauddin as his title, according to Allamah Shibli Naumani was considered as a supreme scholar of his era and many renowned ulema were his students which included Imam Ghazali. Imam Ghazali while mentioning the mourning over his death writes in his authority work 'Kunjeena Hidayaath' the Urdu translation of Kameela Sa'aadth page 3:

"The Imam of Haramain died in 478 Hijri. At that time all the market stalls in Nishapur were closed and the pulpit in the Jami Mosque was broken, his students that numbered almost 400 destroyed their books and pens and mourned him for a whole year."

The episode can also be found in a biography of Imam Ghazali:
"Al Ghazali" page 12-13, authored by Allamah Shibli Naumani

We appeal to justice. These are the people, who have a historical enmity with writing materials, but we have no idea why the pulpit was destroyed. Did these esteemed students (who were themselves scholars) have no knowledge of the verses on patience that today's Nasibis quote against the Shi'a? Whilst they have no opinion here, the moment the Shi'a mourn Imam Husayn (as) in Muharam all manner of article is churned against mourning rituals. Let us not forget

> Ibn al Hashimi who comments:
>
> Additionally, comemmorating Ashura with any special ritual would be adding to the faith of Islam, and this is Bidah. Bidah is considered part of Hell-Fire, and whoever invents a Bidah is promised Hell-Fire as well.

The students of the Imam of Haramain mourned his loss for an entire year. Are we going to say that not even one of these four hundred was 'aware' that such mourning contravened the Qur'an and Sunnah (as the Ahl'ul Sunnah claim)? Were they ignorant of the fact that commemorating his passing through acts of anarchy and year long mourning acts of Bidah, for which they would perish in Hell? The closure of shops, abandonment of patience, destructions of the pulpit and destroying writing materials are all understandable and acceptable acts of mourning when a Sunni Imam dies, but when the Shi'a mourn Imam Husayn (as) they have exceeded the limits of the Shari'ah!

Sufi Saint Shah Hassan Miyan Phulwari Hanafi Qadri'a comments on mourning for Imam Husayn (as) in Muharam

We read in the Sunni text Gham - e - Husayn, Page 7 the following words of this Sufi Saint:

The ten days of Muharam are for we Muslims, days of mourning and grief. To lament on the slaughtered Imam is certainly following in the Holy Prophet's (a) footsteps. I consider weeping and lamenting on Imam Husayn (as) and making others too cry & weep an act of great reward. I do not wish to talk or remember anything other than the Tragedy of Imam Husayn (as) during these ten days of Muharam. All the Saints and holy men and Sufi personalities in Hindustan have always openly expressed grief and sorrow and cried and wept profusely on the Day of Ashura. Maulana Shah Muhammad Suleiman Hanafi Qadri Chishti, the residing Saint of Phulwari Shareef ever celebrated this grief & sorrow.

Comment

If expressing grief and sorrow, weeping for Imam Husayn (as) and making others do the same were Haraam, then all the Sufi Saints and holy men of Hindustan would not have perpetually practiced this sorrow during their lifetimes.

12. Shaykh al Islam Maqdoom Ala' al Haq Pindavi (R) and Azadari for Imam Husayn (as)

We read in Uswa - e - Sufia Uzzaam, Page 9 that:

Sheikh al Islam Maqdoom Ala' al Haq Pindavi (ra) used to mourn for all ten days of Muharam and would say:

"How could one achieve sainthood when he does not mourn and weep on the family of the Holy Prophet (s) and perform Azadari for these pure personalities? One who doesn't have a heart of stone."

Comment

Thus a Sunni saint has himself declared that he who does not perform Azadari cannot be a saint (wali) and he who abstains from Matam, is stone - hearted.

13. Mourning for Imam Husayn (as) attests to our support for his suffering

The Tragedy of Karbala took place in 61 Hijra. Before that incident, Islam was not divided amongst different sects. The killers of Imam Husayn (as) had been excluded from the circle of Islam. Today, to carry out the dhikr of Imam Husayn (as) is to support him and to oppose it is in effect to support the path of Yazeed. In this connection there is a very important Hadeeth:

"I heard Rasulullah (s) say 'Verily my son [Husayn] will be killed in a land called Kerbala, whoever amongst you is alive at that time must go and help him".

We have taken this Hadeeth from the following sources:

1. Khasais al Kubra Volume 2 page 125 (Maktaba Nurree Rizvi Publishers, Pakistan
2. Yanabi ul Mawwaddat chapter 60.

Our mourning for our fallen Imam is an act of expression / support for him and is hence in complete accordance with the Sunnah of Rasulullah (s). If to remember Imam Husayn (as), carry out the Dhikr of his courageous actions, mourn, lament and wail while falling deep into the sentiments of love is not evidence of our support for him then what is?

To follow the path of Husayn (as) is to share in his joys and tragedies? Our Azadari is the means via which we show our support for the suffering of Imam Husayn (as). It is based on our love and affection for him. Token words by Nasibis such as 'We also love Husayn' mean nothing, Love needs to be practical and as true lovers of Imam Husayn (as) we deem it necessary to keep the remembrance of our beloved in our heart. The names of a beloved are always on the lips of an adherent. People who want to bring the Dhikr of Husayn (as) to an end by crying Bidah do so because they want to end his remembrance so as to cover up the sins of their Nasibi ancestors who killed Imam Husayn (as).

14. Mourning on Husayn (as) is tantamount to mourning the Holy Prophet (s)

Shah Abdul Aziz Muhadith Dehlavi while explaining the philosophy of Martyrdom writes in the preface of his Book 'Sirr al Shahdatain':

"The martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as) is in reality the martyrdom of his grandfather Muhammad Mustafa (s)"

We therefore infer from this that mourning (Azadari) of the leader of the martyrs, Husayn (as) is mourning (Azadari) of his grandfather the Seal of Prophets, the most beloved of Allah's creation, Muhammad Mustafa (s).

15. Allah (swt)'s desire that the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as) is conveyed to all

Renowned anti Shia scholar al Muhaddith Shah Abdul Aziz Dehalvi writes:

Martyrdom is of two types, hidden martyrdom and the other type is open and hidden martyrdom. Both types were distributed between the two grandsons of the Holy Prophet (s). The hidden martyrdom happened to be Imam Hasan's share since the state was hidden from the people when he was poisoned by his wife and this all happened because it was supposed to be kept secret and undisclosed and it was also foretold by the Holy Prophet (s). The latter type of martyrdom, was attained by the younger grandson of the Holy Prophet (s), Imam Husayn (r) who was chosen. Since this was to be a disclosed and unveiled martyrdom t its news was revealed through Gabriel and the place of his martyrdom was foretold and the time was declared to be the beginning of the year 61 A.H. It was declared on numerous occasions, Ali (as) also foretold the people about it when they were in the battle of Sifeen. When the tragedy occurred it was conveyed in a manner by Allah (swt) whereby the earth started to bleed and the sky turned red and the invisible angelic speakers and Djinns recited elegies for Imam Husayn (a.s), Lions and other beasts kept roaming around the body of Imam Husayn in order to protect it, and live snakes kept shoving into and out of the nostrils of the assassins of Imam Husayn. This incident was made famous in numerous other ways was conveyed to those present and absent, that the greatest sacrifice and martyrdom had occurred. Infact Allah started this custom of mourning and weeping for Imam Husayn, so that he might be remembered and cried upon, and all those hardships should be remembered; even the reason behind all this is the same that this incident should earn fame and acknowledgement. This was achieved everyone present or absent, human or spirits and the creatures came to know about this incident.
Risala sar al-Shahadatein Dar Tehreer al-Shahadatein, page 4-20, published in Lucknow

These are the comments of a vehement opponent of the Shi'a. If the desire of Allah (swt) is that the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as) be conveyed to all, then the Shi'a are implementing this will by retelling this event in every home, Mosque and Street Corner.

3. The rewards for mourning Imam Husayn (as)

16. Azadari distinguishes between the path of Husayn (as) and that of Yazeed

Had it not been for these mourning rituals, the distinction between the path of Husayn (as) and that of Yazeed would have been destroyed, thanks to the efforts of Nasibis such as Sipah-e-Sahaba who now openly deem the Khilafath of Yazeed to be rightful.

Azadari has ensured that the efforts of Yazeed's modern day lovers will never be achieved, Yazeed will for ever be deemed as a hateable man who symbolises filth, shame, debauchery, decadence, immorality, mental corruption, and all the ingredients existent in the DNA of Iblis (Devil).

We deem our Azadari (mourning) as the means via which we can express our sorrow for the Ahl'ul bayt (as). The words of Imam of Ahl'ul Sunnah Allamah Fakhrudeen Radhi are very important:

"It is our firm belief that one who dies with love for the descendants of Muhammad (s) dies a martyr".
Tafseer-a-Kabeer volume 7 page No.390 line No 9

17. Martyrdom in Sunni books

"One who dies on account of overeating will be alleviated from punishment in the grave"
Al-Jami al-Kabir by al Tabrani Page No. 59

We read in Sahih Bukhari Volume 1, Book 11, Number 688, Book of revelation:

Narrated Abu Huraira:
The Prophet said, "Martyrs are those who die because of drowning, plague, an abdominal disease, or of being buried alive by a falling building."

We read in Sunan al Nasai Volume 4 Page 99:

"The Prophet said, "Martyrs are those who die because of plague, an abdominal disease, or a women that dies in child birth"

In sum these references show that in the eyes of the Ahl'ul Sunnah, one who dies on account of:

1. Overeating
2. Catching the plague
3. Stomach pain
4. Drowning
5. Being flattened under a wall
6. Childbirth
7. and also that poor fellow who is killed in Jihad.

4. Is Azadari against patience (sabr)?

The Nasibi Mullah states:

> Haq Char Yaar
> IN THE QUR'AN THE MUSLIMS ARE ADVISED:
>
> "O YE WHO BELIEVE!
> SEEK HELP IN PATIENCE AND PRAYER; FOR VERILY ALLAH IS WITH THOSE WHO ARE PATIENT." (2: 153).

26. Reply One - Overview of the verse

Our initial replies to these Nawasib are as follows:

1. Azadari is not against the concept of patience. If weeping is against the concept of patience than why in Qur'an it is mentioned that weeping increases (earnest) humility.

   [Yusufali 17:109] They fall down on their faces in tears, and it increases their (earnest) humility.
2. If Azadari is against patience then could this Nasibi Mullah translate the surrounding verses and prove his point.
3. If Azadari is against patience than we would like to ask why Qur'an refers to the lengthy mourning of Prophet Yaqub (as) as 'Perfect Patience' (Sabr-e-Jameel), when he lost his eyesight and in fact nearly died?

27. Reply Two - The Meaning of Sabr in this verse

In his commentary of the verse (2:153) al Muhaddith Shah, Abdul Qadir Dehlavi wrote:

Here the actual meaning of 'patience' is to 'stand fast' because in the next verse, 'Jihad' has been discussed.

Comment

Allah (swt) is actually telling us to stand fast and firm during Jihad and this Nasibi is advancing the term Sabr as evidence for the prohibition of mourning, now shall we adhere to Allah (swt) or this Mullah?

The Deobandi Sects esteemed scholars Allamah Ashraf Ali Thanvi and Shah Abdul Qadir in their respective Tafseers gave a similar translation of the verse.

Here the translation of Shah Sahib is correct that no matter how arduous the war is, and no matter how many hardships are faced during the war, one should not flee the battlefield. So we come to know that the meaning of 'patience' also in this ayah is to stand fast and to run from battlefield is impatience. Therefore Allah (swt) is with those soldiers who don't run from the battle, they are the ones who are truthful and righteous/Allah-fearing [Muttaqi] The runners are impatient people and they have no relation whatsoever with Allah (swt), truthfulness and Taqwa. Lest there be any doubt about the meaning of Sabr here, let us allow Saheeh al

Bukharee to expand on the 'Sabr' of the Sahaba in this context:

We read in Sahih Bukhari 'Fighting for the Cause of Allah (Jihad) Volume 4, Book 52, Number 205:

Narrated Ibn 'Umar:
When we reached (Hudaibiya) in the next year (of the treaty of Hudaibiya), not even two men amongst us agreed unanimously as to which was the tree under which we had given the pledge of allegiance, and that was out of Allah's Mercy. (The sub narrator asked Naf'i, "For what did the Prophet take their pledge of allegiance, was it for death?" Naf'i replied "No, but he took their pledge of allegiance for patience.")

Sahih Bukhari Volume 4, Book 52, Number 86:

Narrated Salim Abu-An-Nadr:
'Abdullah bin Abi Aufa wrote and I read what he wrote that Allah's Apostle said, "When you face them (i.e. your enemy) then be patient."

This tradition therefore leaves no doubt that Sabr in this verse means to maintain one's position in battle, as is also attested in the Surah Aal-e-Imran:

003.125
YUSUFALI: "Yea, - if ye remain firm [Sabr], and act aright, even if the enemy should rush here on you in hot haste, your Lord would help you with five thousand angels Making a terrific onslaught.

We appeal to justice the narration of Sabr exploited by these Nasibi to apply to the Shi'a needs to be applied to the Sahaba first. Analyse any battle, Uhud, Khayber, Khunduq, Hunayn, where can firm footing be established? Did they adhere to this form of Sabr? If we analyse history it can be proved without a shadow of a doubt that they did not.

Sabr' does not therefore serve as evidence on the prohibition of the Azadari, the mourners of Leader of the Youth of Paradise, Imam Husayn (as) are truthful and people of heaven and no doubt Allah (swt) is with the mourners because mourners are with the oppressed ones and the enemies of the oppressor, Allah (swt) who is "Aadil" will likewise be with the oppressed group.

28. Reply Three - Sabr carries multiple meanings

There are different types of Sabr:

1. Patience in war; here the Sahaba acted in a manner that one finds difficulty in giving any similar example. We have the fleeing at Uhud and retreats in Khayber.
2. Patience in the face of sins; Here the Salaf shone, rather than remain patient their Kingpins were the leaders when it came to the usurpation of Sayyida Fatima (as)'s legal rights, and the cursing of 'Ali (as).
3. Patience in times of strife; that has two conclusions, (a) failure to maintain patience in the face of strife is a major sin in the eyes of Allah (swt) (b) To recollect the suffering of the victim to eulogies, crying and chest beating is not impatience but rather are acts permitted under the Shariah.

29. Reply Four - Its isn't compulsory to maintain Sabr against injustice

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed work Tafseer Kabir Volume 9 page 10:

أن الصبر على قضاء الله تعالى واجب فأما الصبر على ظلم الظالمين ، ومكر الماكرين فغير واجب

"Keeping patience over Allah's will is Wajib while keeping patience over the injustice and cunningness is not Wajib".

Ahl'ul Sunnah's great Tafseer Scholar Fakhrudeen Razi said patience in the face of injustice is not compulsory. Therefore when the Shi'a commemorate the injustices of the victims of Kerbala then why do these Nasibi keep demanding that we maintain Sabr?

30. Reply Five - It is permissible to relate your suffering

We read in a Sunni book namely 'Nazhaat al Naazareen' page 247:

"To relate one's suffering provided there is no criticism against Allah (swt), does not contradict Sabr. Allah (swt) in the Qur'an praised his Prophet Yaqub even though he conveyed his sufferings"

31. Reply Six - The Sabr of Prophet Yusuf (as)

Allah (swt) reveals in Surah Yusuf, verse 84:

[Shakir] "And he turned away from them, and said: O my sorrow for Yusuf! and his eyes became white on account of the grief, and he was a repressor (of grief)."
Quran 12:84

'Fahu Kazeem' means the 'one who absorbs the anguish' but it is proved from the Qur'an that Prophet Yaqub (as) this in no way means that he fought off impulses to fight off his grief. He (as) always exhibited his grief both by his eyes and his tongue. Maulvi Ashraf Ali Thanvi has translated the word *'Fahu Kazeem'* in this way that "Yaqub (as) used to be tormented within his heart" and that's the translation based on rationality while the Qur'an also testifies this. The Qur'an reveals the discussion between Yaqub (as) and his sons in the following:

[Yusufali 12:85] They said: "By Allah! (never) wilt thou cease to remember Joseph until thou reach the last extremity of illness, or until thou die!"

This discussion revealed in the Qur'an proves that the intensity of Yaqub (as)'s grief was to the extent that his sons thought that Yaqub (as) would die on account of his anguish. The pain and agony that Yaqub (as) was confronted with seemed to be the one that is done in a loud voice:

"Alas, my grief for Joseph!"

When the sons commented on the mourning ritual of Yaqub (as), He replied:

[Shakir 12:86] He said: I only complain of my grief and sorrow to Allah, and I know from Allah what you do not know.

Verily, it is evident from the Qur'an that Yaqub (as) lamented to the extent that he not only lost his eyesight but also came close to death. Now the most important thing here is that even after such intense lamentation (Azadari) Allah (swt) called this mourning of Yaqub (as) as 'Sabr e Jameel' i.e Perfect Patience. Therefore, according to the Qur'an it becomes very clear that to be aggrieved in the exhibition of one's anguish i.e. to perform Azadari isn't against patience. Hence, the notion of Nasibis that the meaning of *"Kazeem"* is not to show the grief of one's

heart has been has no Qur'anic basis. Rather its meaning is to tolerate or to bear and which does not in any way prove evidence that mourning for Imam Husayn (as) is Haraam.

Another critical point that we can derive from this story is that the people who were the main cause of Yaqub (as)'s grief also turned out to be the critics on the Azadari of Yaqub (as)! Therefore readers can clearly conclude to which group the critics of Azadari should be counted!

Maulana Ashraf Ali Thanvi's comments on Sabr

One of the most prestigious scholars of Deobandis, Maulana Ashraf Ali Thanvi writes:

"Weeping and to be distressed or aggrieved to any adversity does not abort patience and reward because it is from the natural instinct of a human being, as there is a hadith by Muslim that Prophet(s) came to see Sa`d bin Ibada (ra) and started weeping when He(s) found him unconscious. Watching the Prophet(s), the people who were present there also started to weep. The Prophet(s) said that 'Allah (swt) does not send wrath for weeping or for aggrieving of the heart', that means Allah (swt) sends wrath for complaining and making elegies against him."
Translation of Holy Quran by Maulana Ashraf Ali Thanvi, Page 390, published by Malik Deen Mohammad & Sons, Lahore

The meaning of 'Patience' by Maulana Ashraf Ali Thanvi

In his commentary of Surah Yusuf, verse 84, Maulana Ashraf Ali Thanvi whilst discussing the 'patience' of Prophet Yaqub (as), notes that he (as) countered his sons' criticisms of his mourning practise by stating:

"How will you teach me patience, the impatient is he who complains of the creation to the creator, while I say to Him who gave me this pain and I also know that this is my test, and I want to see at what stage it ends"

Tafseer By Maulana Shabir Ahmed Uthmani

The prominent Scholar of Ahle Sunnah, Maulana Shabir Ahmed Uthmani writes in his commentary of this verse:

"The old wound re-emerged by being confronted with a new wound and He screamed uncontrollably: "Alas, my grief for Yusuf!"

Now decide honestly don't the old wound of Husayn (as)'s lovers re-emerge when our opponents try to prohibit the remembrance of Husayn (as) and criticize the Dhikr e Husayn (as)? Hence, if we show our grief by saying *'Oh Husayn!'*, or *'Oppressed Husayn!'* than this is the adherence with the Sunnah of Prophet Yaqub (as) and to oppose this is to oppose the Sunnah of a rightful Prophet. Therefore the deniers of the Sunnah of a Prophet have no right to be called 'Ahl'ul Sunnah.'

The explanation of word 'Huzn'

If we ponder over the word "Huzn", revealed in verse 84 of Surah Yusuf, we come to know that it is a term that incorporates many forms of expression such as to wail, cry, mourn and lament. The Huzn' of Yaqub (as) was so intense and extreme according to Allah (swt) that it caused Prophet Yaqub (as) to lose his eyesight by weeping and nearly die. When we have such an extreme form of Azadari in the Qur'an then to all extent and purpose the discussion of chest

beating, etc becomes almost insignificant, as you cannot compare chest beating to an act so extreme that it causes physical disability!

Let us cite an example:

Guests were given food and their appetites were fully satisfied.

The following actions were implemented to achieve this aim:

Food was served on the table. Many kinds of delicious drinks and food were served. The guests had their meal according to tradition Hosts carried out their functions as is the accepted custom.

There is no need to go into the minute details, the end result is clear that 'food was eaten', it is accepted that all the above acts are included to attain this final output.

Similarly, when Allah (swt) mentions the extreme grief of his Prophet (as)'s acts that left him blind and close to death then there remains no need to discuss the minor acts like that of chest beating. Our mourning rituals are not an iota of the Azadari of Prophet Yaqub (as). The act of mourning by an infallible Prophet of Allah (swt) in remembrance of his son is legitimate in the eyes of Allah (swt) and praised by Allah (swt) as it is the Sunnah of Prophet Yaqub (as).

32. Reply Seven - The impatience of Rasulullah (s) when mourning about Imam Husayn (as)

We read in Mishkat al Mabaeeh Volume 4 page 476 Hadeeth number 495:

"Umm Fadl reported that she went to the Apostle of Allah and said: 'O Apostle of Allah! I have seen a horrible dream tonight. He said 'And what is it?' She said 'It is terrible! He said 'What is it?' She said 'I saw that a piece of your flesh has been cut off and placed in my lap'. The Apostle of Allah said, 'You have seen good. If Allah wills, Fatimah will give birth to a son who will be in your lap'. Then Fatimah gave birth to Husayn and he was in my lap just as the Apostle of Allah had said. One day I went to the Apostle of Allah and placed him in his lap' Thereafter his look was fixed to me when lo! His both eyes were shedding tears. I said 'O prophet of Allah by mother and father, what is the matter with you? He said: Gabriel came and informed me that my followers will soon kill this son of mine. I said 'He? He said 'Yes'. He brought some earth to me out of his red earth".

The verse of Sabr descended upon the Holy Prophet (s) and no one knew the meaning of Sabr better than him (s). He mourned the future suffering of his live grandson and this proves that mourning of the living is the Sunnah of the Prophet. That is, mourning for Husayn (as) is the Sunnah of the Prophet (s).

> Ibn al Hashimi says:
>
> true Muslims must not take part in the Shia rituals on the day of Ashura. Although we recognize that the death of Hussain (رضیّ الله عنه) was a tragic event, it is a Bidah (evil innovation to Islam) to commemorate his death because the Prophet (صلّی الله علیه وآله وسلّم) did not do so. How could the Prophet (صلّی الله علیه وآله وسلّم) comemmorate his death when the Prophet (صلّی الله علیه وآله وسلّم) himself died many years before the death of Hussain (رضیّ الله عنه)?

Ibn al Hashimi we suggest you looked carefully at the above cited reference, since it evidences that the Prophet (s) mourned the future suffering of his live grandson and this proves that mourning of the living is the Sunnah of the Prophet. That is, mourning for Husayn (as) is the Sunnah of the Prophet (s).

33. Reply Eight - Rasulullah's impatience upon seeing Imam Husayn (as) fall

1. Sunan al Nasai, Volume 3 Chapter 107 page 192
2. Sahih Ibn Maja by Albaani, Volume 2 page 283
3. Jami al Tirmidhi Volume 2 page 587

'Buraidah narrated that the Prophet was giving a Sermon, at that point Hassan and Husayn came in. They were wearing a red dress and crawling and on account of their infancy they stumbled. Rasulullah (s) stopped his Sermon, got off the pulpit and lifted them and returned back to the pulpit. He said: 'Allah said *'{Your wealth and your children are only a temptation}'* I saw these two (walking and falling) and I lost my patience.''

Comment

Rasulullah (s) saw Imam Husayn (as) falling in the Mosque and was unable to maintain Sabr. When in 62 Hijri, 10th Muharam he (as) fell from his horse and horses trampled over his body, what sort of patience do you think the Prophet (s) maintained? This Hadeeth clearly proves that to maintain Sabr at the suffering of Imam Husayn (as) is not good, otherwise Rasulullah (s) would not have said 'I lost my patience'.

34. Reply Nine - Rasulullah lost his Sabr when witnessing the body of his slain uncle

For this evidence we have relied on the following esteemed Sunni works:

1. Madarij ul-Nabuwat, volume 2, page 576.
2. Seerat al Halabiya, (Udru Translation) Volume 2 Part 2 Page 206

"Ibn Mas'ud said that he never saw Holy Prophet (s) crying as much as he cried over his uncle Hamza. His Excellency stood near his uncle's dead body and started crying and lamenting so loudly that he fainted. He was saying: Oh! Uncle of Allah's Apostle, Oh! Allah's lion, Oh! Prophet's lion, Oh Hamza! The virtuous, Oh Hamza! The eliminator of the troubles, Oh Hamza! The eradicator of the Prophet's enemies'.

From here it can is clear that how lamenting, mourning and excessive crying came to existence."

Seerat e Halabiya, - Udru Translation - Volume 2 Part 2 Page 206

These Nawasib take on life is that one should remain unflinching in times of trouble and should not mourn at such suffering as this is a breach of Sabr stipulated in the Qur'an. If this is indeed the case, then what is their view on the actions of Rasulullah (s)? Rather than maintain Sabr he cried and lamented to such an extent that he lost consciousness? This proves that such actions

do not violate the injunction to be patient, otherwise the Prophet (s) would never had participated in such a manner.

35. Reply Ten - Rasulullah (s) did not maintain Sabr upon the death of Ibraheem

We read in Sahih Bukhari Volume 2, Book 23, Number 390:

Narrated Anas bin Malik:
We went with Allah's Apostle (pbuh) to the blacksmith Abu Saif, and he was the husband of the wet-nurse of Ibrahim (the son of the Prophet). Allah's Apostle took Ibrahim and kissed him and smelled him and later we entered Abu Saif's house and at that time Ibrahim was in his last breaths and the eyes of Allah's Apostle (pbuh) started shedding tears. 'Abdur Rahman bin 'Auf said, "O Allah's Apostle, even you are weeping!" He said, "O Ibn 'Auf, this is mercy." Then he wept more and said, "The eyes are shedding tears and the heart is grieved, and we will not say except what pleases our Lord, O Ibrahim! Indeed we are grieved by your separation."

36. Reply Eleven - Rasulullah (s) did not maintain Sabr at the death of his Uncle Abu Talib (as)

Shaykh Sibt Ibn Jauzi records in Tadhkira tul Khawwas page 6:

'Ali narrates when news of the death of my father reached the Prophet (s), he began to cry profusely and he ordered that he would perform his Ghusl, burial rites and burial, may Allah send his blessings and mercy on him".

37. Reply Twelve - The impatience of the Prophet (s) at the death of his grandfather

As evidence we shall rely on Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed works

1. Tareekh Khamees Volume 1 page 235
2. Tadhkirat ul Khawwas al Ummah page 4

Umm Ayman narrates 'I saw Rasulullah (s) as a child crying at the funeral of his grandfather Abdul Muttalib".

38. Reply Thirteen - The impatience of Rasulullah (s) with regard to the sufferings of Maula Ali (as)

As evidence we shall rely on the following esteemed Sunni sources:

1. Izalat ul Khifa, Volume 1 page 487
2. Kanz al Ummal, Volume 6 page 408 min Qism al Fayl
3. Riyadh al Nadira, Volume 3 page 234 Chapter al Salabeh
4. Nur al Absar, page 79, Bab Manaqib 'Ali
5. Tareekh Baghdad, Volume 12 page 398, Dhikr Fayz ibn Wasiq
6. Tadhkirat Khawwas al Ummah, page 27 Bab Saneeh
7. Musnad Abi Y'ala, Volume 1 page 437
8. Musnad al-Bazar, Volume 1 page 422
9. Mu'ajam al-Kabir, by Tabarani, Volume 11 page 61
10. Al-Kamil, by Ibn Uday, Volume 7 page 173
11. Tarikh Damishq, Volume v42 page 322

All these books state:

Ali bin Abi Talib narrated: 'While I was walking with Allah's messenger (s) through the streets of Madina, we saw a garden and I said: 'Oh Allah's messenger, what a beautiful garden'. Allah's messenger (s) said: 'A better garden is awaiting for you in Paradise'. Then we passed through another one, thus I said: 'Oh Allah's messenger, what a beautiful garden'. Allah's messenger said: 'A better garden awaits you in Paradise'. We passed through seven gardens and about each of them I said: 'What a beautiful garden' and Allah's messenger said to me 'A better garden awaits you in Paradise'. Then when the streets became empty, Allah's messenger (s) embraced me and began to cry profusely'. I asked: 'O messenger of Allah, why are you crying?' He said: 'The hearts of the people bear hatred towards you that shall open up after my death'. I said: 'Oh Allah's messenger will my faith be safe?' He (the prophet) said: 'Yes your faith will be safe'.

Comment

Today's Nasibi say that it is Bidah to cry for those that are alive. Maula 'Ali (as) was alive and Rasulullah (s) was crying for the sufferings he had to endure in the future. We likewise mourn over the sufferings of Imam Husayn (as) since mourning for those who are alive is the Sunnah of the Prophet (s).

Rasulullah (s) lost his Sabr upon seeing the Sand of Karbala

We read in Musnad Ahmad Ibn Hanbal volume 1, page 85, published in Egypt:

Hazrat Abdullah Najji has reported from his father that he accompanied 'Ali to Sifeen, and was carrying Maula Ali's equipment required for washing and purification. When they reached the place of Naynawa, Imam Ali (a.s) said in a loud voice:

"O! Abu Abdullah (Husayn), look, be patient when you arrive at the Euphrates." Najji says that after hearing this strange statement by Ali I asked:

"O Master! What did you mean?"

Ali replied:
"Once I went to see the Holy Prophet (s) and saw tears flowing from his eyes, I asked him what upset him that caused such tears. His Excellency replied that no one had displeased him but Gabriel had just left him saying that Husayn would be martyred at the Euphrates. I then asked him if he should bring the sand of that place for him to smell, on that Gabriel presented a handful of sand when this happened he (s) couldn't control himself and burst into tears."

The tradition can also be read in:
Sawaiq e Muhirqah, page 641

39. Reply Fourteen - Maula 'Ali (as) did not deem Sabr at the death of the Prophet (s) to be a good thing

We read in Nahj ul Balagha the words of Maula 'Ali page 207 [printed Egypt]:

"Ali said In relation to the death of the Prophet (s) 'O Rasulullah (s), patience is a good thing, but patience at the time of your death is not a good thing, mourning is a bad thing but mourning at the time of your death is not a bad thing".

Comment

We appeal to our readers. Rasulullah (s) had said, **"Husayn is from me and I am from Husayn"**, and Shah Abdul Aziz in the context of this hadith writes in Sirush Shahadhathayn,

"By attaining martyrdom Hassan and Husayn attained the rank of their grandfather".

This reference sheds light on the fact that the martyrdom of Hassnain (as) was in reality the martyrdom of Rasulullah (s). Link this to the fact that Maula 'Ali (as) said that Sabr at the time of Rasulullah's death was not a good thing, hence mourning, reciting poetry and chest beating at the death of Imam Husayn (s) should not be deemed impatience!

40. Reply Fifteen - The comments of Maula 'Ali at the grave of the Prophet (s)

We read in Tadhkirat ul Khawwas al Ummah, page 97:

"Shaybi narrates that 'Ali approached the grave of the Prophet (s) and said 'O Rasulullah (s) sadness [at your suffering] will never be bad and patience at your suffering is not a good thing".

Comment

We ask those who bark about the prohibition of mourning to look in their own books and see the mourning of their fourth Khalifa. Perhaps these people who claim that to adhere to every action of the Sahaba is correct should take into account the words of the Prophet (s) **"Ali is with the Qur'an and the Qur'an is with 'Ali"**. Hence when Maula 'Ali referred to mourning then the Qur'an also deems this to be the case and such mourning is truthful.

41. Reply Sixteen - The impatience of Maula 'Ali (as) at the death of Sayyida Fatima (as)

We read in Nahjul Balagha page 182:

"Ali said regarding Fatima's death "O Rasulullah (s) my patience in regards to the torment of your daughter has run out"

42. Reply Seventeen - Maula Ali (as)'s mourning at the deaths of Hamza (ra) and Sayyida Fatima (as)

Shiekh Abdul Haq writes:

"**It is narrated that after the pagans had left, the Muslims came to the battlefield and started finding their martyrs. Holy Prophet [s] said: "Where is my uncle, where is Hamza[ra]", Hadhrat Ali e Murtada started finding him, when he reached the corpse of Hamza[ra] and saw his condition and state, he started weeping, and**

returned to the Holy Prophet [s] inorder to let him know about the incident."
Madarij un Nabuwat, Volume 2, page 209

We also read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed work Muruj al Dhuhab, Volume 3 page 297:

"When Sayyida Fatima died Ali mourned and cried profusely".

The Qur'an may well have references about Sabr, yet that individual about whom the Prophet (s) said "Ali is with the Qur'an and the Qur'an is with 'Ali" had no knowledge of these verses! These Nasibi deem it important to maintain sabr in sufferings and cite a weak Shi'a Hadeeth in this connection. Have these Nasibis not come across this tradition wherein the Imam refers to his own mourning?

43. Reply Eighteen - Hazrat Bilal (ra)'s lamentation on hearing the news of Sayyida Fatima (as)'s death

Shiekh Abdul Haq Dehalvi writes in his esteemed work Madarij un Nabuwat:

Hadhrat Bilal [ra] was one of those who had migrated to Syria, a few months had passed by, and one night Hadhrat Bilal had the privilege of seeing Holy Prophet [s] in his dream wherein he said:

"O Bilal! Why are you being cruel to us? Why don't you come for our pilgrimage?" Hadhrat Bilal woke up after that and left for Medina the very moment. In the meantime Sayyeda Fatima [ra] had passed away, after he had asked Hadhrat Imam Hasan [ra] and Hadhrat Imam Hussein [ra] about Sayyeda Fatima [ra], Hadhrat Bilal started to cry and cried excessively, then said:

"O beloved of the Prophet! By God, how quickly did you go and meet your father."
Madarij un Nabuwat, volume 2, page 755 published in Karachi

44. Reply Nineteen - Maula 'Ali lost his Sabr when visiting Kerbala

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's authority work 'Sawaiqh al Muhriqa' page 115:

"Ali was making his way to Sifeen and stopped at Kerbala and asked 'What is the name of this land?' The people said 'this land is called Kerbala, upon hearing this he began to cry so profusely that the ground became wet with water".

Comment

Was Maula 'Ali (as) ignorant of the verse on patience and the Hadeeth on Sabr?

45. Reply Twenty - The three Khalifas lack of 'Sabr' at the death of the Prophet (s)

We are relying on Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed work 'Nazhat al Nazareen' page 293 by Shaykh Abdul Malik, the Khateeb of Jamaah Umawi:

"When the Prophet died the reactions of the people were different. Umar became mad at the death of the Prophet (s) and Uthman and Abu Bakr's eyes were filled with tears"

46. Reply Twenty One - Mourning Imam Husayn (as) gives us Sabr

For the Shi'a of Maula Ali (as) mourning our slain Imam teaches us about the true definition of Sabr. If patience in the face of trials and tribulations is incumbent on us all, then we see no greater example of Sabr than Imam Husayn (as) in Karbala, who remained patient in the face of untold afflictions and tragedies. When we experience tragedies in our lives our minds focus to the tragedy of Karbala, we mourn our Imam (as) and by doing so we forget about any personal tragedies such as the bereavement of parents, siblings or offspring. Remmebering the tragedy of Karbala eases our personal pain and gives us patience, since my recollecting this tragedy we realise that the heartache that the troubles that we face are not an iota compared to that experienced by Imam Husayn (as) and his women folk.

Comment

Tell us! Were the three Khalifas ignorant of the verses about patience? If so why were their eyes filled with tears?

If crying at suffering is a bad thing and patience needs to be adopted in such situations then what Fatawa should we apply to these "three close friends" of the Prophet? One becomes mad, the other two shed tears; why did they oppose the order of patience set out in the Qur'an? If our critics see no problem with this reference then why are they opposed when the Shi'a shed tears at the suffering of Imam Husayn (as) and his followers? It becomes clear that their enmity is only with the family of the Prophet (s) and they are affiliated with those Imams who through various means sought to silence discussion about the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as).

47. Reply Twenty Two - Uthman lost his visual sense when the Prophet (s) died

We read in Tabaqat ibn Sa'ad, Volume 2 page 312:

قال سمعت عثمان بن عفان يقول توفي رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم فحزن عليه رجال من أصحابه حتى كاد بعضهم يوسوس فكنت ممن حزن عليه فبينا أنا جالس في أطم من آطام المدينة وقد بويع أبو بكر إذ مر بي عمر فلم أشعر به لما بي من الحزن

Abdullah bin Amro bin Aas narrated that Uthman bin Afan said: 'When Allah's messenger (pbuh) passed away, some men among his companions were bereaved until they were closed to get scruple and I was also among those bereaved ones. While I was sitting in a house in Madina, Abu Bakr was chosen as Caliph, Umar walked passed me, but my distress was such that I did not even know that he passed by".

48. Reply Twenty Three - Ayesha's request for mourning at the death of her brother

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed work Tareekh Abu'l Fidah, Volume 1 page 179:

ولما بلغ عائشة قتل أخيها محمد جزعت عليه وقنتت في دبر كل صلاة تدعو على معاوية وعمرو بن العاص وضمت عيال أخيها محمد إليها ولما بلغ علياً مقتله جزع عليه

"When the news of her brothers death reached Ayesha she mourned at his suffering and after praying she would curse Mu'awiya and Amr ibn Aas. When the news of Muhammad's murder reached Ali he also mourned".

Those Nasibi Mullahs who in this day and age insist that chest beating, reciting couplets and crying are against the Shariah should contemplate the actions of Ayesha at the death of her brother. Ayesha asked for the mourning of her slain brother Muhammad. If such an act is Bidah then its founder was Ayesha. If the brother of Ayesha dies then asking for mourning is permissible, yet when the Shi'a mourn over the suffering of the family of the Prophet their act is Haraam!

49. Reply Twenty Four - Abu Bakr's loss of Sabr upon the death of the Prophet (s)

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's authority work Musnad Imam Azam page 179 on the events at the time of the death of the Prophet (s):

"Abu Bakr said 'O Woe is me, my back has been broken"

Was the first Khalifa of Ahl'ul Sunnah ignorant of the Qur'anic verse on Sabr? If it was permissible for Abu Bakr to abandon sabr at the death of Rasulullah (s) then the Shi'a can likewise abandon sabr at the martyrdom of the Prophet (s)'s grandson.

50. Reply Twenty Five - Ayesha lost her Sabr and tried to commit suicide

Sahih Bukhari, Bab al Nikah Volume 7, Book 62, Number 138:

Narrated al-Qasim:
A'isha said that whenever the Prophet intended to go on a journey, he drew lots among his wives (so as to take one of them along with him). During one of his journeys the lot fell on 'A'isha and Hafsa. When night fell the Prophet would ride beside 'A'isha and talk with her. One night Hafsa said to 'A'isha, "Won't you ride my camel tonight and I ride yours, so that you may see (me) and I see (you) (in new situation)?" 'A'isha said, "Yes, (I agree.)" So 'A'isha rode, and then the Prophet came towards 'Ayesha's camel on which Hafsa was riding. He greeted Hafsa and then proceeded (beside her) till they dismounted (on the way). 'A'isha missed him, and so, when they dismounted, she put her legs in the Idhkhir and said, "O Lord (Allah)! Send a scorpion or a snake to bite me for I am not to blame him (the Prophet).

If today's Nawasib mock the Shi'a for not maintaining Sabr, preferring to indulge in acts of self-harm, then they should know that the intention of the Shi'a is at no point to cause loss of life. Compare our intention to that of Ayesha. Rather than maintain Sabr, she lost it completely and wanted to kill herself!

51. Reply Twenty Six - Weeping for the dead is not against patience

In this connection we have the actual comments of Abdul Hamid Ghazzali In his esteemed work, Ihya ul Uloom Adeen" Volume 4, page 126, Translation by Maulana Nadeem Al Waajdi Fazil Deobandi, Published in Karachi

"Weeping for the dead is not against patience".

5. Crying and wailing for Imam Husayn (as)

52. Crying is a natural act

Islam is a religion based on nature. Wailing or weeping is the innate instinct of a human being. A newborn child starts his life crying. Weeping is not prohibited in any religion or creed of the world. Tears are automatically shed when a man is confronted by any physical, mental or spiritual mishap, and tears are not only the sign of grief but also a kind of reimbursement for that grief. Now in whose grief does a newborn child weep? That's the question, which can be answered by the one who remembers his own weeping when he was born. It is said, that when Adam (as) was sent to this earth from heaven, he wept on that migration and hence every child of Adam (as), weeps when he opens his eyes in this world. If this is true, then this reason for wailing certainly supports our point of view that in the grief of a departure, wailing is a natural habit. Wailing or weeping is a natural instinct hence Allah (swt) has also praised this act and has said in the Holy Qur'an:

We read in Surah Maryam 019.058

YUSUFALI: Those were some of the prophets on whom Allah did bestow His Grace, - of the posterity of Adam, and of those who We carried (in the Ark) with Noah, and of the posterity of Abraham and Israel of those whom We guided and chose. Whenever the Signs of (Allah) Most Gracious were rehearsed to them, they would fall down in prostrate adoration and in tears.

Surah An-Nahl verse 53

YUSUF ALI: And ye have no good thing but is from Allah. And moreover, when ye are touched by distress, unto Him ye cry with groans.

It is quite clear from these words of Allah (swt) that He praises this act and dislikes mocking the concept of weeping. Therefore, during mortification or humility before Allah (swt) and during the situations of calamity and catastrophe, wailing is the act of the praised ones and since 'wailing' is a composite act of mourning it serves as evidence for mourning.

53. Crying is an act of believers

[Yusufali 5:83] And when they listen to the revelation received by the Messenger, thou wilt see their eyes overflowing with tears, for they recognise the truth: they pray: "Our Lord! We believe; write us down among the witnesses.

This proves that crying is an act of the believers and according to the Holy Qur'an flowing of tears is a sign of believing in the truth.

This verse was revealed when some Christians from Habsha visited Madina. Shah Abdul Qadir Mohaddis Dehlavi gives its explanation in his "Tafseer e Moza al Qur'an".

"When the persecutions by the pagans of Makkah were no longer bearable, the Holy Prophet(s) ordered the Muslims to migrate to some other country. That same day nearly 80 Muslims (some alone and some along with their families) migrated towards Habsha. The ruler of Habsha in those days was a very just man; the pagans of Makkah approached the king and lied to him that this new group of people calls Jesus Christ a slave. On hearing this, the king asked the Muslims to recite something from their book, which the Muslims did. After hearing the recitation of the Holy Qur'an some of their saints started crying and said that this is exactly what they

have come to know by his Excellency Jesus Christ, and he had further said that after Him, another apostle would come and no doubt this person is that apostle. The king accepted Islam secretly, and this verse has been revealed for him."

The flowing of tears from eyes is called crying and crying is one of the aspects of mourning, therefore the relation of this verse with mourning is automatically proved.

Of relevance is Abu Bakr's very own admission that the Sahaba would weep when reciting the Quran. We are citing the comments of Ghazzali in "Ahya ul Uloom Adeen" Volume 2, Urdu Translation by Maulana Nadeem Al Waajdi Fazil Deobandi, Published in Karachi:

"When Abu Bakr saw an Arab man weeping while listening to the Holy Quran He said : "We used to weep in the same manner as you are weeping but now our hearts have become stonned"

The entire content of the Qur'an is true as is Husayn (as)'s martyrdom. According to Hadeeth Thaqlain both have an unbreakable link. Just as the eyes of believers are filled with tears when they hear the recitation of the Holy Qur'an, they also shed tears when hearing of Imam Husayn's (as) martyrdom. Husayn (as) was the Talking Qur'an and the moment one hears about the hardships faced by Imam (as) one laments over his death and shed tears.

54. Lamentation from the Qur'an

We read in Surah Bara'at verse 82:

Therefore they shall laugh little and weep much (as) a recompense for what they used to earn.

The Verse clearly sanctifies weeping and crying else it would have prohibited it. History stands as clear proof how Prophets, Messengers and Messiahs from Allah (swt) have wept and cried, singing the glory and greatness of Allah (swt) and expressing their own humbleness and fragility before Him (swt). Also each and every one of these men have wept and cried for Imam Husayn (as) long before the Tragedy of Karbala took place! We ordinary men should follow these great men of Allah (swt) and adopt their ideals and practices.

55. The weeping of the Sahaba in the Qur'an

Moreover, see this verse in the chapter of weeping:

[Shakir 9:92] Nor in those who when they came to you that you might carry them, you said: I cannot find that on which to carry you; they went back while their eyes overflowed with tears on account of grief for not finding that which they should spend.

This verse descended with regard to some sahaba who asked the Prophet(s) for horses in order to participate in jihad.

There were seven men of the Ansar who came to the Holy Prophet and told him that they did not have provisions for going with him on the expedition of Tabuk. On hearing from the Holy Prophet that there was nothing left with him after providing others, they went away weeping.

One of the reasons that we weep for the tragedy of karbala is that we were not present at that time otherwise we would have helped the besieged grand son of Holy Prophet(s) and participated in jihad. If Sahaba can weep for not been able to participate in jihad at their time, than why cant Shi'a weep for the same reason?

56. Wailing from the Qur'an

Wailing has been permitted and nothing against it is found in any Book; on the contrary, there is the word "La yateni" from Verse 40 of Chapter 78, Al Naba' The Great news in Part 30.

"Oh! Would that I were dust"

The word underlined from the Verse above shows that it is an indication for wailing, which is crying with a loud voice at loss of something dear to one's heart, and this is a Verse from The Holy Qur'an. The comments of Deobandi scholar Anwar Shah Kashmiree are worthy of note:

"There is nothing against Islam in expressing grief, sorrow or in crying and weeping at the loss of a loved one".
Fayz al Bari Sharh Sahih Bukhari, Volume 12, Page 462, Printed in Egypt

57. The earth and sky shed no tears for the Dhalimeen

In the Holy Qur'an Allah (swt) refers to the drowning of Pharaoh and his army as follows:

Yusufali 44:29] And neither heaven nor earth shed a tear over them: nor were they given a respite (again).

Comment

This Holy verse proves that crying over the unjust is not permissible but those who are just and have been treated unfairly can be cried and lamented over.

The verse refers the manner in which the rebellious Pharaoh was punished by Allah (swt) and he and his army was drowned. No one felt aggrieved and no one mourned their death. The verse stipulates that the earth and the sky did not weep at the death of Pharaoh, so clearly there exist scenarios wherein the earth and skies do indeed cry. We can conclude from this that when a rebel is punished no one is to cry over them, conversely, it is a desirable act to cry over someone's hardships particularly those inflicted on pious people.

Allah (swt)'s reference to the sky and the earth is to stress the grandeur of these two places. It means that due to Pharaoh's character no one mourned over his death. It is clear from this verse that mourning is specified for the pious and not for the evil .It acts as a warning that those that adhere to the path of Pharaoh shall perish like him and will have no one to mourn over them. Conversely if you give your life for the sake of religion and Allah (swt), you will attain respect and adherents that shall mourn your loss.

This verse proves that there are certain people in the world upon whom the heaven and earth weep, that is why Allah (swt) refers to the people of Pharaoh who were not from amongst those people who are cried upon by the heaven and the earth, but they are some other dear creatures of Allah.

Commentaries of this verses also confirm that the Heaven and the Earth cry upon the special individuals.

Allamah Jalaludin Suyuti states in his commentary of the verse that the Holy Prophet (s) said:

"They had done no deed that would merit the earth and Heaven crying for them, neither did anything pleasant come from their speech nor did any good deeds reach the heavens, that would merit the earth and heaven crying for them."
Tafseer Durre Manthur volume 6, page 30

Allamah Fakhruddin Raazi after quoting the same tradition states:

"The same comments have been made by other commentators (Mufassireen)."
Tafseer e Kabir, volume 7, page 471

Suyuti also records this, in Tafseer Durre Manthur Volume 6, page 30:

A few people asked ibn e Abbas (r.a) that if the heaven and the earth really cry for some people? His reply was: "Yes."

58. The weeping of the skies and Jinn for Imam Husayn (as)

Ibn al Hashimi in his article '**Why Sunnis Do Not Comemmorate Ashura'** thought it imperative to search out the opinions of his fellow Naasbi brethren, it is hence not surpising to see that

> Ibn al Hashimi cites Sunnipath.com
>
> Ibn Kathir said in al-Bidaya wal-Nihaya (8:201-202):
> Al-Tabarani mentioned in this chapter very strange reports indeed and the Shi`a went overboard concerning the day of Ashura, forging many hadiths that are gross lies such as the sun being eclipsed on that day until the stars appeared, no stone was lifted except blood was seen under it, the celestial region became red, the sun and its rays seemed like blood, the sky seemed like a blood clot, the stars were hurling against one another, the sky rained red blood, there was never redness in the sky before that day, and the like… among other lies and forgeries of which not one report is sound

Reply – Sunni traditions confirm this reality

We would not have expected anything less from Ibn Kathir for his Nasabi bigotry is what compelled him to assert this, that Ibn al Hashimi happily cited without a seconds thought. Had the Sunnipath Nasaibis looked beyond Ibn Kathir they would have realised that the grief of Imam Husayn (as) is the grief on which not only Humans, but even Jinn, angels, animals, birds, the sky and trees, all lament. We read in Yanabi ul Mawwaddah by Allamah Shaykh Sulaiman al-Hanafi al-Qanduzi, page 392:

"The sky wept for forty days on (the martyrdom of) Imam Husayn (as)".

We read in Tahdib al-Kamal by Jamaluddin al-Mizi, Volume 6 page 433:

وقال أبو الأسود النضر بن عبد الجبار عن بن لهيعة عن أبي قبيل لما قتل الحسين بن علي كسفت الشمس كسفة بدت الكواكب نصف النهار

Abu Qabeel said: 'When Husayn bin Ali was killed, the sun was eclipsed (so long) so that the stars appeared in the middle of day'

Shah Abdul Aziz Dehlavi has narrated the lamenting and wailing of Jinn on page number 96 of his book titled "Sirrul Shahdatain". He has also quoted the verses of the elegy, which was recited by the Jinn while weeping over Imam Husayn (as). Ummul Momineen Um Salma (ra) has also narrated as recorded by Imam Abi Bakar al-Haythami:

عن أم سلمة قالت سمعت الجن تنوح على الحسين بن علي رواه الطبراني ورجاله رجال الصحيح .

"I heard the jinns mourning for Husayn ibn Ali'.
Tabarani has recorded it and all its narrators are narrators of Sahih'
Majma al-Zawaid, Volume 9 page 199 Tradition 15179

We further read:

وعن ميمونة قالت :سمعت الجن تنوح على الحسين بن علي، رواه الطبراني ورجاله رجال الصحيح

'Maymunah (ra) said: 'I heard the jinns mourning for Husayn ibn Ali'.
Tabarani has recorded it and all its narrators are narrators of Sahih'
Majma al-Zawaid, Volume 9 page 199 Tradition 15180

Abu Naeem al-Asbahani records in Marifat al-Sahaba, Volume 5 page 333 Tradition 1686:

عن حبيب بن أبي ثابت ، قال : « سمعت الجن ، تنوح على الحسين

Habib bin Abi Thabit said: 'I heard the jinn mourning over al-Hussain'

Then Tradition 1687:

عن أبي جباب الكلبي ، قال : حدثني الجصاصون قالوا : « كنا إذا خرجنا بالليل إلى الجبانة عند مقتل الحسين ، سمعنا الجن ينوحون عليه

Abi Habab al-Kalbi said: 'Some grave diggers said: 'Whenever we went out side at night to the cemetery during (the days) of the al-Hussain murder, we heared the jinn mourning over him'

We also read in Tradition 1688:

عن مزيدة بن جابر الحضرمي ، عن أمه ، قالت : سمعت الجن ، تنوح على الحسين

Mazidah bin Jabir al-Hadhrami narrated from his mother that she said: 'I heard the jinn mourning over al-Hussain'
Marifat al-Sahaba, Volume 5 page 333

These are evidences of natural phenomena that occurred on the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as) that has been preserved in Sunni works, which proves that every creation in the universe mourned over the martyrs of Karbala. Where there will be intense weeping and wailing, and moaning and lamenting, there will be chest beating and face smiting as well as is seen in daily life.

How does Heaven/Sky cry?

Let us now ascertain how heaven cries, and how we know when it does. Allamah Jalaludin Suyuti records:

وأخرج ابن جرير وابن المنذر عن عطاء - رضي الله عنه - قال : بكاء السماء حمرة أطرافها

"Atta [ra] said: 'The sky cries in a manner that all of its corners get red'.
Tafseer Dur al-Manthur, Vol 7 page 413 Surah Dakhaan Verse 29

He quotes Imam Hasan Basri to have said:

وأخرج ابن أبي الدنيا عن الحسن - رضي الله عنه - قال : بكاء السماء حمرتها

Al-Hassan [ra] said: "When the sky gets red it weeps."

Imam Mohammad ibn Jareer Tabari states in Tafseer Tabari, volume 22 page 33:

وقيل: إن بكاء السماء حمرة أطرافها.

"It has been said that the crying of the sky is such that all of its corners get red."

Allamah Nizamuddin Nishapuri states in Tafseer Nisahpuri, volume 25, page 73:

"Many Mufassireen are of the view that the sky can cry, so they believe that the solar and the lunar eclipses, the corners of the sky getting red and the blowing of wild and pinching wind are forms of the sky weeping."

The weeping of the heaven and earth over Imam Husayn (as)

Now let us analyze that who those people are who are cried at by the heaven and the earth.

Allamah Jalaludin Syuti writes that Ibrahim [ra] said:

Since the creation of the world, the heaven and the earth have cried for none else other then two men. The people asked him: "Do not the heaven and the earth cry for the Momineen?" He replied: "When they are virtous his privilege is linked to his status and deeds." He then asked them if they knew how the heaven and the earth cries. The people replied in the negative, therefore he said: "It becomes fiery and red, just as the red boiling oil. The day when Yahya bin Zakarya was martyred the sky had got red and blood was dripping from it and the sky had also got red the day Husayn was martyred."

Tafseer Dur al-Manthur, Vol 7 page 413 Surah Dakhaan Verse 29

He further states that Zaid bin Ziyad has reported:

وأخرج ابن أبي حاتم عن زيد بن زياد - رضي الله عنه - قال : لما قتل الحسين احمرت آفاق السماء أربعة أشهر

Zaid bin Zyad [ra] said: 'When Husayn was martyred, the corners of the sky remained red for a four month period'.

Imam Ibn Jareer Tabari in his Tafsir Tabari , Volume 22 page 33 and Wahabi scholar Nawab Molvi Siddiq Hasan Khan Bhophali in Tafseer Fatah ul-Bayan, volume 8, page 326 stated:

حدثني محمد بن إسماعيل الأحمسيّ، قال: ثنا عبد الرحمن بن أبي حماد، عن الحكم بن ظهير، عن السديّ قال: لما قتل الحسين بن عليّ رضوان الله عليهما بكت السماء عليه، وبكاؤها حمرتها.

Al-Seddi said: 'When Hussain bin Ali (r) was killed, the sky started weeping for him, the weeping of the sky was by turning red'.

Imam Tabarani records in Mu'ajam Kabir, Volume 3 page 113:

حدثنا زكريا بن يحيى الساجي ثنا محمد بن المثنى ثنا الضحاك بن مخلد عن ابن جريج : عن ابن شهاب قال : ما رفع بالشام حجر يوم قتل الحسين بن علي إلا عن دم رضي الله عنه

Ibn Shehab said: 'After the martyrdom of Hussain fresh blood started to gush from

wherever stones were picked up.'

Imam Abi Bakar al-Haythami records in Majma al-Zawaed, Volume 9 page 316:

عن الزهري قال : ما رفع بالشام حجر يوم قتل الحسين بن علي إلا عن دم
رواه الطبراني ورجاله رجال الصحيح

"Al-Zuhari said: 'After the martyrdom of Hussain fresh blood started to gush from wherever stones were picked up.'
Tabarani has recorded it and all its narrators are narrators of Sahih".
Majma al-Zawaed, Volume 9 page 316 Tradition 15160

We further read:

وعن أم حكيم قالت : قتل الحسين وأنا يومئذ جويرية فمكثت السماء أياما مثل العلقة
رواه الطبراني ورجاله إلى أم حكيم رجال الصحيح

"Um Hakim said: 'I was a young girl on the day al-Hussain was killed and the sky turned into red for days'.
Al-Tabarani recorded it, and the narrators until Um Hakim are the narrators of the Sahih".
Majma al-Zawaed, Volume 9 page 316 Tradition 15161

Allamah Ibn Hajr Makki al-Haythami writes in his famed anti-Shia book:

"After Imam Husayn's (a.s) martyrdom the sky kept crying continuously for seven days, the walls seem to be wearing coloured sheets and it is a proven fact that darkness prevailed over the world for three days and then a reddish light was apparent on the sky."

He further quotes Abu Sa'eed:

"The day Imam Husayn (a.s) was martyred, no stone was picked in the world that did not have blood under it, blood kept oozing from the sky and the affects remained on the clothing for a long time, until the clothes became worn out.

...Sa'lbi has said that the sky kept crying for Imam Husayn's (a.s) martyrdom and the sky's crying was its turning red. Besides Sa'lbi a few others have said that the corners of the sky remain red for six months after Imam Husayn's (a.s) martyrdom and then it started to emerge every now and then."

...Ibn Seerin has said that they have come to know that this reddish light that emerges with the evening twilight did not exist before Imam Husayn's (a.s) martyrdom."

...Ibn Sa'ad has written in his Tabaqaat that that redness was not seen on the skies before Imam Husayn's (a.s) martyrdom."
Sawaiqh al Muhriqa, page 623-624 published in Faisalabad

In Arjyah ul-Matalib, page 347-348 Deobandi scholar Maulana Ubaidullah Amritsari states:

"The occurrence of these natural calamities was for the admonition for the masses after the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (r). Basra Adhwiya says that when Imam Husayn (r) was martyred it started to drizzle and by the morning all of their pots and water-drums were filled with blood. Zuhri (r.a) says that on the day of Imam Husayn's martyrdom no stone was picked in Jerusalem that did not have fresh blood under it. Sufyan Thuri (r.a) narrates that his grand-mother was a young slave-girl at the time of Imam Husayn's martyrdom; she had said that the sky kept weeping for

him for many days. Ammar e Yasir (r) has narrated that the Holy Prophet (s) had said that the heaven had once cried for Yahya bin Zakariya and it will also cry upon the Holy Prophet's (s) son (Husayn)".

59. We share the same faith with the skies and the earth

Just as we believe in the oneness of Allah (swt), the Prophethood of Holy Prophet(s) and the Wilayah (Mastership) of Imam Ali (as), we have faith in all that Allah (swt) has created in the skies and on the earth. We believe that the earth and skies also weep over the hardships that were experienced by the Ahl'ul bayt (as).

Ibn Hajr al Makki in Sawaiqh al Muhriqa records a tradition wherein:

"Ali, while passing through Karbala, stopped at the place where Husayn was going to be buried and said: "Here Husayn and his comrades will be slain and the heavens and the earth shall weep over them".

60. The constant weeping of Angles for Imam Husayn (as)

Imam of Ahl'ul Sunnah, Shaikh 'Abdul Qadir Jilani, in his famous book, "Ghanyatul Talibeen", page 430; comments:

"70,000 angels came to the grave of Husayn bin Ali after his martyrdom and they wept for him and will keep weeping unto the Day of Judgment."
Ghanyatul Talibeen, page 430 published in Dehli

It is at this point apt to cite

> Ibn al Hashimi who says:
>
> Additionally, comemmorating Ashura with any special ritual would be adding to the faith of Islam, and this is Bidah. Bidah is considered part of Hell-Fire, and whoever invents a Bidah is promised Hell-Fire as well.

This Nasibi is inferring that the Shi'a commit Bidah by mourning the tragedy of Husayn (as) every year, what Fatwa will Ibn al Hashimi issue against these 70,000 angels that mourn Husayn (as) every day?

61. It is not permissible to cry at the suffering of the Kuffar

Another incident that Nasibis seek to twist as proof that crying for Imam Husayn (as) concerns the lack of remorse offered by Prophet Shuayb (as) for his people. We read in Surah e Araf verses 91-93:

[Yusufali] But the earthquake took them unawares, and they lay prostrate in their homes before the morning!

The men who reject Shu'aib became as if they had never been in the homes where they had flourished:

the men who rejected Shu'aib - it was they who were ruined!

So Shu'aib left them, saying: "O my people! I did indeed convey to you the messages for which I was sent by my Lord: I gave you good counsel, but how shall I lament over a people who refuse to believe!"

According to the words of Prophet Shu'aib (as) lamenting over the calamities befallen on righteous people is permissible but not for those calamities that confront unbelievers. This is clear from the verse; he (as) refused to lament for those that did not believe.

62. The tears of Adam (as)

" Adam (as) was so grieved that he did not smile for a year, then the angels prayed for the grief to perish and he laughed."
Tafseer Ibn Katheer, volume 1, page 86

Logic dictates that had Adam (as) not been crying, the angels would never have prayed for his grief to subside and the prayer by angels itself is a consolation during the time of hardship. Had weeping or crying been a sin then the infallible angels would never have prayed for Adam (as). Their prayer meant that Adam's (as) act was right.Had it been wrong Allah (swt) would have condemned Adam (as) and told him to abandon such practice but nothing of the sort happened. The reference demonstrates that the act of mourning and crying is related to nature, you cannot force yourself to act against what is an innate characteristic. The Angles made supplication for Adam (as) to be consoled after a passage of a year; they did not supplicate that Adam (as) abandon a practice that was Haraam!

63. The tears of Nuh (as)

We read in Al sawi al Jalalayn, volume 2 page 132, published in Egypt:

"Nuh's (as) original name was Abdul Ghafar, he was called Noah on account if his crying (Noha)".

Similarly we read in Fatah al-Qadeer by Shawkani, Volume 2 page 316:

عن يزيد الرقاشي قال : إنما سمي نوح عليه السلام نوحا لطول ما ناح على نفسه

Yazid al-Raqashi said: "Noah was called by this name on account of his crying for long time".

Comment

Sunni books of Tafseer state that Nuh (as) wept for a thousand years to attain the pleasure of Allah (swt) which is why he was called Nuh (as) that means crying with a loud voice.This means that while in a state of sorrow, one loses control over his emotions and in such circumstances he may even beat himself. Verily, the mourning of Nuh (as) is further proof of the legitimacy of mourning.

64. Prophet Ibrahim [as] supplicated for a daughter who would weep over his death

We read in famed Shia work Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 12 page 117:

Abu Abdullah (as) said: "Ibrahim asked Allah to grant him a daughter who would cry over him when he dies".

65. Rasulullah (s) wept at the death of his son Ibraheem (as)

We read in Sahih Bukhari, Volume 2, Book 23, Number 390:

Narrated Anas bin Malik:
We went with Allah's Apostle (pbuh) to the blacksmith Abu Saif, and he was the husband of the wet-nurse of Ibrahim (the son of the Prophet). Allah's Apostle took Ibrahim and kissed him and smelled him and later we entered Abu Saif's house and at that time Ibrahim was in his last breaths, and the eyes of Allah's Apostle (pbuh) started shedding tears. 'Abdur Rahman bin 'Auf said, "O Allah's Apostle, even you are weeping!" He said, "O Ibn 'Auf, this is mercy." Then he wept more and said, "The eyes are shedding tears and the heart is grieved, and we will not say except what pleases our Lord, O Ibrahim! Indeed we are grieved by your separation."

A more detailed tradition is recorded in Mishkat al Masabih:

Uns bin Malik reports that we entered the house along with the Prophet(s) and Ibrahim was taking his last breaths. Tears started to flow from Holy Prophet's (s) eyes. Abdur Rehman bin Auf said "O` Prophet of Allah! Your such condition." Holy Prophet(s) replied "O` Son of Auf! This is a blessing and after which one cries too" he further added "then the eyes cry and the heart becomes grieved but we do not say anything against Allah's will (it means that we do not complain to Allah) O` Ibrahim no doubt that we are grieved and sad over your departure."
Mishkaat, Volume 1, page 298 Published Karachi

Comment

The ingredients of Azadari for Imam Husayn (as) are lamentation and crying, and this is in accordance with the Sunnah of the Prophet (s) who mourned the loss of his son in such a manner.

If Nasibis seek to ask us whether Rasulullah (s) mourned his loss annually perhaps they could show us any evidence wherein the Holy Prophet (s) performed 'Tarawih' prayers in congregation? If they cannot then why do the Ahl'ul Sunnah follow this practise every year? According to our faith even if Holy Prophet (s) performed an act just once in his life that is his Sunnah, unless it is prohibited at a later date.

There is a world of difference in Ibrahim's death and the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as). When Ibrahim parted he was at his home with his parents whereas Imam Husayn (as) was in a foreign land, thirsty for three days and mercilessly martyred whilst in an act of prostration.

The mourners of Ahlul bayt (as) mourn respectively over everything related to the Holy Progeny. Mourning for Ibrahim is not prohibited according to our faith; we can produce flags, cradles as symbols of grief. If we can conduct mourning gatherings for the ordinary dead we can do likewise for the Holy Prophet's (s) beloved grandson who he referred to as his son. In reality our gatherings are protest processions against all forms of tyranny and oppression.

Social customs point to the fact that memorials are conducted for those who have contributed towards humanity through their sacrifices and have changed the course of history. Imam Husayn (as) sacrificed all that he had for protecting the Deen that had been conveyed by 124,000 Prophets. Had Ibrahim (as) reached this point of his life and achieved something like this we would have likewise mourned him in the same manner.

66. Crying is the Sunnah of the Prophets (peace be upon all of them)

The real requirement is that on suitable circumstances, mourning should be performed as practiced by the Prophets, as we read in Tafseer Kabeer, volume 1 page 285

"All the Prophets, Adam (as), Nuh (as) and Daud (as) mourned and cried over their hardships, and their acts weren't invalid"

Similarly, we read in Sunan Ibn Majah, volume 2 page 285:

(عن سعد بن أبي وقاص قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم : (ببكوا فإن لم تبكوا فتباكوا

Sa'ad bin Abi Waqas has reported from Holy Prophet (s) that he said: "Cry and if u can't cry then make a crying face."

Therefore criticizing our mourning and lamenting means criticism of the Sunnah of the apostles.

67. Crying particularly for the tragedies befallen the Ahlulbayt [as] is Sunnah of Holy Prophet [s]

We read in Sunan Ib Maja, Volume 1 page 517:

Narrated by Alqamah from Abdullah bin Masood:
One day we were sitting with Holy Prophet (s) while some children from the house of Bani Hashim came there. When the Holy Prophet (s) saw them, tears welled up in his eyes and he became pale.

Ibn Masood said that he told the Holy Prophet (s) "Your face reflects anxiety". The Holy Prophet (s) stated: "Exalted God has granted us, the Ahlulbait, Hereafter instead of worldly pleasure.

After me, soon my Ahlubait will face calamity, hardship and misery till people having black flags will rise from East and seek justice, which will be denied them. They will wage war, they will be supported and will be given what they were demanding. They will not accept until it is handed over to one from our Ahlulbait (i.e. Mahdi) .He will fill the earth with justice as it was filled with unjustice. Whoever amongst you is alive at that period,should try to reach them even if he has to tread on ice in that pursuit."

68. Safiya (r), Sayyida Fatima (as) and Rasulullah (s) cried over the slain body of Hamza (as)

In Madarij al-Nubuwath, volume 2, page 152 Shaykh Muhammad Abdul Haq Mohaddith Dehalvi writes:

" Safiya came and stood by the head of Hamza's (r.a) body and she along with Fatima (s.a) kept crying for him and due their mourning, Holy Prophet (s) also started crying."

69. Holy Prophet (s) wept over the martyrdom of Jaffar ibn Abi Talib (as)

The beloved scholar of wahabis Ibn Katheer writes in his authority work al Bidayah wa al Nihaya, Volume 4, page 673, published by Nafees Academy Karachi:

Ibn Ishaq narrates that on the day when Jafar ibn Abi Talib was martyred in Ghazwa Moutah; Holy Prophet (s) called upon Abdullah bin Jafar and made him sit on his lap and started kissing his forehead and eyes, while tears were flowing from his own Holy eyes.

The Sahaba inquired: "O Prophet of Allah! Is it so that some grieving news has come about Jafar that has made your tears flow?"

The Holy Prophet (s) replied: "Yes, Today Jafar has been martyred there, but the troubles and the plight that he went through before being martyred is very grieving."
al Bidayah wa al Nihaya, Volume 4, page 673

Nawasib such as the people of Sipah-e-Sahaba [kr-hcy.com] often advance a notion namely the martyrdom of the people who have laid their lives in the way of Allah[swt] should be celebrated and not mourned due to the fact that they are victorious and mourning their deaths is a sign of showing doubts in their victorious end. The people who uphold such pathetic beliefs and mock Shias should see the above cited episode carefully and tell us wasn't Prophet(s) sure about the best place that Jaffar (as) had attained after his martyrdom ? Holy Prophet(s) not only wept for the martyrdom of Jaffar Ibn Abi Talib (as) but also gave best relpy for any such pathetic comment i.e Prophet(s) was distressed over the tragedies befallen on Jaffar (as) before his martyrdom. The Shias likewise mourn for the cut-throat calamities that sturck Imam Hussain (as) and his companions before attaining the status of martyrs.

70. Sahaba along with Holy Prophet[s] wept over the martyrdom of Hamza (ra)

Shiekh Abdul Haq Dehalvi writes that companions including Abu Bakar wept over the miserable death of Hamza [ra] along with Holy Prophet[s]:

"It is narrated that when the tragedy stricken people were standing in the way to welcome the Holy Prophet [s] back, Fatima, the daughter of Hamza[ra] was standing by the roadside and watching the army of Prophet [s] coming in numbers, Fatima was trying to find her father amongst them but she didn't see him. Then she went to Abu Bakr and inquired: "Where is my father, I don't see him in the army." Abu Bakr's eyes filled with tears and with a heavy heart he replied: "The Prophet of Allah must be coming soon." When Holy Prophet [s] arrived, and she didn't see her father even with the Prophet [s], she held the rope of Prophet's carriage [horse/camel] and said: "O Prophet of Allah! Where is my father?" Prophet [s] replied: "I am your father." She said: "O Prophet of Allah! I smell blood from this speech." And tears started to flow from her eyes, with this tears leaked out of the eyes of the other companions too. She then said: "O Prophet of Allah! Narrate the condition of my father's martyrdom." Holy Prophet [s] replied: "My daughter! If I narrate the state of his martyrdom, you will not be able to control yourself." Hearing this Fatima (Hamza's [ra] daughter) screamed out."
Madarij un Nabuwat, Volume 2, page 230 published in Karachi

If weeping over the dead is Haram than what do Nawasib think about companions and Holy Prophet [s] who were so aggrived and wept over Hamza's martyrdom ?

71. Ayesha wept at the death of Uthman ibn al Affan

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed work Aqd al Fareed , Volume 2 Page 2:

After the Murder of uthman, Ayesha stepped out of her house and wept for Uthman, saying that he had been killed unjustly.Ammar Yasir said to her: "You were the one who used to incite people against him and now you are weeping"

72. Ayesha's lamentations on Abu Bakr's death

We read in Tareekh Kamil, Volume 2 page 288 and in Aqd al Fareed, Volume 3 page 65:

الزُّهري عن سعيد بن المُسيّب قال: لما تُوفى أبو بكر أقامت عليه عائشة النَوح فبلغ ذلك عمرَ فنهاهنَ، فأبين.

"Zuhari narrated that Saeed bin al-Musayab said: 'When Abu Bakr died, Ayesha conducted a mourning (assembly) over him, thus Umar was informed therefore he prohibited them but they refused'."

If lamentation and elegies were Haraam, then the Holy Prophet's wife would not have acted thus moreover the 'esteemed' Sahaba would have also not participated. Will the Nawasib be brave enough to issue a Bidah Fatwa against her? Another angle of this episode shows us that it was only Umar who had problem with the act of mourning and like his stance on Nikah al-Mutah, this too seemed to be his personal opinion which made his followers and lovers of later genration to fabricate some traditions in order to provide immunity to the personal stance of Umar, be it the issue of Nikah al-Mutah or mourning. The next episode we are going to cite will make this point more clear.

73. The mourning of Muslims at the death of Khalid bin Walid

We read in Kanz al-Umal, Volume 15 page 731:

عن عبد الله بن عكرمة قال : عجبا لقول الناس إن عمر بن الخطاب نهى عن النوح ! لقد بكى على خالد بن الوليد بمكة والمدينة نساء بني المغيرة سبعا يشققن الجيوب ويضربن الوجوه وأطعموا الطعام تلك الايام حتى مضت ما ينهاهن عمر

Abdullah bin Akrema said: "I am wondering for the people tale that Umar bin al-Khatab prohibited mourning! In Makka and Madina, the women of Bani Mughira (tribe) cried over Khalid bin al-Walid for seven days, they tore the front opening of the shirts and beat the cheeks and feed the people and Umar didn't prohibit them".

74. The tears of Rasulullah (s), and Abu Bakr and Umar making sorrowful faces

We read in Zaad al Maad page 65 by the Salafi Cult great hero Ibn Qayyim:

وقد قال عمر بن الخطاب للنبي صلى الله عليه و سلم وقد رآه يبكي هو وأبو بكر في شأن أسارى بدر : أخبرني ما يبكيك يا رسول الله ؟ فإن وجدت بكاء بكيت وإن لم أجد تباكيت لبكائكما

"When Umar bin al-Khatab saw the Holy Prophet (s) and Abu Bakr weeping for the prisoners of the Battle of Badr, Umar asked: O Allah's messenger, tell me what makes you cry? If I can I will also cry with you and if I cannot then I shall at least pretend to cry while you are crying".

This proves that it is even permissible to feel aggrieved at the sorry plight of the prisoners of war as established by the first and second Khalifa. Did Abu Bakr and Rasulullah (s) lack knowledge with regards to the verses on Sabr? Moreover, after going through the last two episodes, this episode too proves that Umar was always lacking the sentiments which makes a decent human to weep over the agony of other human beings.

75. The order of Abu Bakr to make a sorrowful face

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed work Tareekh Baghdad, Volume 5 page 325:

قال أبو بكر الصديق من استطاع منكم أن يبكي فليبك ومن لم يستطع فليتباك

"Abu Bakar said 'Whoever can, should cry and whoever cannot cry should make a face as if they are crying"

Umar had issued a desire that he mimics a crying expression, and Abu Bakr issued an edict to make a crying expression. So if we cry for Husayn (as), or make sorrowful gestures then why the hue and cry? Why did Umar issue a desire to make a sad expression? Why did Abu Bakr issue such an order?

76. The cries of Abu Bakr and Umar

We read in Kashaf al Ghimma page 175 by Shaykh Abdulwahab:

"Abu Bakr and Umar would cry in such a way that the neighbours could hear them"

The cries of the Shaykhayn would disturb the neighbours in same way that you complain of the Shi'a disturbing you. Were they ignorant of the verses on Sabr? If they were aware of these verses then will Sipah-e-Sahaba kindly issue the same Fatawa against them?

If Abu Bakr and Umar can disturb them whilst they were Khalifas of the Prophet (s), then there would be no objection of the Shi'a recollect the sufferings of Imam Husayn (as) Such acts cannot be against the Shariah.

77. The cries of Abu Bakr and Umar would reach the ears of Ayesha

We read in Kashaf al Ghimma, page 174:

When Sa'd bin Mu'adh died, the Prophet, Abu Bakr and Umar cried. Ayesha narrates 'I recognised the cries of Abu Bakr and Umar although I was in my house".

The Shaykhayn cried at the death of Sa'd bin Mu'adh that their voices reached the ears of Ayesha in her home. Were they ignorant of the verses of Sabr that are in this day and age used against the Shi'a?

If Abu Bakr's and Umar's wailing at the death of Sa'd bin Muadh does not contravene the Qur'an then mourning of shias on the suffering of Imam Husayn (as) via wailing are also not against the Qur'an.

78. Umar was the killer and mourner

We read in Tareekh Khamees Volume 2 page 253:

Umar inflicted the Hadd penalty against his son Shimr. When the final stripe struck him, he fell to the ground. Umar placed his head in his lap and began to cry, upon seeing Umar's state all those present also began to cry".

Nasibis need to recognise that crying is a natural instinct as is exemplified by the tears shed by Umar for his son. One should also take into account the fact that he inflicted the pain and cried afterwards. The Nasibis such as Ansar.org love claiming that the Shi'a killed Imam Husayn (as)

and they also cry for him. This is not true, but if the Nasibis really want to know who founded such a concept then they should know that it was the Sunnah of Umar ibn al Khattab.

79. Abu Bakr's crying in the cave

We read in Madarij unl Nubuwwah, Volume 2 page 580

"Abu Bakr began to cry in the cave and turned his face towards the Prophet (s)..."

Nasibis should realise that shedding tears in times of trouble is natural as is demonstrated by Abu Bakr. The Nasibi proudly inform us that Abu Bakr cried in the cave, yet when the Shi'a cry on recollecting the suffering of Imam Husayn (as) all manner of Fatawa is heaped upon them.

If Nasibis are going to argue that the tears of Abu Bakr are justified because he was sincere while the Shi'a are not we will say that this is just your view. After all we can also state that Abu Bakr was not sincere, and merely shed crocodile tears as did the brothers of Yusuf (as) when they went to their father.

80. Umar's tears at his brother's death

We read in Iqd al Fareed Volume 2 page 4

"Umar's brother Zaid died in Umayma, a man from Banu Adi was with him, who returned to Madina. When Umar saw him he began to cry and said to the man 'You've left my brother to be alone in his grave' and now you come to see me"

When you have true love for Imam Husayn (as) in your hearts then it becomes impossible to maintain silence and observe patience over his tragedy. Just look at the example of Umar known for his harshness. He mourned the death of his brother who died while travelling and Umar was unable to control himself and yet the Nasibis raise no objections here! Why is no Fatawa applied here? Curiously when we remember the persecution of the family of the Prophet (s), our wails and tears are deemed un-Islamic acts of Bidah and we are told that patience is better than mourning!

81. Immense tears at the time of Abu Bakr's death

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's authority work Tareekh Khamees Volume 2 page 330:

"On the day that Abu Bakr died the situation seemed as if Madina would be flooded with tears"

Abu Bakr's death was not on account of his becoming the victim of a heinous act. On the contrary Tareekh Khamees page 236 informs us, **"Abu Bakr was an elderly man, who took a bath in the cold weather that resulted in his developing a temperature and dying"**. People shed tears like sea at this death. When the Shi'a shed tears at the callous slaying of Imam Husayn (as) why should objections be raised?

82. Tears at witnessing Uthman's bloodied shirt

The late Deobandi scholar Qadhi Mazhar in his book 'Hum Matam kuoon nahee kartay' (Why we do not do matam) said: **'No tears should be shed when someone attains Paradise after his martyrdom'.**

The best response that we can give from such rubbish comes from Ahl'ul Sunnah's authority

work Tareekh Kamil Volume 3 page 139 by Ibn Atheer. It says:

"Numan bin Basheer went to the people of Syria holding Uthman's bloodied shirt in which he was killed and the severed fingers of his wife along with some part of palm. Mu'awiya placed the shirt on the pulpit and the soldiers were surrounding it and were weeping over the shirt for a while, the shirt was on the pulpit and the fingers were hanging from it."

Perhaps Qadhi Mazhar could offer his explanation as to whether Mu'awiya believed that Uthman had attained Paradise. If he did then why did he oppose your Fatawa? And what is your Fatwa against Mu'awiya for this opposition?

Uthman ibn al Affan was the leading light of his Banu Ummayya Clan. When the Sahaba lost their patience over his corruption and nepotism and Ayesha issued a Fatwa that he be killed (see our article on Ayesha) and when Uthman was killed the Sahaba abandoned assisting him. When he died the Banu Ummayya led by Ahl'ul Sunnah's fifth Khalifa Mu'awiya bin Hind proceeded in his Azadari (mourning rituals), his bloodied shirt was paraded through Syria. If mourning for the dead is an evil Bidah then could the Nasibi Camp kindly explain why Ahl'ul Sunnah's Leading Hadi Imam Mu'awiya introduced this mourning spectacle during his reign?
Ayesha

83. Tears at the death of Abu Bakr's grandson

We read in Habeeb as Sayyar Volume 2 page 23:

"When the news of Abdullah Ibn Zubayr's death reached his mother Asma binte Abu Bakr, she began to mourn. Despite her age of ninety she began to menstruate and said, 'Allah's child, mercy be upon you, every part of my body is mourning you, including my Furuj that is reciting mercy for you'.

Nasibis love to use propaganda against us on mourning rituals. We as them to look at the mourning of Asma binte Abu Bakr.

84. Yaum al Nayyab

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed work Tadhkirat ul Khawaas al Ummah, page 39:

"When Ayesha left Makka for Basra, other wives of the Prophet(s) accompanied her till Iraq. Not as much crying had occured in Islam before as had occurred on this day. This day was called Yaum al Nayyab [The day of crying]"

Your Sect deems Ayesha's leaving her home to enter the battlefield to be 'The Day of crying'.

85. Marwan's tears and Imam Hassan (as)'s funeral

We read in Sawaiqh al Muhriqa, page 83

"When Imam Hassan attained martyrdom, Marwan cried at the funeral"

We have cited this to show the actions of someone whom the Ahlul Sunnah deem a pious Sahaba of the Prophet (s).

86. Hasan al Basri's weeping at the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as)

We read in Yanabi al Mawaddah, page 329:

"When Hassan al Basri heard the news of Imam Husayn's martyrdom, he cried bitterly".

87. A Sahabi's beard filled with tears

We read in Sahih Bukhari Volume 7, Book 63, Number 206:

Narrated by Ibn 'Abbas:
Barira's husband was a slave called Mughith as if I am seeing him now, going behind Barira and weeping with his tears flowing down his beard. The Prophet said to 'Abbas, "O 'Abbas! Are you not astonished at the love of Mughith for Barira and the hatred of Barira for Mughith?" The Prophet then said to Barira, "Why don't you return to him?" She said, "O Allah's Apostle! Do you order me to do so?" He said, "No, I only intercede for him." She said, "I am not in need of him."

Look at how a Sahabi mourns the separation from his wife. If crying were Bidah then this Sahabi would never have contemplated such an act. Nasibis have no problem with accepting this form of mourning by the Sahaba. Rather these are signs of the Sahaba's great rank but when we mourn Imam Husayn (as) whose rank was far beyond any Sahabi all form of Fatawa is fired at us.

If it is acceptable for a Sahaba to mourn the separation of his wife, a separation that was his own, then the Shi'a can likewise mourn the separation of Imam Husayn (as) from his ancestral home Madina, his separation from the graves of his beloved grandfather, mother and brother. Unlike the Sahaba in this tradition Imam Husayn (as) did not voluntarily abandon Hajj, he was forced to do so to avoid bloodshed within the Holy precincts of the Kaaba. Is such a separation not a cause for tears? If Nasabi have no objections to a Sahaba crying at the speration from his wife, then they have no right to attack the Shi'a to cry when we remember the tragic manner in which Imam Husayn (as) had to separate from the graves of his beloved relations.

88. Ayesha's excessive tears

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed work Adaab al Mufraad page 201:

Ayesha separated from her nephew. When peace was made she freed some slaves as Kaffara. When Ayesha recollected this time of separation she would cry in such a manner that her scarf would be wet with tears.

If shedding tears is a prohibited act and a bidah then Nasibis should make a close inspection of the actions of Ayesha. We are sure that they will raise no objection to Ayesha as these Mullah's are only opposed to the memory of Imam Husayn (as).

89. Ayesha's tears following defeat at Jamal

1. Tadhkirat ul Khawwas page 46
2. Tareekh Baghdad Volume 9 page 185

Whenever Ayesha would recollect her participation at Jamal she would cry so much

that she... would be covered in tears.

If crying for the dead incurs the curse of Allah (swt), then that would curse the great personalities who died in Ayesha's ranks in Jamal - She would never have cried if she believed that it would serve as a curse for them!

If Ayesha, instead of keeping patience cries in such an extreme manner, then the Shi'a are also permitted to cry profusely for Imam Husayn (as).

90. Mourning for Abu Haneefa

We read in Tareekh Khamees page 328:

"Imam Ahmad ibn Hanbal would cry whenever he would recall the death of Abu Haneefa and would refer to him as Rehmatullah".

Imam Numan and Hanbal are both Sunni Imams. One dies and the other cries, if crying causes pain to the dead then what will happen to poor Imam Abu Haneefa? Was Ibn Hanbal ignorant of the verse on Sabr in the Qur'an?

91. The loss of eyesight, mourning for Yusuf (as)

We read in Tafseer Ruh al Ma'ani Volume 13 page 40:

"The whitening of the eyes refers to going blind, verily Yusuf lost his eyesight"

92. Prophet Yaqoob's (as) grief for his son caused his back to be bent

We read in Tafseer Khazan, Volume 4 page 47:

al-Hakim Abu Abdullah recorded in his Sahih a tradition from Anas bin Malik from Allah's messenger that he said: 'Yaqub had a brother, once he (the brother) said to him: 'O Yaqub, what made your eyes vision gone and what made your back hunched?' He replied: 'The thing which made me lose my vision was weeping over Yusuf while the thing which made me hunchback is my grief over Benjamin''

We read in Surah Yusuf 012.084:

"And he turned away from them, and said: "How great is my grief for Joseph!" And his eyes became white with sorrow, and he fell into silent melancholy."

Fakhruddin al-Razi states in Tafseer Kabeer, Volume 9 page 98:

واعلم أن أشرف أعضاء الإنسان هذه الثلاثة ، فبين تعالى أنها كانت غريقة في الغم فاللسان كان مشغولا بقوله : { يا أسفى } والعين بالبكاء والبياض والقلب بالغم الشديد

"You have to know that these are the most honorable parts in a human body, therefore Allah showed that these parts were all indulged in sadness, the tongue was busy saying *'{ O my sorrow }'* and his eyes were crying and turned white and his heart was full of grief".

This extreme form of mourning occurred even though Yaqoob (as) knew that his son was alive and well. Now compare this to the plight that befell the Ahl'ul bayt (as) most poignantly put by Imam Zaynul Abideen (as) and recorded by Shaykh Ali Hajweri (Data Ganj Baksh) in Kashf al Mahjoob, page 190:

"The fourth Imam cried so much that the light of dawn would spread. One day the narrator begged the Imam saying: O my Lord, Master of my parents, how long will you lament and cry? The Imam replied: Yaqoob's (as) one son Yusuf (as) was lost and he cried so much that he lost his eyesight and I have lost eighteen brothers and my father!"

This proves that Imam Husayn (as)'s miseries and pains are uncountable and his martyrdom cannot be forgotten.

93. The Sahabi Ibn Abbas became blind on account of his mourning for Imam Husayn (as)

We read in Tadhkirat ul Khawwas, page 90:

ولمّا قتل الحسين لم يزل ابن عباس يبكي عليه حتى ذهب بصره

"When Imam Husayn was killed, Ibn Abbas kept weeping until he became blind"

Similarly we read in Muruj al-Dahab, by Masoodi, Volume 1 page 392:

وكان قد ذهب بصره لبكائه على علي والحسن والحسين

"He (ibn Abbas) lost his eyesight due to weeping over Ali, Hassan and Hussain".

Ibn Abbas was famed for his knowledge of the Qur'an, authored a Tafseer, and Rasulullah (s) prayed for his knowledge. Is it therefore believable that he lacked knowledge of the verses on patience, and failed to grasp meaning of the term 'Sabr' and despite these verses mourned Imam Husayn (as)'s loss in such an extreme manner that he became blind? Do today's Nasibis not insist on Muslims following the way of the Salaf abd to adhere to the Seerah of the Sahaba? If so then Sipah-e-Sahaba has no right to raise objections to mourning rituals for Imam Husayn (as).

It would at this point be apt to cite the comments of

> Ibn al Hashimi who claims:
>
> Additionally–and this point cannot be stressed enough–there were many Sahabah who were killed in the Path of Allah, but the Prophet (صلّى الله عليه وآله وسلّم) never mourned their deaths in the manner in which the Shia mourn Hussain (رضّى الله عنه). The Prophet lost his own dear uncle, his own wife, and many of his dearest companions, but do we see that the Prophet (صلّى الله عليه وآله وسلّم) ever resorted to self-flagellation or excessive mourning? The Shia can never provide such an example from the life of the Prophet (صلّى الله عليه وآله وسلّم), probably not even from Shia sources. Therefore, we find that it is not part of the Sunnah to mourn in such an uncivilized manner and we shall never take part in it because of this.

Would the act of excessive crying causing blindness not fall within his definition of excessive mourning? If so, what prevents Ibn al Hashimi from deeming Ibn Abbas an innovator? Do today's Nasibis not insist on Muslims following the way of the Salaf abd to adhere to the Seerah of the Sahaba? If so then Nawasib have no right to raise objections to mourning rituals for

Imam Husayn (as). If Ibn Abbas is protected from condemnation, then should the same position not be afforded with the Shia?

94. The Du'a of Rasulullah (s) for those who shed tears

We read in:

1. Madarij al Nubuwwah, Volume 2 page 132
2. Seerah al Halbeeya, Volume 2 page 546

"The Prophet heard women wailing from the house of Hamzah and asked 'what is this' He was told 'These are the Ansari women who are mourning your Uncle Hamzah, Rasulullah then supplicated for them 'O Allah, be happy with them, their children and their children's children".

Rasulullah (s) made dua for women who (according to Nasibi) breached the verses demanding patience. Rather than incurring the wrath of Rasulullah (s) they attained the blessings of the Prophet (s) who prayed for them and their future generations.

95. Rasulullah's blessing for those that weep for Imam Husayn (as)

We have previously cited:

"Narrated on the authority of Ahmed bin Isra'el: 'I read in the book of Ahmed bin Muhammed Bin Hanbal written by his own hand writting on the authority of Aswad Bin Amer Abu Abd Arrahman on the authority of Al-Rubay bin Mundher on the authority of his father that Al-Hussain use to say: 'Whom so ever eyes cries a drop of tears on us or sheds a one drop of tears on us, Allah will reward him with paradise'
Fadhail Sahaba, Volume 2 page 675 Tradition 1154

Allama Ibn Hajar Asqalani has recorded a tradition in his renowned book 'Isaba' Volume 1, page 226 that:

The Prophet(s) said: 'whoever on the day of Ashura weeps for my son Husayn, Allah will place that person in paradise alongside the Ul'il Uzm Prophets.

When Rasulullah (s) himself has guaranteed Paradise for those who weep for Imam Husayn (as) then who are the Nasibis to give Fatwas against mourning. Whom should we follow, the Prophet(s) or these Nasibis?

96. Tears shed by Prophets in the Bible

97. Prophet Ibraheem (as) mourned the death of Sarah

Genesis 23: Sarah lived to be a hundred and twenty-seven years old. She died at Kiriath Arba (that is, Hebron) in the land of Canaan, and Abraham went to mourn for Sarah and to weep over her.

98. The people mourned the death of Musa (as)

Deuteronomy 34: Musa was a hundred and twenty years old when he died, yet his eyes were not weak nor his strength gone. The Israelites grieved for Musa in the plains of Moab thirty days, until the time of weeping and mourning was over.

We read in the Book of Leviticus verses 23 to 32.

Feast of Trumpets
The LORD said to Moses, "Say to the Israelites: 'On the first day of the seventh month you are to have a day of rest, a sacred assembly commemorated with trumpet blasts. Do no regular work, but present an offering made to the LORD by fire.'"

Day of Atonement
The LORD said to Moses, 27 "The tenth day of this seventh month is the Day of Atonement. Hold a sacred assembly and deny yourselves, and present an offering made to the LORD by fire. Do no work on that day, because it is the Day of Atonement, when atonement is made for you before the LORD your God. Anyone who does not deny himself on that day must be cut off from his people. I will destroy from among his people anyone who does any work on that day. You shall do no work at all. This is to be a lasting ordinance for the generations to come, wherever you live. It is a Sabbath of rest for you, and you must deny yourselves. From the evening of the ninth day of the month until the following evening you are to observe your Sabbath."

The times being specified for the worship are the first 10 days of the seventh month especially from the evening of the ninth day till the evening of the tenth.

The first day of their seventh month was the first of Muharam ul Haram 61 A.H.The name of their seventh month is "Tashreen" and according to Allama Tabari 1st Muharam 61 A.H was 1st Tashreen 680th year of their calendar. Historian Al Yaqoobi writes that it was the first day of Tashreen on 1st Muharam 61 A.H. In some cities outside Arabia the sun was in the Sign of Libra on 17½ degrees and Moon was in Aquarius on 20 degrees.

Hence it is proved that since Muharam 61 A.H these dates have been twins. Therefore mourning and hurting oneself is ordered in Pentateuch and according to Ayat 31 it is an eternal command for all generations to come, and according to Qur'an Allah (swt) does not change his eternal commands "**... and you shall not find any change in the course of Allah."** Quran 33:62.

Whilst past books are not authentic for us you cannot reject its contents outright. The scholars of Tafseer have made references to Biblical verses in their texts particularly when referring to predictions that were true. Islamic scholars have relied on these books, to prove the references to the Holy Prophet (s). In the days of Holy Prophet (s) Muslims consulted those books and especially the second Caliph Umar bin Khattab did so. Therefore we cannot simply reject those books when Qur'an verifies them. All the sects unanimously agree that the only commandments (in past books) that have been repealed are those that have been over ruled by the Holy Qur'an. There is no evidence in the Qur'an that mourning is Haraam, hence these Biblical verses are valid as they are in line with the Qur'an. This has been espoused by Ibn Taymeeya al Nasabi in his book "al-qaida al-jaleela fit- tawwasali wal-waseela", page 480 with commentary of Dr. Rabi'a bin Hadi 'Umayr al-Mudkhali, professor in the Islamic University of Madinah al-Munawwara. Whilst discussing Jewish traditions he states:

"This is like the [situation] of the Isra'iliyyaat [stories related by the Jews]. It is permissible to be narrated as long as we know that it is not a lie for the purpose of

encouraging or discouraging what we know Allah has ordered or forbidden in our law [shar']."

6. Reciting elegies for Imam Husayn (as)

Many of today's Nasibis deem the recital of sad poetry in praise of our slain Imam (as) to be an act of Bidah that has no place under the Shari'ah. As an example see the "Fatwa" of Mullah Ghulam Rasul in 'Ibtadha Matam' page 60:

"Reciting couplets is the act of Shaytaan and one who performs such an act shall appear as a dog on the Day of Judgement"

If these words have not been reported by anyone in this book, we can write here that they have no authencity for being without a narrator and hence a product of his own mind.

Rather than produce such a weak narration we suggest that this Nasibi opens up the books of his own camp where he can read about the couplets recited by Hadrath Adam (as) and Hawa or the couplets of Ayesha. In his efforts to defame the Shi'a this Nasibi didn't even care about his father Adam or mother Ayesha.

99. The couplet of Adam (as)

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's authority work Tareekh Yaqoobi Volume 1 page 30:

"Adam and Hawa on one occasion recited couplets over Habeel to the point that their eyes filled with tears".

Ibn Katheer writes in his esteemed book al Bidayah wa al Nihaya, Volume 1 Page 181 published by Nafees Academy Karachi:

“**Historians and their adherents have narrated that Adam[as] recited elegy over Habeel’s death which can also be said as the first elegy of the world”**
al Bidayah wa al Nihaya Volume 1 Page 181

Adam is your father and Hawa your mother and they both recited couplets.This Nasibi asserts that one who recites couplets appears as a dog on the Day of Judgement, so what is his opinion about his parents on the Day of Judgement?

If it is permissible for Adam (as) and Hawa (as) to recite couplets at the death of their flesh and blood Habeel, then it is also permissible for us to recite couplet at the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as) who was the flesh and blood of Rasulullah (s).

If it is permissible for Adam (as) and Hawa (as) to recite couplets at the death of their flesh and blood Habeel, then it is also permissible for us to recite couplet at the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as) who was the flesh and blood of Rasulullah (s).

100. An elegy recited before Umar ibn al Farooq

Allamah Shibli Numani al Hanafi records this event in his esteemed book Al Faruq, Volume 2 page 234 published by Taj Company Ltd Karachi:

"The greatest poet of the day was Mutammim bin Nuwaira, whose brother had been slain by mistake by Khalid in the reign of Abu Bakr. He was so shaken by the event that he wept unceasingly and sang elegies over his dead brother. Men and women followed him as he passed and made him recite the elegies. He read and wept and others wept with him. When he came to see Omar, the Caliph asked him to recite his elegies. He recited a few verses; the last two ran as follows:

"For a time we were together with the courtiers of Jadhima, until people said we would never part

Then we parted, it was as if we had never spent a night together"

Omar said if he knew how to compose an elegy, he would have composed one for his brother Zaid.
Al Faruq, Volume 2 page 234

Comment

Here we see Umar the Khalifa requesting the poet to recite sad poetry for him. If reciting poetry about the dead so as to make others cry is Bidah, then Umar would not have entertained this poet, rather he would have used his famous whip to silence the man.

101.Hassaan bin Thabit's elegy at the death of Holy Prophet (s)

Ibn Katheer records the elegy recited by Hassan bin Thabit over the death of Holy Prophet(s) in the following manner:

"In Taiba there are signs and a glowing house of the Prophet (s). The signs perish… …but the signs of Dar-ul-Harm will not faint, and they will keep your signs living for ever… there is a grave in which you have been laid and covered with soil, I stood there and kept crying for you, my eyes became sore, the eyes of Jins must be sore too, they remind us of the favors of the Prophet (s), and there I can not find myself able to count those favors and my heart repents, those hearts are affectionate and tender who start counting his favors yet they do not even reach the fractions of it, but my heart is grieved, they have lengthened their stay at the grave of Prophet (s) and they cry a lot there……their eyes have pierced inside due to excessive crying… …they cry upon that person, who is mourned at by the heavens and the earth…then the houses, playgrounds, mansions, all got deracinated….. O People! Cry for the Holy Prophet (s)… may I never see your tears dried up... may I not see that you do not cry upon him who showered favors upon the people… cry a lot, shout and wail for losing such a being… .."
al Bidayah wa al Nihaya Volume 5 Page 485-486

102.The Jins read elegies for Imam Husayn (as)

Although we have previously provided authentic Sunni narrations regarding the mourning of Jins for Imam Hussain [as] but let us here quote Ibn Katheer al Nasibi who in his book al Bidaya al Nihaya, Volume 8 page 1106 [published by Nafees Academy Karachi] stated:

Imam Ahmed narrates that Abdullah bin Mehdi had narrated to them that Ibn Muslim had narrated from Ammar's reference that he had heard Um-e-Salama saying that she had heard the Jins crying over Imam Hussain. It has been narrated by Hussain bin Idrees from Hashim bin Hashim from Uma from Ume Salma, who was reported to have said:

"I heard the jins crying over Hussain, they were saying: "O! You, who killed Hussain in ignorance, let be the tidings of punishment and torment for you. All the people of the skies, the Prophets, the Apostles and the people are cursing you. You have been cursed through the verses of Daud (as), Musa (as) and the owner of the Bible, Essa (as).""
al Bidaya al Nihaya, Volume 8 page 1106

103.The couplets of sorrow narrated by Imam Husayn (as)'s women folk

We read in al Bidayah wa al Nihaya Volume 8 page 1097 published by Nafees Academy Karachi:

"Upon hearing news of the death of Husayn, he sent his caretaker of the two Mosques Umar ibn Saeed, to convey the good news to the people of Madina.

When the women from Banu Hashim heard this they began to recite couplet When the Umawi Gate keeper of the Prophet's Mosque heard these words from the women of Banu Hashim, he placed his hands over his ears and said 'This loud noise and crying is revenge, for the killing of Uthman"

al Bidayah wa al Nihaya Volume 8 page 1097

This proves that those who killed Imam Husayn (as) were the Banu Umayya and they did so to avenge Uthman's death.

104.Couplets accompanied by instruments

Some Nasibi make a big issue out of the fact that in some cultures the Shi'a mourn by having their couplets via singing.

1. Sahih al Bukhari Volume 2 page 179
2. Sunan Tirmidhi Volume 1 page 332
3. Mishkat al Masabih Volume 2 page 638, Kitab al Nikah

حدثنا علي حدثنا بشر بن المفضل حدثنا خالد بن ذكوان عن الربيع بنت معوذ قالت : دخل علي النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم غداة بني علي فجلس على فراشي كمجلسك مني وجويريات يضربن بالدف يندبن من قتل من آبائهن يوم بدر

"Rubay bint Muawwez reported: 'The Prophet came and entered my house when I was betrothed. He sat upon my bed like you sitting near me. The young girls began to beat Daf and sing about those who were killed on the Day of Badr'."

Girls remembered the martyrs of badr while singing on Daf in front of the Prophet(s) and he approved of it. Tambourines were played in the house of a wife of the Prophet (s). She heard these instruments as did her husband. We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed work Tareekh Khamees Volume 2 page 173 by Shaykh Husayn Diyaar Bakri:

"Anas narrates 'I passed by the door of Ayesha who was mourning for the Prophet"

This proves that mourning through singing does not contravene the Shariah on Sabr, if it did, Ayesha wouldn't have done it. If its permissible for Ayesha to mourn, then why the objection if the Shi'a do the same when commemorating the sufferings of the Ahl'ul bayt (as)?

105.Singing by Abu Bakr upon the death of the Prophet (s)

We read in Tareekh al Khamees Volume 3 page 173:

"Ayesha narrates that on the death of the Prophet, Abu Bakr lifted the veil hiding the face of the Prophet and sang..."

This Nasibi Mullah in his book on page 6 says that recital of couplets was founded by Shaytaan and one who does this is doing the taqlid of Yazeed, and is a Rafidi. If this is the case then you

need to count Khalifa Abu Bakr and Ayesha in this category. If it's permissible for Abu Bakr to sing in memory of Rasulullah (s) then there should be no issue of the Shi'a singing in memory of Imam Husayn (as).

106.Elegies and the shedding of blood for King Faisal

When King Faisal of Saudi Arabia was killed, verses were written lamenting his loss and his killing that goes to show that the Wahabi's don't even adhere to their own Fatwas when one of their Leaders die. All those acts that are Haraam when it comes to mourning Imam Husayn (as) suddenly become okay! We then see that praising and remembering the dead, writing elegies and verses all to express sorrow, grief and pathos on persons killed or dead etc. is but a natural human tendency and urge which is to be respected and honoured. This is clear proof of Azadari!

The Daily, Nawa - i - Waqt, Lahore, March 25, 1976 recorded this deeply moving elegy in honour of the slain Nasibi leader:

We are mourning and our eyes are shedding tears of blood. Our hearts are burning in fire of grief. Our hearts are pierced with pangs of separation and our minds are numb. We have lost sanity of thinking that our beloved leader Faisal has been shot dead by his insane nephew.

Commentary

Look dear readers! Their eyes are shedding tears of blood and their hearts are pierced on the killing of King Faisal. If the custodian of the two Holy Mosques and King of Saudi Arabia is killed, azadari is performed for him and slogans of " Wa Faisala " meaning, O Faisal are raised .If these cries of agony and sorrow are permissible, why should then Azadari for the King of Martyrs, the grandson of the Holy Prophet (s) who was mercilessly slaughtered by Muslims be banned and prohibited?

7. Convening Majlis (Gathering) to remember the dead

107.Allah (swt) and his Prophet have instructed us to organise gatherings to remember Allah (swt)

Allah (swt) says in the Qur'an:

[Shakir 2:152] Therefore remember Me, I will remember you, and be thankful to Me, and do not be ungrateful to Me.

In this verse, Allah (swt)orders us to remember him and it is clear that remembrance should be practiced in ways other than just offering Salat. The esteemed Sunni scholar Allamah Jalaludin Suyuti states that Holy Prophet (s) said:

"On the day of judgment Allah shall declare that on this day those gathered shall know those bestowed with honour and respect." The companions asked: "O! Prophet of Allah, who are these honourable and respectable people?" The Prophet (s) replied: "Those who conduct the Majalis [gatherings] of Dhikr [remembrance] and participate in them."

Suyuti then states that the Holy Prophet (s) said:

"Those who gather at a place in order to please Allah and do His (swt) Dhikr in their speeches, will be addressed by an orator from the skies, who shall proclaim that as soon as they leave that place, their sins shall be forgiven and their bad deeds shall be transformed into virtues."

Then he further states that the Holy Prophet (s) said:

"Those in the skies shall look at the houses in which Allah (swt) is remembered and mentioned. To the angles, they shall appear bright and shining to the angels in the same way that the stars appear to those on the earth."

Suyuti further states Ibn Omar asked the Holy Prophet (s):

"What shall be the reward for participating in a Majalis where the Dhikr [remembrance] of Allah (swt) is conducted ?" The Holy Prophet (s) replied: "Paradise will be earned."

He adds further, that the Holy Prophet (s) said:

"On the Day of Judgment, Allah will appoint people whose faces will be glowing with spiritual light, they shall be seated on the pulpit made of pearls and their eminence will cause anger and envy among the people and neither will they be Prophets nor Martyrs." On hearing this someone said: "O! Prophet of Allah (s), bless us with the description of their appearance." The Holy Prophet (s) said: "They will be the people who have friendships with each other for the sake of Allah; they will be from different families and different countries."
Tafseer Durre Manthur Volume 1, page 151

Along the same line we also read in Sahih Muslim: The Book of Prayers (Kitab Al-Salat) Book 035, Number 6505:

Abu Huraira reported Allah's Apostle (may peace be upon him) as saying Allah has mobile (squads) of angels, who have no other work (to attend to but) to follow the

assemblies of Dhikr and when they find such assemblies in which there is Dhikr (of Allah) they sit in them and some of them surround the others with their wings till the space between them and the sky of the world is fully covered, and when they disperse (after the assembly of Dhikr is adjourned) they go upward to the heaven and Allah, the Exalted and Glorious, asks them although He is best informed about them: Where have you come from? They say: We come from Thine servants upon the earth who had been glorifying Thee (reciting Subhan Allah), uttering Thine Greatness (saying Allah o-Akbar) and uttering Thine Oneness (La ilaha ill Allah) and praising Thee (uttering al-Hamdu Lillah) and begging of Thee. Be would say: What do they beg of Me? They would say: They beg of Thee the Paradise of Thine. He (God) would say: Have they seen My Paradise? They said: No, our Lord. He would say: (What it would be then) if they were to see Mine Paradise? They (the angels) said: They seek Thine protection. He (the Lord) would say: Against what do they seek protection of Mine? They (the angels) would say: Our Lord, from the Hell-Fire. He (the Lord) would say: Have they seen My Fire? They would say: No. He (the Lord) would say: What it would be if they were to see My Fire? They would say: They beg of Thee forgiveness. He would say: I grant pardon to them, and confer upon them what they ask for and grant them protection against which they seek protection. They (the angels) would again say: Our Lord, there is one amongst them such and such simple servant who happened to pass by (that assembly) and sat there along with them (who had been participating in that assembly). He (the Lord) would say: I also grant him pardon, for they are a people the seat-fellows of whom are in no way unfortunate.

These Ahadeeth proves the validity of acts that go beyond Majalis [gatherings] where Allah (swt) is remembered. These are gatherings wherein the Holy Qur'an is explained, the Orders of Allah are described and recited, the Holy Prophet (s) is praised, and the virtues of Islam are also explained.

The Wahabi and Deobandi sect do not conduct any Majalis what so ever, whereas normal Hanafis do observe births and deaths including Majalis for Imam Husayn (a.s).

Whilst some ceremonies carry components such as the remembrance of Allah (swt) and the recitation of the Holy Qur'an many are observed in a different manner and involve the recitation of poems and rhymes which do not fall under the category of gatherings as explained earlier. The Nasabi's have tainted both types of gathering with the same brush deeming both to be Bidah.

Now the question arises which type of Majalis are these Ahadeeth pointing to? They must exist nothing spoken by the Prophet (s) is senseless or without any reason.

There must be some kind of Majalis / Gathering that the Ahadeeth of the Holy Prophet (s) refer that carry these immense rewards. The only Majalis that conform with the requirements of these traditions are those traditions wherein the Majalis of Imam Ali (as), Imam Hasan (as), Imam Husayn (as) and the other Imams of Ahl'ul bayt (as) are remembered. These are the Majalis, in which the speaker:

- Begins by cursing Satan and the praising the Creator,
- refers to the virtues of Allah and his beloved Prophet (s) (that constitutes the remembrance of Allah),
- Recites verses from the Holy Qur'an,
- Comments on the Oneness of Allah, the perfection of Prophethood and core components of Deen.
- Paints a true representation of Islam in all its greatness.
- Uses his elegant tongue to refute the enemies of Islam [hypocrites] and the Kuffar.
- Narrates events from the life of the Prophet (s) and his Holy Progeny

We have hence proven that the Majalis of Imam Ali (as), Imam Hasan (as) and Imam Husayn (a.s) are gatherings that constitute the remembrance / Dhikr of Allah (swt), in accordance with the Hadeeth of Rasulullah (s).

108.Ayesha's gathering over Abu Bakar's death

We read in Al-Aqd al-Farid, Volume 2 page 76:

عن سعيد بن المُسيّب قال: لما تُوفى أبو بكر أقامت عليه عائشة النَوح

"Saeed bin al-Musayab narrated that when Abu Bakr died, Ayesha convened a mourning assembly over him..."

109.Ayesha's gathering (Majlis) at the time of Umar's death

As evidence we shall rely on Tareekh Khamees, Volume 2 page 349:

I saw 'Umar bin Al-Khattab (when he was stabbed) saying, "O 'Abdullah bin 'Umar! Go to the mother of the believers Ayesha and say, 'Umar bin Al-Khattab sends his greetings to you, do not say Ameer ul Momineen since today this term expires' Abdullah went and found that Ayesha was crying at the plight of Umar"

What we see is Ayesha was crying, so if this is an act of Bidah then it is the Sunnah of Ayesha. If Ayesha will receive salvation for her tears so will the women who mourn Imam Husayn (as).

110.Umm'ul Momineen Salmah obtained the approval of the Prophet (s) to participate in a mourning ritual

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's authority work Al-Jami al-Sagheer by al Tabrani, Volume 2 page 181:

أم سلمة زوج النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم قالت : يا رسول الله إن نساء بني مخزوم قد أقمن مأتمهن على الوليد بن المغيرة فأذن لها فقالت وهي تبكيه ... وأبكى الوليد بن الوليد بن المغيرة ... أبكي الوليد بن الوليد أخا العشيرة ...

Umm Salmah the wife of the Prophet (s) said: 'O Rasulullah (s), the women of Bani Makhzum are arranging a mourning gathering for al-Waleed bin al-Mughira. Thus he gave her permission to attend that. She went and recited a couplet whilst crying ... 'I weep over al-Waleed bin al-Mughira ... I weep over al-Waleed bin al-Mughira the brother of the tribe'...

Umm Salmah obtained the consent of her husband to participate in this mourning procession If mourning rituals are Haraam then Rasulullah (s) would have refrained his wife from attending and made an order that women abstain from such Haraam activities. Not only did she participate she even recited a sad elegy!

If Rasulullah (s) allowed participation in a gathering which was for an ordinary deceased Sahabi and Umme Salmah recited a sad couplet in it then how can mourning rituals for Imam Husayn (as) be Haraam?

111.Muharam gathering under the auspices of al Muhaddith Shah Abdul Aziz Dehlavi

The Shah would convene two Majalis per annum at his residence:

1. To remember the passing away of the Holy Prophet (s) and
2. Majlis of Imam Husayn (as)'s martyrdom.

The words of Fatawa Azizi, pages 199-200 published by H.M Saeed Co. Karachi are:

"About 400-500 and on some occasions a thousand would assemble on the day of Ashura or a day or two before it and would collectively recite Durood. Then this pauper (The Shah is referring to himself) would speak on the greatness of Imam Husayn (as) and give a detailed account of the martyrdom and how retribution against these killers was meted out.

The Elegies from Jinn for Imam Husayn (as) as heard by Umm - e - Salama and other Sahabas would be recited listening to which people including this pauper would be effected and would start lamenting and crying. The Holy Qur'an would then be read and then Fateha would be read on the departed Holy Souls and finally, food would be distributed".

Fatawa Azizi, page 199 & 200

The Shah needs no introduction to those from the Indian Subcontinent. He hated the Shi'a. Author of the famous Tauhfa Ithna Ashari, he dedicated his whole life to countering Shi'a influences in the Indian Subcontinent. Despite his anti Shi'a stance he supported Azadari of Imam Husayn (as). If holding Majalis during Muharam, referring to the greatness of Imam Husayn (as) and his martyrdom, reciting elegies, crying and feeding the people is Haraam, the Shah would never have initiated such gatherings. Shah's fatwa as mentioned above clearly proves that Azadari for Imam Husayn (as) is permissible, and recommended under the Shari'ah.

112.Majalis to mourn Husayn (as) build character

If we analyse all that is done in Muharam we see that it is a very effective method of character building for all people. During our Majalis we convey the teachings of Islam from the Holy Qur'an, Sunnah and lives of our Holy Imams. Speakers refer to the lessons and sayings of the Holy Prophet (s) and the Ahl'ul bayt (as). Our processions maintain peace and perfect harmony. We express our hatred against cruelty, propagate the truth and convey salutations to the Holy Prophet (s) and his family. We set out teachings on Jihad against tyranny, strengthening of faith and belief, patience and fortitude in times of danger and such other noble and sublime thoughts and emotions. Why then do these Nasibi oppose our gatherings?

113.Prophet (saww) arranged Majalis to mourn his uncle Hamza (ra)

"When Holy Prophet (s) reached Madina, he saw that cries could be heard from most of the houses of Ansaar (the helpers) but not from Hamza's house. Holy Prophet (s) said that wasn't there anyone to cry over Hamza, the helpers(Ansaar) asked their females to mourn over Hamza first and later on they may go and cry over their own martyrs, the women went to Hamza's house in the evening and kept crying till midnight, When Holy Prophet(s) woke up and asked about it, he was told the whole thing, Holy Prophet(s) blessed them by saying" May Allah be pleased with you and your children."

1. Madarij al-Nabuwat, volume 2, page 166 by Sheikh Mohammad Abdul Haque Mohaddis Dehalvi
2. Tarikh Kamil, Volume 2 page 64

3. Tarikh Khamees, Volume 1 page 499

Had such gatherings been bidah or against islamic injunctions , Holy Prophet (s) would have not showed sadness over absence of mourners for Hamzah(r) and would have not given glad tidings for those who had later on participated in the mourning gathering of martyred Hamzah (r).

114.Weeping while relating the tragedies befallen on pious is sunnah of Holy Prophet(s) and listening to them is the sunnah of Sahaba

We read in Sahih Bukhari Volume 2, Book 23, Number 338:

Narrated Anas bin Malik: The Prophet said, "Zaid took over the flag and was martyred. Then it was taken by Jafar who was martyred as well. Then 'Abdullah bin Rawaha took the flag but he too was martyred and at that time the eyes of Allah's Apostle were full of tears. Then Khalid bin Al-Walid took the flag without being nominated as a chief (before hand) and was blessed with victory."

We arrange gatherings to relate the calamities befallen on Imam Hussain [as] and their companions and weep over them just like Holy Prophet [s] wept while relating the miserable tragedies befallen on the martyres before their death.

115.The mourning gathering of Sahaba and elegies recited by Hassaan bin Thabit over the death of a martyr

Ibn Katheer in his authority work al-Bidayah wa al-Nihaya records the grief of Sahaba over the death of a sahabi Sa'ad bin Ma'az in the following way:

Ibn Ishaq narrates that on the death of Sa'ad bin Ma'az, which was termed as martyrdom by the Holy Prophet (s), Hasaan bin Thabit had recited a very woeful elegy, furthermore, such a huge number of people was never seen crying over someone's death ever before.
al Bidayah wa al Nihaya, Volume 4, page 547

Here we can see that not only Hassaan bin Thabit recited elegies over the death Sa'ad bin Ma'az who was according to Ibn Katheer reached to the status of martyrdom during war of Bani Qariza but a large number of Sahaba also gathered and wept over his death. Likewise Shias arrange gatherings to commemorate the martyres of Karbala where they recite elegies and weep over them. Had reciting elegies and weeping over the death of a martyr been forbidden, Sahaba would have not gathered to do so in the presence of Holy Prophet (s).

116.The Fatwa of Ulema e Ahle Sunnah regarding the permissibility of Majalis for Hussain (as)

Ibn al Hashimi sought to create an unnecessary wedge between the two Sects by penning the article titled "**Why Sunnis Do Not Comemmorate Ashura**". This title sought to deceptively suggest that Ibn al Hashimi was reiterating a position shared by all Sunni Muslims around the world; and hence sought to portray them as a homogenous group with one voice, opposed to commemorating Imam Husayn (as). This Nasibi should know that Sunni Islam is not just restricted to those affiliated with the Ulema of Najd and Deoband! There is Sunni life beyond those institutions and to suggest that every Sunni scholar worth his salt from whatever affiliated group would corroborate the opinion of Ibn al Hashimi is a complete lie. After Indonesia the second largest group of Sunni Muslims come from the Indian Subcontinent. Let us therefore cite some Sunni opinions supporting the practice of gathering to mourn Imam Hussain (as).

The name of Allamah Muhammad Shafi Okarvi is not new to the Ahle Sunnah living in the sub continent, a person popularly known as "Khateeb e Pakistan". In his book "Shaam e Karbala" he cites the fatwa on the permissibility of mourning gatherings [majalis] for Imam Hussain (as).

"**Shah Rafiuddin Mohaddith Dehalvi who is also the translator of Holy Quran, says in one of his edicts:**

'Holding of Majalis for the remembrance of Imam Hussain [as] in the month of Muharram, or other than that, listening to Salams and elegies, and crying and wailing for the martyrs of Karbala is permissible and correct.'"
Shaam e Karbala, page 300

Worthy of note is the fact that Allama Muhammad Shafi Okarvi was one of those Sunni scholars who arranged Majalis in the month of Muharram where thousands of Sunni muslims would gather and listen to the merits of Imam Hussain (as) and the tragedy of Karbala. In a brief biography of Allama Shafi Okarvi mentioned in the preface of his book "Shaam e Karbala" we read:

"**Molana Sahib kept delivering religious speeches every night continuously for forty years. His sound knowledge, eloquence, decent behavior and the excellent oratory was singular and had made him the beloved of all. Hundreds of thousands of people gathered for every speech of his. On the night before Ashura in the month of Muharram, the largest religious gathering used to be at Molana Sahib's place of speech. There would hardly be any place left in Pakistan where Molana Sahib hasn't satisfied the hearts and souls of people through his speeches."**
Shaam e Karbala, page 11

On page 15 we read:

"**Hadhrat Moulana started the process of conducting the Majalis in 10 days of Muharram, and the procession and gatherings of Eid Millad un Nabi by Ahl e Sunnah wal Jama'at."**
Shaam e Karbala, page 11 & 15

The above cited references completely destroys

> Ibn al Hashimi who asserts:
>
> Sometimes the Shia of today will encourage the Sunnis to comemmorate Ashura, using and exploiting the fact that the Ahlus Sunnah also loves Hussain (رضیٰ الله عنه). We strongly urge our Muslim brothers not to fall into this trap of the Shia! They want us to take part in rituals that were designed to defame the Ahlus Sunnah, and nothing more. We cannot accept the Shia way of life.
> Additionally, comemmorating Ashura with any special ritual would be adding to the faith of Islam, and this is Bidah. Bidah is considered part of Hell-Fire, and whoever invents a Bidah is promised Hell-Fire as well.

We are sure that none of these Sunni scholars were encouraged to mourn Imam Husayn (as), it was natural due to their love for him! Both scholars were opposed to the Shia so being influenced by them would not even come into the equation. They certainly didn't believe that

gathering to remember the fallen Imam was designed to defame Ahlus Sunnah! Is Ibn al Hashimi going to suggest that these Sunni Ulema had accepted the Shi'a way of life?

Crucially where is Ibn al Hashimi's Fatwa of Bidah for those Sunni Muslims who arrange Majalis during the month of Muharram and commemorate the tragedy of Karbala? If according to Ibn al Hashimi arranging of Majalis for Imam Hussain (as) is bidah / kufr than are all those Sunni Muslims of the world who arrange mourning gatherings in Muharram Kaafir in his eyes?

8. Wearing black attire

Nasibi Qadhi Mazhar Husayn in his book "Hum Matam kyoon nahee kartay" [Why we do not perform mourning] says that black was the attire of the people of Pharaoh and the people of Hell.

Ibn al Hashimi al-Nasibi also touched the issue:

> Ibn al Hashimi stated:
>
> Traditionally, the Shia wear black clothes in the month of Muharram. In fact, during this month, it is considered Mustahabb (highly recommended) to do so. We find most Shia do wear black in certain parts of the year, including the Shia Ulema (scholarship) and Maraje' (high scholars). In fact, the Shia Ayatollahs tend to wear black year-round, and very rarely do we see them not wearing black cloaks.
>
> Herein we find a contradiction in the Shia faith. According to the authentic Shia Hadith, wearing black clothes is actually Haram (forbidden)! We see the following Hadith referenced on the reliable Shia website, Al-Shia.com:
>
> Amir-ul-mu'minin said:
>
> "Do not wear black clothes, that is the dress of Pharaoh"
> (Source: Al-Shia.com, http://www.al-shia.com/html/ara/books/faqih/faqih-1/a41.html)
>
> Imam As Sadiq was asked about pray in the black clothes, he said:
>
> "Don't pray in it, that is dress of people of fire"
> (Source: Al-Shia.com,
> http://www.al-shia.com/html/ara/books/faqih/faqih-1/a41.html)
>
> There is obviously nothing wrong with wearing black clothes, and the Ahlus Sunnah has nothing in their books which forbids it. However, the Shia Hadith declare that Amir Al-Mumineen Ali (رضی الله عنه) and Imam As-Sadiq (رضی الله عنه) declared it Haram. And yet, we find the Shia scholars wearing black, as well as the Shia masses who do so out of a sense of religious obligation.

117.Reply One

Firstly, the Shia scholars who consider it Mustahabb (highly recommended) to wear black clothes during the month of Muharram, they base their fatwa on respecting the signs of Allah according to the verse ***'{and whoever respects the signs of Allah, this surely is (the outcome) of the piety of hearts.}'*** *[22:32]*. There are divergent views among the scholars

as to whether the month of Muharam is one of the signs of Allah or not. But Ibn al-Hashimi's claim that the Shia masses do so out of a sense of 'religious obligation' is no doubtedly an exaggeration.

And most importantly, we do not know from where Ibn al-Hashimi al-Nasibi has deduced that wearing black is Haraam in Shia school. The two Shia traditions he has used in his article, when read with other similar traditions, the maximum status of weaing black clothes that the Shia scholars have deduced is Makrooh [will lessen some reward] but they did not declare it Haraam [prohibted act], as we read in Majma al-Faeda by Ardabili, Volume 2 page 87 and in Al-Muhadab al-Bare by ibn Fahad al-Heli, Volume 2 page 21. As for clear tradition from a Imam [as] regarding the actual status of the issue, we read in Wasail al-Shia, Volume 4 page 382:

"Abu Abdullah (a) said: 'The black dress is Makrooh except in three things, shoes, turban and cloak".

Thus, one may not adopt the habit of wearing black clothes but here we are only discussing things from the prespective of mourning for Imam Hussain [as]. Black is considered as a sign to express grief and wearing black solely for the purpose to express one's grief for the murder of the Prophet's grandson cannot be equated to the rutine wearing trends. We read in prominent Shia work Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 45 page 70:

Umar bin Ali bin al-Hussain said: 'When al-Hussain bin Ali (as) was killed, Bani Hashim's women used to wear black clothes'.

In another Shia book Al-Hadaeq al Nasirah, Volume 3 page 142, it is stated that:

"The act of wearing black, in reality, has nothing to do with the (illogical) traditions condemning it because it has been mentioned (enduringly) for posterity in the most authentic traditions that the symbols of mourning should be made manifest in the mourning for Imam Husayn (as).

Thus, when Imam Husayn (as) was martyred, the ladies of Banu Hashim wore the black attire and they did not change it even if the weather was hot or cold. The ladies would be busy mourning and Imam Zain ul Abideen (as) would bring food for them".

We do not see any condemnation of Imam Zain al-Abdeen [as] for the women of Bani Hashim on wearing back clothes for expressing their grief for the slain Grandson of Holy Prophet [s] which shows that Imams of Ahlulbayt [as] distinguished between one's love for wearing black clothes in rutine and in wearing them to epxress one's grief for the tragedies beffalen Ahlulbayt [as].

118.Reply Two

It is obvious that the actual motive of Ibn al-Hashimi behind this short article was to point out the **'inconsistency in religion'** and then concluded **'that Shi'ism is not true Islam'**. If that is the case, then let us present some facts for Ibn al-Hashimi:

1. Quran instructs to take two witnesses before you divorce while Sunnis oppose the notion.
2. Quran and Sunnah forbid us to kill each other and consume Haraam but the 'Faqih' and 'Hadi' of Nawasib namely Muawiya allowed the same *[Sahih Muslim, Book 020, Number 4546].*
3. Bayhaqi has recorded that **"Prophet (pbuh) while leading the prayer used to recite 'Bismiallah alrahman al-Rahim' whenever he wanted to recite Quran'** *[Al-Sunnan al-Kubra, v2 p47 Tradition 2225]* but we read that **"The Malikis say that it is Makrooh to recite Tawiz before reciting a sura during prayer and reciting**

'Bismillah' before the Fatiha or the sura as well" *[Al-Fiqh ala al-Madahib al-Arba, v1 p170]*.

4. **"Narrated Aisha: 'Do you make us (women) equal to dogs and donkeys? I used to lie between the Prophet and the Qiblah and whenever he wanted to prostrate he used to pinched my leg and I would then pull my legs"** [Sahih Bukhari, v1 p193] while Salafi Imam Ibn Uthaymin stated that **"Thus the correct view in this issue is that the prayer gets invalid by the passing of a woman, donkey and black dog."** *[Al-Sharh al-Mumtea, v3 p214]*..

Now shall we paraphrase Ibn al-Hashimi's remarks::

'This is truly an inconsistency in religion. The Faith of Allah should not have inconsistencies in it, and yet we find that Sunnism is full of such discrepencies. Hence, we can only conclude that Sunnism is not true Islam'.

119.Reply Three

By stating that **'There is obviously nothing wrong with wearing black clothes, and the Ahlus Sunnah has nothing in their books which forbids it'**, Ibn al-Hashimi actually tried to bring his sect out of what he thinks can lead to **'inconsistency in religion'** but this tall claim has only shown his ignorance of his own text. The jurists of Ahlus Sunnah have indeed found problems in wearing black clothes. We read in Al-Aadab al-Sharia by Muhammad bin Mufleh al-Hanbali, Volume 4 page 219 under the chapter: **'Wearing black and its disliking by Ahmad if it was the cloth of the unjust)'**:

وقيل فمن ترك ثيابا سوداء يحرقها الوصي

'It has been said that whoever left a black cloth, the inheritor should burn it down'

قال الخلال عن المروذي عنه وهذا يقتضي تحريمه

'Al-Khalal narrated from al-Marozi that he said that it should be Haraam'

وسأل الإمام أحمد المتوكل أن يعفيه من لبس السواد

'Imam Ahmad asked the Mutwakil to exempt him from wearing black'.

وسلم رجل على أحمد فلم يرد عليه وكان عليه جبة سوداء

'A man greeted Ahmad but he didn't reply because he was wearing black.'.

Also we read in Mauwsoat al-Fiqh by Kuwaiti government, Volume 11 page 360:

ومنع الحنفيّة لبس السّواد في الحداد على غير الزّوج

"The Hanafis forbid wearing black during the mourning for other than the husband".

We also read:

وقال القليوبيّ من الشّافعيّة : إذا كان الأسود عادة قومها في التّزيّن به حرم لبسه

"Al-Qalyobi from the Shafiyees said: 'If the black color is considered sign of beaty among her people , then it is unlawful for her to wear it'"

Can Ibn al-Hashimi tell us what problems these Sunni jurists had with wearing black clothes? Yet around the globe, we can find Sunnies wear black clothes? Shall we adopt Ibn al-Hashimi's policy and call it 'inconsistency in religion' ?

120.According to Ahl'ul Sunnah, it is forbidden to dye your beard black

In one of the respected book of Ahl'ul Sunnah, Fatawa Mohammad ibn Ahmad, Volume 2 page 27 (Delhi) it is stated:

The concerned Maulana (Shaykh) was asked whether it was allowed to dye one's beard black or with henna. The answer was that it is Sunnah to dye one's hair red or yellow, but it is forbidden to dye one's hair black. Mujahid does not agree with this view.

In one of the respected books of Sunan Abu Daud Book 33, Number 4200:

Narrated Abdullah ibn Abbas:
The Prophet (peace be upon him) said: At the end of time there will be people who will use this black dye like the crops of doves who will not experience the fragrance of Paradise.

Comment

Therefore, if those who wear black in mourning Husayn (as) will go to hell, then, according to this tradition, those Nasibi mullahs who dye their beards black will also go to hell.

121.The Prophet (s) wore black

In the prominent book of Ahl'ul Sunnah, Zaad al-Maad, Volume 1 page 134:

وكان له بردان أخضران وكساء أسود

"He (prophet) had two green cloaks and a black dress"

122.Umar in black attire

In the prominent book of Ahl'ul Sunnah, Tareekh Tabari, page 2836, it is stated:

The narrator says: I saw Umar wearing a tied black shroud during the extreme heat of the day, as well as another (black shroud) draped across his body.

123.Wearing black while mourning Uthman

In the prominent book of Ahlul Sunnah, Sharh Shumail Tirmidhi, page 166 it is said:

On the day of the murder of Uthman, a party of people wore black just as Imam Hassan (as) used to give sermons whilst attired in black. Moreover his turban also used to be black.

Comment

Thus, it is proven that the Sahaba wore black on the day of the murder of Uthman. If this is the attire of the inhabitants of hell, then which category do these Salaf belong to?

124.The Prophet (s)'s shroud was black

In the prominent book of Ahl'ul Sunnah, Sirat Ibn Hisham, Volume 2 page 665:

أَنّ عَائِشَةَ حَدّثَتْهُ قَالَتْ كَانَ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللّهِ صَلّى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلّمَ خَمِيصَةٌ سَوْدَاءُ حِينَ اشْتَدّ بِهِ وَجَعُهُ

Ayesha says: 'When the Prophet (s) was experiencing severe pain, he was wrapped in a black shroud'.

In the prominent book of Ahl'ul Sunnah, Neel ul Auwtar, Volume 2 page 96, by Maulana Qadhi Mohammad Shawkani, we read:

وعن أم خالد قالت : (أتى النبي صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم بثياب فيها خميصة سوداء

Um Khalid stated: 'The Prophet (s) arrived one day wearing a black dress'

125.The Prophet (s)'s turban was black

This can be evidenced from the following works of Ahl'ul Sunnah:

1. Jami al Tirmidhi, Edition 1, Page 542
2. Sahih Muslim, Kitab Al-Hajj Book 007, Number 3146:
3. Sunan Nasai, Edition 8, Page 211
4. Sunan ibn Majah, Page 79
5. Al Muajum Al-Saghir, by Tabrani page 9
6. Zaad al-Maad, Volume 3 page 402

We read in Zaad al-Maad:

وفي القصة : أنه دخل مكة وعليه عمامة سوداء ففيه دليل على جواز لبس السواد أحيانا

"In a tradition he (prophet) entered Makka while he was wearing a black turban and this is an evidence that it is sometimes lawful to wear black"

126.Imam Abu Hanifa wearing black after death

We read in a prominent book of Ahl'ul Sunnah Tareekh Baghdad, Volume 13 page 453:

قال سمعت علي بن المديني قال قال لي بشر بن أبي الأزهر النيسابوري رأيت في المنام جنازة عليها ثوب أسود وحولها قسيسين فقلت جنازة من هذه فقالوا جنازة أبي حنيفة حدثت أبا يوسف فقال لا تحدث به أحدا

"Beshr bin Abi al-Azhar al-Nisaburi states: 'I saw in a dream a coffin on which was a black shroud. Christian priests were sitting near it. I asked them whose coffin it was. They said it was that of Imam Abu Hanifa. I told this dream to Abu Yusuf. He told me not to tell it to anyone else".

127.Jinns wore black when Umar died

In the prominent book of Ahl'ul Sunnah, Riyadh al Nadhira Volume 1 page 198, we read:

وعن المطلب بن زياد قال: رثت الجن عمر فكان فيما قالوا:
ستبكيك نساء الجن ... تبكين منتحبات
وتخمشن وجوهاً ... كالدنانير النقيات
ويلبس ثياب السود ... بعد القصيبات

Al-Mutalib bin Zyad says that upon the death of Umar the Jinns recited Marsiyah:

While mourning your death the ladies of the Jinns are beating their faces, which resemble Dinars in beauty, and they are wearing black attires instead of silken ones."

Comment

Look at the tales their scholars cook up when one of their own dies! If the black attire belongs to the inhabitants of hell, then why did the Jinns have to wear black upon the death of Umar? And if the black attire belongs to the Pharaoh, then upon the death of Umar why did the Djinns suddenly become followers of Pharaoh?

To the lovers of Justice! All the Nasibi religious organisations are silent when it comes to Umar because he is one of their own. But whenever the mourning for Imam Husayn (as) is discussed, these very organisations seem to be extremely perturbed by the black attire! This is nothing but enmity to the Ahl'ul Bayt (as)!

128.Imam Hassan (as)'s black attire

In Sharh Shumail Tirmidhi, page 166 and in Al-Hawo Lel Fatawi, by Suyuti, page 108 we read:

وقال ابن سعد أنا الفضل بن دكين وهشام أبو الوليد الطيالسي قالا ثنا شريك عن عاصم عن أبي رزين قال خطبنا الحسن بن علي رضي الله عنهما وعليه ثياب سود وعمامة سوداء

Abu Razin said: 'Once Hassan bin Ali delivered a sermon wearing black attire and black turban'

Comment

This has been mentioned before, but we are mentioning it again in order to point out the fact that the beloved grandson of the Prophet (s), Imam Hassan (as), used to wear black. Will these Mullahs stoop so low in their opposition to the Azadari for Imam Husayn (as) that all respect for the Ahl'ul Bayt will disappear from their hearts?

9. Hitting one's body in grief

This is one of the favourite areas of exploitation for the Nasibi and they enjoy making fun and insisting that these practises are against the Shari'ah. They serve as further evidence that the Shi'a are a deviated Sect. Since they adhere to Umar ibn al Khattab's way famed for his words 'the Qur'an is sufficient for us' lets turn the tables on them. They keep asking us to prove our mourning rituals from the Qur'an such as crying, chest beating etc.We ask them to cite us any verse containing the words Matam, Latmiyah (blood letting) wherein Allah (swt) has declared such practices to be Haraam. No where in the Holy Qur'an has Matam been classified as Haraam. On the contrary, the stories of Prophets include examples of their mourning. As such, the permissibility of Matam is there in Qur'an but not its prohibition. Thus an act, for which there is no restriction of any kind by Islamic Laws, becomes permissible. It is Nasibi who have lied by stating that Matam is against patience and call only for patience instead!

129.Mourning rituals and self harm as found in the Qur'an

We read in Surah Nisa 004.148:

YUSUFALI: Allah loveth not that evil should be noised abroad in public speech, except where injustice hath been done; for Allah is He who heareth and knoweth all things.

This verse makes it clear that the public's relaying of injustice is permissible. Relaying the suffering of a victim is permissible.

Major efforts are made to prove that the term mourning is proof that Matam is Haraam under the Shari'ah. On the contrary breast-beating, bloods letting all come within the term mourning and its purpose is to convey the pains inflicted on the victim, something which the Quran has sanctioned. We the Shi'a perform all these acts as Allah (swt) has permitted us to do so, and the opposition of Nasibi is only on account for their love and support for Imam Husayn (as)'s killers.

130.Mourning and shedding blood is the Sunnah of Prophet Adam (as)

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's authority work Ma'arij al Nubuwwah, Chapter 1 page 248:

"Adam was so distressed that he smashed his hands onto his knees and the skin from his hands caused gashes from which bone could be seen".

Those who deem the act of self-harm to be batil should look at the bloodletting actions of Adam (as). If Adam (as) can do this why cannot the Shi'a when mourning for Imam Husayn (as)?

131.Mourning and hitting one self is the Sunnah of the Prophet (s)

As evidence we shall cite the following works:

1. Sahih Bukhari, Volume 9, Book 92, Number 446
2. Sunan al Nasai, Volume 3 page 305
3. Adaab al Mufarad, page 426
4. Sahih Muslim Volume 1 page 291
5. Musnad Abu Aawna, Volume 2 page 292

We read in Sahih Bukhari:

Narrated 'Ali bin Abi Talib:
That Allah's Apostle came to him and Fatima the daughter of Allah's Apostle at their house at night and said, "Won't you pray?" 'Ali replied, "O Allah's Apostle! Our souls are in the Hands of Allah and when he wants us to get up, He makes us get up." When 'Ali said that to him, Allah's Apostle left without saying anything to him. While the Prophet was leaving, 'Ali heard him striking his thigh (with his hand) and saying, "But man is quarrelsome more than anything else." (18.54)

Ibn Hajr Asqalani in the commentary of this tradition in Fatah al Bari, Volume 3 page 11 writes:

قوله يضرب فخذه فيه جواز ضرب الفخذ عند التأسف

"His statement 'striking his thigh' shows the permission of striking the thigh to express the grief"

If hitting oneself is Haraam then what Fatwa do the Nawasib have for the Prophet (s)? The Pillar of Shari'ah is himself hitting his chest, so if the Shi'a do the same, why are their actions Batil?

132.Thigh beating is the Sunnah of Maula Ali (as)

We read in Tauhfa Ithna Ashari page 523 published in Karachi:

"When Ayesha was defeated and Ali saw the corpses on the ground he began to beat his thighs"
Tauhfa Ithna Ashari, page 523

These Nasibi claim that hitting one's chest is Batil, if this were true what view should we have of Rasulullah (s), Adam (as) and Maula 'Ali (as)?

133.Thigh beating is the Sunnah of Sahaba

1. Musnad Abu Awana, Volume 2 page 141
2. Sunan Nasai, Volume 3 page 12
3. Sunan Abu Daud, Volume 1 page 244

"Mu'awyia bin Hakam al-Sulami said: 'I was preforming prayers behind Allah's messenger (pbuh) then a man sneezed, thus I said to him: 'May Allah's mercy be upon you'. Thus the people looked at me, then I said to my self: 'O my, why are you looking at me?' Then they started striking their thighs, therefore I came to know that they want me to remain silent'".
This Hadith has been recorded by Albaani in his 'Sahih Sunan Abu Daud' Volume 1 page 175 Hadith 823

Before deeming self harm to be Haram, perhaps Nawasib should take a closer look at the acts of the Sahaba. The Sahaba's hitting their thighs and the silence of the Prophet (s) proves that such acts of distress are not haraam. It's amusing that these Nasibi Mullah's never raise questions on any action of the Sahaba whether good or bad but they find fault with every act of the Shi'a. If the act of the Sahaba's beating themselves is not Haram then the Shi'as act of beating themselves should not be construed as Haram either.

134.Proof of head beating from the Qur'an

In Surah adh-Dhaariyaat we read that Sara (as) struck her face when she was told that she would conceive a baby.

"Then came forward his wife in grief, she smote her face and said (what! I) An old barren woman?"
Quran 51:29

"Faskath" does not just mean rub or touch, it means slap and this is evidenced from Saheeh Muslim Book 030, Number 5851, Bab Fadail Musa:

Abu Hurraira reported that the Angel of Death was sent to Moses (peace be upon him) to inform of his Lord's summons. When he came, he (Moses) boxed him [Sakka] and his eye was knocked out. He (the Angel of Death) came back to the Lord and said: You sent me to a servant who did not want to die. Allah restored his eye to its proper place (and revived his eyesight), and then said: Go back to him and tell him that if he wants life he must place his hand on the back of an ox, and he would be granted as many years of life as the number of hair covered by his hand. He (Moses) said: My Lord what would happen then He said: Then you must court death. He said: Let it be now. And he supplicated Allah to bring him close to the sacred land. Thereupon Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) said: If I were there, I would have shown you his grave beside the road at the red mound.

This has also been reported in Sahih Bukhari, Book 23 Volume 2, Book 23, Number 423, Book of Funerals.

We read in the Sunni work Maqamath ai Hareery,

"He beat his cheeks and tore his collar"

The slapping of Prophet Ibraheem (as)'s wife Sara is proven from the Qur'an. The Qur'an tells us to adhere to the ways of the people of Ibraheem (as), so if the Shi'a beat themselves whilst mourning for Imam Husayn (as) such acts are lawful.

135.Beating oneself at a time of distress is the Sunnah of Prophet Adam (as)

We read in Madarij al Nubuwah, page 221:

"When life was breathed into the spirit of Adam he hit his hand on his head and cried. He made this tradition of beating one's head with one's hand and crying in times of trouble for his descendants."

136.Hitting one's head in times of trouble is the Sunnah of Prophet Yusuf (as)

We read in Tafseer Kabeer, Volume 9 page 98:

قيل إن جبريل عليه السلام دخل على يوسف عليه السلام حينما كان في السجن فقال إن بصر أبيك ذهب من الحزن عليك فوضع يده على رأسه وقال : ليت أمي لم تلدني ولم أك حزناً على أبي

"It has been said that when Gebrail (pbuh) went to Yusuf (pbuh) in jail he (Gebrail) said to him: 'Your father has become blind due to the grief for you. Thus he (Yusuf) put his hand on his head and said: 'I wish if my mother didn’t give birth to me and

there would not have been the reason for my father's grief."

We have proven that the acts of hitting one's head are not Jahiliyya or Un-Islamic.In fact it is the Sunnah of Prophets Adam (as) and Yusuf (as).

The Shi'a mourn Imam Husayn (as) as a form of remembrance. We seek to remember and share his suffering and pain, since assisting one in trouble is a recommended (Mustahab) act and a kind of worship. We also deem mourning and presenting our sincerity to Imam Husayn (as) to be a form of worship.

137.Beating oneself in times of trouble is the Sunnah of Umar

We read in Ahl'ul Sunnah's authority work Aqd al Fareed, Volume 1 page 342:

ولما نُعي النَّعمان بن مُقَرَّن إلى عمر بن الخطاب وضع يدَه على رأسه وصاح يا أسفي على النعمان

When Umar received news of the death of Numan ibn Muqran, he placed his hand on his head and wailed: 'O my grief for Numan!'

We find a similar narration in Kanz al Ummal, Vol.8, Page 117, Kitab al Maut:

When Omar heard of Nu'man ibn Muqran's death he beat his head and screamed, "O what a pity that Nu'man died".

When Umar mourns the death of his friend in such a way, the descendents of Mu'awiya remain silent, but if the Shi'a mourn Imam Husayn (as) through such an act they are deemed Kaffirs. If Nasibis wish to accuse us of introducing Bidah into the religion then they should know that Umar introduced this long before the Rafidis! If such acts of hitting oneself and extreme wailing are prohibited then what was your Khalifa indulging in this act for?

138.Beating and mourning by the wives of the Sahaba

Before we expand on this reality let us begin by citing words that we had previously cited from

> Ibn al Hashimi who claims:
>
> Additionally–and this point cannot be stressed enough–there were many Sahabah who were killed in the Path of Allah, but the Prophet (صلّى الله عليه وآله وسلّم) never mourned their deaths in the manner in which the Shia mourn Hussain (رضّى الله عنه). The Prophet lost his own dear uncle, his own wife, and many of his dearest companions, but do we see that the Prophet (صلّى الله عليه وآله وسلّم) ever resorted to self-flagellation or excessive mourning? The Shia can never provide such an example from the life of the Prophet (صلّى الله عليه وآله وسلّم), probably not even from Shia sources. Therefore, we find that it is not part of the Sunnah to mourn in such an uncivilized manner and we shall never take part in it because of this.

Let us refute this Nasibi by citing Allamah Shibli Numani al Hanafi is a renowned Sunni scholar from the Indian subcontinent. In his Sirat-un Nabi (Eng translation Volume 2 pg 74) quoting Sirat Ibn Hisham we read the following about Hamzah (as) martyrdom:

"The Holy Prophet (P) returned to Madina and found the whole city gone into mourning. Whenever he went, he heard wailing and lamentation in every house. He was grieved to find that all who were martyred in the battle had their mourners doing their duty to the memory of their dear ones. But there was none to mourn the death of Hamzah (ra). Overwhelmed with grief, the words that there was no one to mourn the loss of Hamzah escaped his lips. The Ansâris were touched to the core when they heard this remark from the Prophet(s). They asked their women to go to the house of the Prophet (S) and mourn for Hamzah. The Prophet (p) thanked them for their sympathy, prayed for their well-being, but added that it was not permissible to lament in memory of the dead. (Women in Arabia were used to wailing and lamenting aloud, they would tear off their garments, dig their nails into their cheeks, slap themselves on the face and put up loud screams. This undesirable practice was from that day stopped for future)"

Nawasib such as Ibn al-Hashimi will no doubt take heart from the last few lines so let us pass a comment on them:

139.Observation One

Whilst these words are not acceptable for being contradictory to previous lines of the narration, our readers should also know that the words 'it is not permissible to lament in memory of the dead' is an addition that cannot be found in other history books. Al Muhaddith Shah Abdul Haqq Dehlavi in Madarij un Nabuwat records the event as follows:

"When Holy Prophet (s) reached Madina, he saw that cries could be heard from most of the houses of Ansaar (the helpers) but not from Hamza's house. Holy Prophet (s) said that wasn't there anyone to cry over Hamza? The helpers (Ansaar) asked their women to mourn over Hamza first and then they may go and cry over their own martyr. The women went to Hamza's house in the evening and kept crying till midnight. When Holy Prophet(s) woke up and asked about it, he was told the whole thing. Holy Prophet(s) blessed them by saying" May Allah be pleased with you and your children."

It has been similarly recorded in 'Isti'ab' that after Holy Prophet's query, **"none of the wives of the helpers cried over their own dead but cried for Hamza",**

Therefore through no tradition, reference or logic can it be proved that Holy Prophet (s) stopped Ummah from crying over the death of their dear ones.

140.Observation Two

Our assertion that the words "It is not permissible to mourn over the dead" is a later addition is confirmed when we observe the first edition of Shibli Numani's work. We relied on the Urdu to English translation of Numani's work. Of interest is the fact that the part in brackets wherein the practice of mourning is condemned was added in later editions. The original statement as narrated in the first edition is mentioned above. Look at this report from "Seerat Un Nabi" part 1, page 361, published in 1975 by "Deeni Kutb Khana Islami, Lahore."

"Holy Prophet (s) reached Madina, the whole of Madina had turned into a mourning place, his Excellency could hear voices of people mourning from every house, and Holy Prophet (s) felt grieved that all martyrs were being cried upon by their relatives but there was no one to mourn over Hamza. In severe grief he said: "Isn't there anyone to cry over Hamza?" The Helpers (Ansaar) palpitated when they heard this and therefore all of them asked their wives to go and mourn over Hamza's

martyrdom. When Holy Prophet(s) saw that the females of Ansaar (the helpers) were mourning for Hamza, he blessed them and thanked them for their sympathy but he further said "It is not permissible to cry over dead."

After this a whole paragraph from "This was a tradition in Arabia" till "intense love for Hamza" has been removed from the frst edition and further replaced by this new statement. This is the ingenuity of Syed Salman Nadvi who completed this book of his teacher (Shabli Naumani) after his death. This new paragraph is not present in the first edition.

"Women in Arabia were used to wailing and lamenting aloud, they would tear off their garments, dig their nails into their cheeks, slap themselves on the face and put up loud screams. This undesirable practice was from that day stopped for future".

The Urdu/Arabic alphabet "seen" in the text denotes that this statement was not present in the earlier edition and Syed Suleman Nadvi added it afterwards. Later editions simply removed th 'Seen' so as to imply that these words were those of Numani!

141.Observation Three

Whilst this shows how dishonest these Nasibi are, let us also address the comments of Nadvi:

1. If Lamenting were Haraam why would the Prophet (s) be sad on the fact that no one was mourning his slain Uncle?
2. Why would the Prophet (s) allow the women to do something that is Haraam? (i,e mourning for their own dead ones)
3. If as Numani tells that this was a common practice amongst Arab women and the Prophet banned it, this prohibition would have definitely received maximum publicity.

142.Observation Four

Even if it is believed that Holy Prophet (s) did say 'It is not permissible to cry over the dead' such a statement would not effect our mourning because Imam Husayn (as) is a martyr and it is forbidden to call them dead. Such restrictions are for those who die a natural death not those who are slain in the way of Allah (swt).

143.Observation Five

The reference makes it clear that our Holy Prophet (s) paid gratitude to those who consoled and mourned over Hamza's martyrdom. He approved of this act and blessed them with his prayers. Had it been a prohibited act the Prophet (s) would never have shown gratitude. This gratitude strengthens our point that the words 'It is not permissible to cry over the dead' has no correlation with the incident. Rather Syed Suleman Nadvi amended the statements in order to cover up Allamah Shibli Numani's blunder.

The mourning of Hamza did not just end there; we have already cited the fact that the Holy Prophet (s) and the three Caliphs' would visit the graves of the martyrs every year.

The next tradition in effect negates any notion of the Prophet's (s) banning such acts…

144.Beating and mourning by the wives of the Prophet (s)

Curiously, not a single wife of the Prophet (s) ever heard of this ban (as claimed by Nadvi in the previous reference). On the contrary Ayesha regarded by Ahl'ul Sunnah as the most knowledgeable women on Qur'an and Sunnah performed the following act when the Prophet (s) left this earth.

As narrated by al Tabari in History Volume 9 page 183 (English translation by Ismail Poonawala):

Abbas narrates:

"I heard Ayesha saying "The Messenger of God died on my bosom during my turn, I did not wrong anyone in regard to him. It was because of my ignorance and youthfulness that the Messenger of God died while he was in my lap. Then I laid his head on a pillow and got up beating my chest and slapping my face along with the women".

Ibn Katheer al Nasibi in al Bidayah wa al Nihayah Volume 5 page 420 published by Nafees Academy Karachi records the event as follows:

"Rasulullah (s) died while he was in my lap. Then I laid his head on a pillow and got up beating my face along with other women".
Bidayah wa al Nihayah, Volume 5, page 420

Do we need to say anymore? Would the wives of the Prophet (s) indulge in a Haraam activity? Look at the beating ritual by the women of Madina. Ibn Katheer mentions how extreme that beating was that their faces reddened with slapping. What do the Nasibi say about these women? Were they evil Rafidi innovators lead by Ayesha?

According to Musnad of Imam Ahmad Hanbal Vol. 6, page 274, Ayesha mourned the demise of the Holy Prophet (s) with other women by beating her head.

145.Beating and mourning by Uthman's wives and daughter

We read in Tareekh Kamil Volume 3 page 89:

"When Uthman was killed his killers intended to sever his head. His wives Naila and Umm'ul Baneen lay over him screamed and began to beat their faces"

Narrations also record that Uthman's daughter also acted likewise. As evidence we shall rely on the following Sunni works:

1. Al Bidayah wa al Nihaya, Volume 7 page 371
2. Tareekh Tabari, Volume 6 page 302
3. Tareekh Aathim Kufi, page 159

"Ibn Jareer narrates that when the killer intended to sever Uthman's head, the women began to scream and strike their faces. This included Uthman's wives Naila, Ummul Baneen and daughter".
Al Bidayah wa al Nihaya, Volume 7, page 371

If the wives of Uthman can mourn Uthman's killing in this way then the Shi'a of Maula 'Ali (as) can likewise mourn the slaying of Imam Husayn (as) in this way.

146.The mourning of Fatima al-Zahra (as)

In Madarij al Nubuwwh, Vol 2, page 163, the high ranking Sunni Scholar, Sheikh Abdul Haq Mohaddith Dehlavi recorded that:

"Fatima Zahra (as) hearing the rumour of the martyrdom of the Holy Prophet (s) at Uhud came out of her house running and beating her head".

Does it not transpire from the above that beating of head during the act of mourning for a martyr is allowed by the religion as Sayyida (as) was well aware of the religious code and was also infallible according to Ayah Tatheer (33:33). In addition an action of any member of Ahl'ul bayt is a Sunnah for the Ithna Ashari Shi'as. Thus mourning is not bidah but is a Sunnah of Sayyida Fatima al-Zahra (as).

147.The mourning of Abu Hurraira

We shall rely on the following Sunni works:

1. Adaab al Mufarad, page 426
2. Sunan Ibn Majah, page 30

The narrator says that he saw Abu Hurrayra hitting his forehead and said 'o people of Iraq could you even imagine that I would lie about the Prophet?'

Abu Huraryra's act here was out of shock and distress. If this Sahabi can act in such a manner then no fault should be found with the Shi'a when they mourn the loss of Imam Husayn (as) by hitting themselves.

148.The mourning of Bilal (ra)

We read in Madarij al Nubuwah, Volume 2 page 441, whilst discussing the death of the Prophet (s):

"When the situation of the Prophet worsened, Bilal emerged beating his head and loudly wailing,'I wish my mother had not given birth to me, and that if she had I wish that I had died before this day'"

Why did Bilal fail to adopt patience, an act that the Nasibi deem compulsory? Was the Muazzin and loyal Servant of the Prophet (s) ignorant of the verses on patience? Even in this case none of the companions raised any objection at the action of Bilal. Moreover the Holy Prophet (s) was yet alive and not dead. This is the extreme extent of grief. Then how can similar action for Imam Husayn (as) be prohibited?

149.The extreme mourning of Uways al-Qarni (ra)

The most explicit proof of self-inflicted injury comes from Owais al-Qarni the great Muslim Sahabi, praised by both Shi'a and Sunni erudite. He had an immense love for the Holy Prophet (s). When the news reached him in Yemen that two teeth of the Holy Prophet (s) were broken in the battle of Ohad, he extracted all his teeth. When the Holy Prophet (s) got the news in Medina that Owais had struck down all his teeth, he (s) exclaimed, **"Indeed Owais is our devoted friend"**. This event can be found written in 'Seerate Halbia' vol II, page 295.

The renowned Sunni Scholar Shiekh Farid al Din Attaar in 'Tadhkhirah tul Awliya' Urdu

translation page 17 and 18 writes:

" Uways Qarni (ra) said to Umar Khattab (ra): 'If you were true in friendship than why on the day when the holy teeth of the Prophet (s) were broken didn't you break your teeth in companionship? Because, it is a condition of companionship.' Then he showed his teeth all of which were broken and said 'I broke all of my teeth without seeing you (O Prophet) and in the state of Ghaybah in your companionship. I had broken one tooth but couldn't get satisfaction so kept on breaking them one by one until I had broken them all '".

The episode can also be found at a Sunni website:
http://www.aghayiah.com/hazrat-oawis.htm

Comment

Had the breaking of teeth by Uways Qarni (ra) been in opposition to Shariah, Umar would certainly have pointed it out at the time or at least commented and answered the accusation by Uways Qarni (ra) of his less than perfect companionship. The silence of Umar proves that he didn't deem the act of breaking one's teeth as done by Uways Qarni (ra) as opposed to Shariah but considered it an act of sincerity and also a proof of friendship.

It is interesting that

> Ibn al Hashimi argues:
>
> In regards to the actual rituals of the Shia, these are barbaric practises of self-flagellation, violence, and paganism

Tell us, would Uways Qarni’ss destruction of his teeth with a blunt instrument not fall within your definition of ‘barbaric practises of self-flagellation, violence, and paganism’? If so, did the Prophet (s) agree with your view and condemn this extreme form of self harm?

We should point out that breaking one's teeth is a thousand times more painful than the beating of one's chest for a few hours. It is more extreme than chest beating with chains or knives (Zanjeer) because those who have suffered from tooth ache will understand the immense pain that circulates in the mouth and head. Compare the removal of a tooth to the forced removal of a full set of teeth without the benefit of modern day anaesthetics and instruments. The pain must have been unbearable. This was clearly an act of great courage.

150.Mourning following the death of Imam Ahmad ibn Hanbal

We shall rely on the following esteemed Sunni works:

1. Tareekh Baghdad, Volume 4 page 422
2. Hayaat al Haywaan, page 101

قال وسمعت الوركاني يقول يوم مات احمد بن حنبل وقع الماتم والنوح في أربعة أصناف من الناس المسلمين واليهود والنصارى والمجوس

'He (Abu Bakr al-Makki) said: 'I heard al-Warkani saying: 'The day on which Ahmad bin Hanbal died, in it 'Matam' and lamentation took place among four types of people, the Muslims, the Jews, the Christians and the Zoroastrians''.

The Muslims killed Ibn Hanbal and also mourned him. The same people accuse the Shi'a of

killing Imam Husayn (as) and mourning him for atonement. They acuse Shias for what has been their own practice.

If Matam is such an extreme sin, then why was such sin committed for this Sunni Imam?

151.Heavens mourning at the death of Umar!

We read in Riyadh al Nadira page 187:

"When Umar died the Djinns recited a elegy 'Umar female Djinns are mourning you in a loud voice and they are beating their faces'

If mourning in such a manner is Bidah then why was it necessary for the women of Paradise to mourn in this manner? If it was Bidah why do you think the Sunni scholars coined such a fabricated tale? When Umar died the women of Paradise beat their faces but if Shi'a women mourn the slaying of Imam Husayn (as) and his supporters, mutilation of their bodies and the imprisonment of their women folk they are deemed evil innovators.

152.Seven days of mourning of Khalid bin Waleed

We read in Kanz al Ummal Volume Six page 118:

"The narrator said people had attributed the prohibition of elegies to Umar, but the fact is that when Khalid bin Waleed died the women of Banu Mugheer indulged in seven days of mourning. They reddened their chests, wailed, food was distributed and elegies were recited. Umar did not place any prohibition on this mourning".

When Ahl'ul Sunnah's great hero dies elegies and self beating occurs under the watchful eye of Umar and he takes no remedial steps to quash this alleged Bidah. However when the Shi'a do the same in memory of Imam Husayn (as) the Nasibi' come out in force to oppose them.

153.An Arabs mourning before the Prophet (s)

Malik's Muwatta
Book 18, Number 18.9.29:

Yahya related to me from Malik from Ata ibn Abdullah al-Khurasani that Said ibn al-Musayyab said, "A Bedouin came to the Messenger of Allah, (may Allah bless him and grant him peace) beating his breast and tearing out his hair and saying, 'I am destroyed.' The Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, said, 'Why is that?', and he said, 'I had intercourse with my wife while fasting in Ramadan.' The Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, asked him, 'Are you able to free a slave?', and the man said, 'No.' Then he asked him, 'Are you able to give away a camel?', and the man replied, 'No.' He said, 'Sit down,' and someone brought a large basket of dates to the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, and he said to the man, 'Take this and give it away as Sadaqa.' The man said, 'There is no one more needy than me,' and (the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace), said, 'Eat them, and fast one day for the day when you had intercourse.' "

Worthy of note is the fact that Darr Qathani in his Sharh of Muwatta Volume 2 (this tradition) adds that that **'he was placing mud in his hair'**.

The incident should be considered in the light of the following facts:

1. The Bedouin being a Muslim was Sahabi (companion) of the Holy Prophet (s).
2. He was beating his chest and tearing his hair in presence of Holy Prophet (s) who neither objected to it nor reprimanded him for the same.
3. The action of the Bedouin was a result of spiritual pain he suffered as his fast was invalidated.
4. Sunni traditionists have authentically recorded this incident.

The Bedouin's actions were a direct result of the agony he was going through. It led him to beat, his chest, tear his hair and place dirt in his hair. We suggest to those who deem mourning for Imam Husayn (as) Bidah to look at these Rafidi acts that were performed in the presence of the Prophet (s). If it was Haraam why did not the Prophet (s) tell him to refrain from such actions?

154.Mourning at the time of Ayesha's death

In the Sunni Magazine Khadim al Deen, published Lahore on the 18th of October 1976 page 20, in the topic of Ayesha we read:

"People were saddened by the death of Ayesha; Masrooq said if certain situations had not arisen then I would have performed Matam for her.

Look at the preparations for mourning Ayesha's death. If mourning is a gate to hell why were the Sahaba making this road for themselves by desiring to mourn her loss in such a manner?

155.Islamic Law

When the Imam of a Fiqh permits an act, then it is not permissible for those of other Madhabs to raise their objections. We deem Ahl'ul bayt (as) our Imams and uphold their words. If they ruled on the permissibility of Azadari, then we care little what the Imams from Mu'awiyah and Yazeed's lineage have to say against it.

156.Imam Jafer (as) allowed the mourning of Imam Husayn (as)

We read a tradition from Wasail ai Shi'a as quoted in Jahaur aur Kalaam Volume 4 page 370:

"Imam Jafer said 'the daughters of Fatima would slap their faces and shriek. It is permissible to beat yourself and shriek for a pure soul such as Husayn"

157.The mourning of Banu Hashim

We read in Tareekh Kamil Volume 4 page 42

Umar ibn Sa'd appeared following the killing of Husayn, stayed for the night in Kerbala and then headed in the direction of Kufa. He was accompanied by Husayn (as)'s children and his sisters were also captives. When they passed by the bodies of Husayn and his companions, the women cried and slapped their faces. Zaynab said 'O Muhammad!'

158.Sayyida Zaynab (as) beat herself on three separate occasions

First Occasion

1. Al Bidaya wa al Nihaya Volume 8 page 176
2. Tareekh Kamil page 29

"When the enemy planned to attack the camp of Husayn, Zaynab went to Husayn and asked 'what is this noise outside our tents?' Husayn [ra] replied 'I just saw a dream wherein the Apostle of Allah told me that he would reach me by tomorrow. Upon hearing this Sayyida Zaynab became aggrieved and slapped her face"

Second occasion

1. Al Bidaya wa al Nihaya, Volume 8 page 177
2. Tareekh Kamil Volume 4 page 30
3. Tareekh Tabari Volume 7 Page 324.

"When Sayyida Zaynab listened to the verses from her brother that indicated his death, she mourned by beating her face, tearing her clothes and losing her senses by falling to the ground"

Third occasion

1. Al Bidaya wa al Nihaya Volume 8 page 93
2. Tareekh Kamil Volume 4 page 42
3. Tareekh Tabari Volume 7 Page 370.

Qurat bin Kas narrates that when the women of Bani Hashim passed by the battlefield they wept bitterly by beating their faces.

Dear readers! You have seen that even the prejudiced Ibn Katheer has accepted the mourning of Sayyida Zaynab (as) on the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as). Sayyida Zaynab (as) is the elder daughter of "Gate of knowledge" and the leader of the believers Imam Ali (as) and Sayyida Zahra (as) who is the daughter of Apostle of Allah (swt). The princess brought up by the great teachers of religion and trained in an atmosphere of learning and education cannot be ignorant of the Divine laws of religion. On seeing the calamities of the grandson of the Prophet (s), the mother of all calamities and woes, became impatient. She mourned on three occasions in Karbala. When the grand daughter of the Prophet (s) was brought into the city of Kufa as prisoner her calamity became more severe. When she saw the head of Imam (as) on the pointed end of lance, she stroke her head on the wooden part of the saddle in extreme grief and blood started flowing from her head.

159.Baba Fareed Ganj Shakar's self harm mourning for Imam Husayn (as)

Baba Fareed Ganj Shakar of Pak Patan is a major Sunni Sufi Saint. He commands thousands of adherents from the Indian Subcontinent. We read in the Sunni text From Uswa - e - Sufia Uzzaam, Page 8:

He used to lament and cry for Imam Husayn (as) on the day of Ashura so much so that he would fall unconscious. It is narrated from him that there was a saintly man in Baghdad and when the tragedy of Karbala was described to him, he cried so piteously and profusely and smashed his head so hard on the ground out of grief that he died! The same night, people saw him in their dream and enquired of his condition to which he replied: I gave up my life for the love of Ahl - e - Bait (as) hence Allah has pardoned me and I now live with Imam Husayn (as).

Comment

Is not the status of an Azadaar equivalent to that of a Martyr? This shows that self - flagellate with knives and swords, doing Matam and giving up one's life for the love of these Infallibles is a cause of redemption and pardon from Allah (swt).

160.The skies shed blood in grief of Imam Husayn (as)

Allamah Ibn Hajar Makki writes:

"Abu Said says that on the day of the martyrdom of Husayn, there was fresh blood found under every stone lifted; and the sky also rained blood whose result was evident on clothes for ages. Abu Naim says that on the day of the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as) our containers (of water) were full of blood."
Sawaiq al-Muhriqa, Page 192

It is written in Tafseer al-Jalalayn, on page 411, Annotation no.7 (Print. Karachi): Under "Fama Bakta Alaihim Sama" Sa`di has been quoted as saying:

"When the oppressed Imam was martyred, the sky wept on his martyrdom; the weeping of the sky is its being red and anger is the reason behind the bloody tears."

If Nasibi argue that such a notion is ridiculous then we suggest to him to consult Riyadh al Nadira page 193 [printed in Baghdad]:

"The narrator says that when Umar was murdered, the earth was covered with darkness. A child asked his mother, 'O Mother is it the Day of Judgment? The mother replied no son Umar has been murdered".

We appeal to justice! The earth was covered with darkness when Umar died and the Nasibi clergy have no objection to this narration since it refers to the death of one of their own. If the skies grieve over the barbaric massacre of the Ahl'ul bayt (as) then all manner of Fatwa is issued against us.

161.Examples of self-beating in the Bible

The Bible, Isaiah 22:12 - shows that this type of mourning was ordained by God

"On that Day the Lords called for weeping and beating the breast, shaving the head and putting on sack cloth"

"You are now at ease, be anxious; tremble, you who have no cares. Strip yourselves bare; put a cloth round your waists and beat yourselves"
The Bible, Isaiah 32:11

"Howl, Heshbon, for Ai is despoiled. Cry aloud you villages round Rabbath Ammon,

put on sack cloth and beat your breast and score your body with gashes"
The Bible, Jeremiah 49:3

"The crowd that had assembled for the spectacle, when they saw what had happened went home beating their breasts"
The Bible, Luke 23:48

We have in this chapter set out a vast array of evidences proving the legitimacy of hitting oneself and shedding blood, when mourning Imam Husayn (as). Those Nasibi who are against mourning for Imam Husayn (as) and for any of the martyrs of Karbala usually raise a question whether the Holy Prophet (s) had ordered mourning for Imam Husayn (as). The answer to this question is: 'did the Holy Prophet (s) order Owais Qarni (ra) to remove all his teeth? Did he insist that the Bedouin beat his chest? Did he order Bilal to beat his head? Similarly there was no order by the Holy Prophet (s) for Fatima (as) to beat her head at the rumour of his martyrdom in Uhud.

If there is absence of explicit permission then there is absence of prohibition also The reason for absence of such orders with regard to mourning is quite clear. These acts were all done out of love and sorrow and the Holy Prophet (s) had not forbidden them. According to the beliefs of Ahl e Sunnah, if the Holy Prophet(s) saw someone doing an act and remained silent on it, it meant that he approved of this act. This type of Sunnah, in their fiqh, is called *Sunnah Taqriri*.

It is quite clear that holding mourning of Imam Husayn (as) by means of Matam (chest beating) or Zanjeer (blood letting) is to give physical expression of sympathy for Imam Husayn (as). It expresses nothing but love and loyalty for the Ahl'ul bayt (as).

10.Putting dust in one's hair

162.Mourning and putting dust in head in grief of Husayn (as) is Sunnah of our Prophet (s)

It is stated in Sunan al Tirmidhi Volume 5 page 657:

Salma narrated: 'I witnessed Umm Salma in a weeping state. I asked her as to what made her weep. Salma replied: 'I have seen the prophet in such a state – in a dream- that his head and his beard were stained with dust. I said, 'Oh Apostle of God, what made you like this?'. He replied: 'I witnessed the killing of Husayn'''.

A similar dream was also witnessed by Ibn Abbas as recorded in al-Mustadrak, Volume 4 page 439:

Ammar said that Ibn Abbas said: 'One afternoon I dreamt of Holy Prophet (s) standing with his hair disturbed and with dust tangled in them and he was holding a phial filled with blood. I said to the Prophet: 'O Allah's prophet, What are you holding?' The Prophet (s) replied: 'This is the blood of Hussain and his companions that I have been collecting all the day long''. They did calculation and found out that he (Hussain) was killed a day before it (the day of dream)

*Both Imam Hakim and Imam Dhahabi stated: **'Sahih according to Muslim's standards'.**Albaani who also authenticated this in his book Mishkat al-Masabih, Volume 3 page 347*

There is anotrher version of this tradition which has been recorded by Imam Ahmed in his Musnad, Volume 1 page 424:

Ammar said that Ibn Abbas said: 'One afternoon I dreamt of Holy Prophet (s) standing with his hair disturbed and with dust tangled in them and he was holding a phial filled with blood. I said to the Prophet: "O Allah's messenger. What are you holding?" The Prophet (s) replied: "This is the blood of Hussain and his companions that I have been collecting all the day long."
Ammar said: 'I remembered that day, I came to know that it was the same day which he (Hussain) was killed'.

*Shaykh Shu'aib al-Arnaoot in the margin of this Hadith said: **'The chain is strong according to Muslim's standards'.** Shaykh Ahmad Muhammad Shakir in his Tahqiq of Musnad Ahmad, Volume 2 page 551 Hadith 2165 and in Volume 3 page 155 Hadith 2553 stated: **'Its chain is Sahih'.** Al-Haythami also recorded it and stated: **'Ahmad and al-Tabarani have recorded it and the narrators of Ahmad are narrators of Sahih.'** (Majma' al-Zawaid, Volume 9 page 194). Ibn Kathir in Al-Bidayah wal-Nihayah, Volume 8 page 242 stated: **'The chain is strong'.***

Ibn Hajar Makki al-Haythami has recorded both of these incidents i.e. one narrated by Umm Salama and of Ibn Abbas which can be read in:
Sawaiq al Muhirqah, page 642-643 published in Faisalabad

If Nawasib argue that the words of Rasulullah (s) in a dream are not authentic then we suggest to them to consider these words:

Abu Huraira narrates: The Prophet (pbuh) said: "Whoever has seen me in a dream has in fact seen me, for Satan does not appear in my form"
Sahih Muslim, Volume 4 page 1225 Number 5635

Whilst doubt can be entertained for a person who in this day and age would never be honoured to see the Prophet (s), this can't apply to her. There is no doubt that Salma [r] wife of the Prophet could recognise him.

163.Putting dust in head in calamities is the Sunnah of Umar

We read in Hilayah tul Awliyaa, volume 2, page 51:

The narrator says that the Prophet divorced Hafsa, the daughter of Umar. When this news reached Umar he put dust in his head and said 'now Umar has no respect in the Justice of Allah'.

We read in Ma'arij un Nubuwwa Part 4, chapter 5:

Hafsa had a reputation for her bad temper amongst the wives of the Prophet and this often shocked the Prophet (s). He divorced her and when Umar came to know this he wept and put dust in his head.

Divorce of a daughter is certainly a calamity for a father but the ethnic cleansing of Ahl'ul bayt (as) is a calamity that affected the entire Ummah. There is no objection to one's weeping on the divorce of his daughter and putting dust in his head. But objections are raised when Shias mourn and put dust in heads while hearing of the dead bodies of Ahle Bayt being trampled by the feet of horses, burning of their tents and captivity of their women.

Was Umar ignorant of the voices of 'patience' in the Qur'an? Can Nasibi cite any other father who has reacted in the same manner on divorce of his daughter? If they can't then why did their leader commit this act in such an extreme manner?

When Shi'a do this Mu'awiya's followers throw all manner of abuse at them and accuse them of violating the Shari'ah. Why do they remain silent when Umar performs the same act? When it comes to mourning Imam Husayn (as) these Mullah's will immediately declare gathering as illegitimate for being in contravention to Islamic regulations on patience, They utter whatever comes from their dirty mouths and at the same time they claim that they love Ahl'ul bayt (as).

Is it not funny that these Nasibi forget all the Qur'anic verses on patience when the kind, merciful and benevolent Prophet (s) divorces an ill tempered lady and Umar responds by weeping and placing dust over his head. But they have no shame issuing Fatwas against the Shi'a who weep, mourn and cast dust over their heads when grieving the grandson of the Prophet (s).

11.Seeking Waseela from the Saints (Awliya)

Here we shall show some proofs. A comprehensive analysis of the legitimacy of Tawassul is available in our article "Ya Ali Madad!".
Ya Ali Madad! (Tawassul)

"O believers fear God and seek a means of approach towards Him".

We have already proven in our article 'Ya Ali Madad' that such actions are permissible according to the Salaf.

164.Umar sought the Waseela of Abbas

We read in Sahih Bukhari, Kitab al Salat Volume 2, Book 17, Number 123:

Narrated Anas:
Whenever drought threatened them, 'Umar bin Al-Khattab, used to ask Al-Abbas bin 'Abdul Muttalib to invoke Allah for rain. He used to say,"O Allah! We used to ask our Prophet to invoke You for rain and You would bless us with rain. And now we ask his uncle to invoke You for rain. O Allah! Bless us with rain." And so it would rain.

Comment

The Deobandi and Salafi are opposed to seeking the Wasila of pious men when supplicating before Allah (swt). What they say is that you can only pray to Allah directly. The Qur'an does not support their assertion; on the contrary Allah (swt) tells the faithful to approach him via a Wasila. The Sunnis do not question Umar's praying to Allah in the name of Abbas. By the same token the Shi'a perform Azadari to express their love and sincerity towards Hadrath Imam Husayn (as) and deem him a means of approach towards Allah to ask Allah for his blessings.

On page 106 of Sawaiqh al Muhriqa, an esteemed Sunni work of Ibn Hajr, he whilst discussing the history of Damascus narrated the above-mentioned incident with some variation:

"When an intense drought occurred in 17th Hijra, Umar knocked on the door of Abbas bin Abdul Muttalib. Abbas asked who it was and he replied Umar. Abbas asked what brings you here? Umar said 'We want to pray for rain via your intercession'. Abbas asked him to sit then he gathered Banu Hashim and asked them to wear nice clothes and perfume. They came out in grandeur with Ali walking before him, Imam Hassan on his right side and Imam Husayn on left, the other bani Hashim followed him. Hadrath Abbas said to Hadrath Umar that no outsider should mix with them".

We appeal to justice.

Umar could not reach Allah without the mediation of Abbas and Abbas could also not reach Allah without Ali bin Abi Talib (as) and his pure progeny. It is therefore concluded that no one, whether he is the uncle of the Holy Prophet (s) or his father in law or some other relative, a companion or an ordinary Muslim can reach Allah without the help and intercession of the Ahl'ul bayt (as).

165.Imam Hanbal's shirt

On page 101 of Ahl'ul Sunnah's esteemed work, Hayat ul Haywaan, we read the following:

"Imam Shafiyee sent a man named rabbi with a letter and he came to Ahmad bin Hanbal in Baghdad. Imam Ahmad Hanbal gave his shirt to him. When he came back to imam Shafi the latter ordered him to wash the shirt and bring its water to him. When the water was brought to him imam Shafi poured it over his body."

Comment

Imam Shafiyee pours the water containing the perspirations of the shirt of Imam Ahmad Hanbal and it is a source of blessing for him. But if someone kisses the soil where Imam Husayn (as) was martyred there is a hue and cry about Biddah.

166.Visting the Graves of Saints

Renowned Sunni scholar Allamah Nooruddin Samhodi who authored a detailed history of Madina known as Wafa al Wafa, quotes Holy Prophet (s) to have said:

"A person who visits the graves of his parents on every Friday will have his name listed with the saints and pious people."
Wafa al Wafa, Volume 2 page 413

He has also reported this tradition from Ayesha:

"A person who visits the grave of his brother will have the dead get attached to him."
Wafa al Wafa Page 404

When a person attains rewards for visiting the graves of ordinary Muslims and his kin, then one can not even imagine the rewards for visiting the grave of Allah's beloved and the Holy Prophet 's (s) dearest Imam Husayn (a.s).

Another commentin Wafa al Wafa page, 446 is as follows:

"To visit the graves excessively and to stay at the graves of the bearers of virtue and safety is desirable."

If it is desirable to visit and stay at the graves of ordinary pious and virtuous men, then there is no doubt that Imam Husayn (as) is the source and fountain of virtues and bounties, what would be the reward for performing pilgrimage to his shrine?

We also read in Wafa al Wafa, page 413:

"Performing pilgrimage to the graves of the Prophets, the righteous', the Tabi'een, the Scholars and other saints has always been a famous method of earning blessings. Imam Ghazali has said that someone who visits a Saint to earn blessings should (upon the death of the Saint) visit his grave in order to earn blessings, and it is permissible to travel for this cause."

Allamah Shaykh Shiblanji in Noor ul Absaar, page 178, published in Egypt stated:

Allama She'rani has stated in the tenth chapter of the book Sunan: "Out of those things in which Allah has bestowed favours on me, to the extent I can, I perform pilgrimage to the graves of those from the progeny of Holy Prophet (s) who are buried in Egypt. Whether one attends the graves of the Progeny of the Holy Prophet (s) I perform this pilgrimage thrice a year with the intention of repaying and fulfilling the rights of the blessings of the Prophet (s). [Because the Ahl'ul Bayt are

the progeny of the Holy Prophet (s) the act of going to their graves shall repay my debts to the Holy Prophet (s) on me]. And I see none of companions to care for this remuneration, either because they all are unaware of the places where the Ahl 'ul Bayt (as) are buried or they think that they were not at all buried in Egypt, but this is due to the ignorance because in these cases it is enough to follow the intuition."

... "Sayyed Aa'la al-Khawaas used to end the process of performing pilgrimages to the shrines of the Ahl'ul Bayt with the pilgrimage to Imam Shaf'i's grave. Hence it is obligatory for every Muslim to visit the graves of the relatives of the Holy Prophet (s) and give priority during pilgrimage by attending the shrines of Ahl'ul Bayt over the pilgrimage to the shrines of the Saints buried in Egypt. Some people visit the graves of Sufi's who were lost in meditation and also sleep in the places they were born, but you refrain for it so that you may be guided."

Imam Ghazali in Ihya-ul-Uloom, volume 4, page 272, (published in Lucknow) writes:

"The pilgrimage to the graves is desirable by all means, because it makes one remember the hereafter and it recalls the admonitions. And visiting the graves of pious people is desirable and it brings blessings and auspiciousness. Initially the Holy Prophet (s) prohibited the pilgrimages to graves but permitted it later.

...The Holy Prophet (s) performed the pilgrimage to his Mother's grave along with a thousand armed horse-men. He was never seen to cry as much as he cried that day."

... "Once Ayesha was seen by the narrator returning from the graveyard, he asked her that where had she been to. Ayesha replied that she had visited her brother Abdul-Rehman's grave. The narrator asked if it was not prohibited by the Holy Prophet (s). She replied that initially he had asked to abstain from it but allowed it later on."

... "After burying the corpse, it is desirable to recite the funeral instructions (Thalqeen) and also to pray for him."

167.Weeping and performing Prayers over the graves of martyrs

Imam Hakim records:

Salman ibn Dawud - Ja'far ibn Muhammad - his father (Muhammad ibn Ali) - Ali Ibn Husayn - his father (Ali ibn Abi Talib): 'Fatima daughter of the Holy Prophet used to visit the grave of her uncle Hamza every Friday and used to pray and weep there'.
Mustadrak al-Hakim, Volume 3 page 424 Hadith 1345

*Hakim stated about this Hadith: **'All the narrators of this hadith are Thiqah'.** Moreover Shaykh Sirajuddin Umar bin Ali al-Shafiyee (d. 804 H) popularly known as Ibn al-Mulaqan said: **'Sahih or Hasan'** (Tuhfat al-Muhtaj, Volume 2 page 33)*

Allamah Noor al Din Samhodi states:

"Fatima (r) visited the grave of the Holy Prophet (s) and stayed there, then picked a handful of sand from her father's grave , smelled it and wept and recited a couplet which is translated as a person who smells the sand of Holy Prophet's (s) grave and then does not smell any other fragrance throughout his life, what would be the loss to him [because the fragrance of the sand of Holy Prophet's (s) grave would be enough for him and no other fragrance can match it.] She further said that she had been given so much trouble and hardships that the days would have converted to

nights had such hardships been burdened on anyone else."
Wafa al-Wafa, volume 2, page 244

Imam of Ahl'ul Sunnah Shaikh Abdul Qadir Jilani, in his famous book, Ghanyatul Talibeen, page 64 writes:

"It is reported from Hasan Basri that the Caliph Sulayman bin Abdul-Malik dreamt that the Holy Prophet (s) congratulated him and treated him with affection. Hasan Basri interpreted his dream to suggest that he may have carried out a noble deed to the Holy Prophet'(s) Progeny. The Caliph Sulayman affirmed this and said that he had found Imam Husayn's holy head in Yazeed's treasury; he covered it with 5 pieces of expensive cloth and offered his funeral prayers along with a group of his companions. Imam Hasan Basri told the Caliph that it was due to this that the Holy Prophet (s) was pleased with him. The Caliph was delighted and rewarded Imam Hasan Basri accordingly. It is also reported by Hamza ibn e Dhiyaat that he had seen the Holy Prophet (s) and Ibrahim (a.s) in his dream both of them were offering prayers next to the shrine of Imam Husayn"

Allamah Samhodi writes:

"The Caller of prayer (Muezin) Bilal was also amongst those who travelled from Syria in order to perform the Ziyarah of the Holy Prophet (s).

... Bilal was in Syria, when he dreamt the Holy Prophet (s) asked why he was being so discourteous by failing to visit Madina to offer pilgrimage. On this Bilal got scared and depressed and immediately made his way to Madina. When he got there, he offered pilgrimage to the Holy Shrine of the Prophet (s) and kept crying and rubbing his face. In the meantime Hasan and Husayn reached there. Bilal started kissed and hugged them both. These two princes wished to hear the Adhan he used to recite during the times of the Holy Prophet (s) in his Mosque. Bilal fulfilled their wish and started reciting Adhan."
Wafa al-Wafa, volume 2, page 408

12.Creating and revering symbols (Sha'er Allah)

Verse 158 from Chapter Al Baqarah, The Cow:

"Verily, Safa and Marwa are among the signs of Allah"

Allama Imam Fakhruddin Razi of Ahl - e - Sunnah in his Tafseer Kabir with reference to the above Verse writes:

The Signs of Allah (Sha'er Allah) are to be revered and are to be paid with obeisance, veneration and meaning or whatever symbols and signs are made to represent which invoke remembrance of Allah and constitute Sha'er of Allah or Signs of Allah as He Himself gives an example of the Mounts of Safa & Marwa.
Tafseer Kabir, Vol. 2, Page 43

Comment

Since the love of Imam Husayn (as) is obedience to Allah then all Symbols, Monuments, Taaziyah, Zareeh, Zuljanah etc. that indicate love and attachment to Rasulullah (s) and his Ahl'ul bayt (as) are all Signs of Allah (swt) and they command respect. Showing disrespect to them or dishonouring them would be tantamount to shunning this Verse of the Holy Qur'an whether this insult is done by writing or spoken by the tongue!

There is Verse 2 from the Chapter Al Maidah:

"O ye who believe! Violate not the (sanctity of) the Monuments of Allah"!

If Budoon is Sign of Allah then certainly the image of a horse, cradle and standards are also Signs of Allah.

168.People who venerate Taaziyah are certain to get their sins erased by the blessings of the Holy Prophet (s)

We read in Sawaiqh al Muhriqa page 147

"When King Timur was on his death bed, his face suddenly turned black and his countenance grew horrible. When his situation improved, his soldiers and his relatives asked him about the strange happening. Timur replied: I saw Angels of Torture from Allah come to me to chastise & punish me; hence I trembled from fear and my face contorted and blackened. But all of a sudden, I saw the Holy Prophet (s) come near me and commanded the Angels to go away and declared "I have come to intercede on his behalf for his sins to be erased as he is the lover of my Progeny & my descendents"

This proves that one who venerates and sanctifies Taaziyah is a lover of the Holy Progeny & the descendents of the Holy Prophet (s) and this act is held in high esteem by him to the extent that he considers it as an act of beneficence & benevolence unto him. It is obvious that if Azadari had been Haraam, then the Holy Prophet (s) would not have come to intercede on behalf of a perpetrator of sins and forbidden acts!

We read in Surah Baqarah 002.248:

13.Street Processions (Juloos)

185.Year long processions using the shirt and beard of Uthman

The Sunni Imam Ibn Qutayba in Al-Imama wa Siyasa, vol 1, page 42 states:

"Naila (wife of Uthman), took the hairs of beard of Uthman, which were pulled out by Muhammad bin Abi Bakr. And she put these hairs in shirt of Uthman and ordered Naumaan Ibn Bashir to take them to Mu'awiya in Damascus".

In the same book, page 78, it is also written:

"One of the ambassador of Mu'awiyah told him: I have left 50,000 old people in such a state that they have made their beards wet with tears, while they are weeping after looking at the shirt of Uthman. And this shirt has been raised by them on the spears."

And in authentic Sunni book Al-Bidaya wa al-Nihaya, Volume 7 page 255, it is written:

فوضعه معاوية على المنبر ليراه الناس، وعلق الاصابع في كم القميص، وندب الناس إلى الاخذ بهذا الثأر
والدم وصاحبه، فتباكى الناس حول المنبر، وجعل القميص يرفع تارة ويوضع تارة، والناس يتباكون حوله

"Mu'awyia kept the shirt on the pulpit to let the people watch it and he attached the fingers to the shirt, the people started weeping around the pulpit and calling for revenge. Afterwards, it used to be placed and then removed for sometime from there. For a whole complete year people wept upon that shirt in this way."

Similarly we read in al-Kamil fi al-Tarikh, Volume 2 page 58::

وكان أهل الشام لما قدم عليهم النعمان بن بشير بقميص عثمان الذي قتل فيه مخضوباً بالدم بأصابع
زوجته نائلة إصبعان منها وشيء من الكف وإصبعان مقطوعتان من أصولهما ونصف الإبهام، وضع معاوية
القميص على المنبر وجمع الأجناد إليه فبكوا على القميص مدة وهو على المنبر والأصابع معلقة فيه،

"Numan bin Basheer went to the people of Syria holding Uthman's bloodied shirt in which he was killed and the severed fingers of his wife along with some part of palm. Mu'awiya placed the shirt on the pulpit and the soldiers were surrounding it and were weeping over the shirt for a while, the shirt was on the pulpit and the fingers were hanging from it."

These references make it beyond doubt that beard of Uthman was pulled with such force by son of Abu Bakr that it came in his hand. These hairs and Uthman's bloodied shirt were sent to Mu'awiyah in Damascus, who did a lot of 'Azadari over them. Sometimes they were kept on the Mosque pulpit, and at others they were raised on the spears and shown to the shell shocked Syrians. Processions wherein the shirt and hairs were paraded went on for an entire year. These Nasibis say that sitting in sorrow is restricted to one's wife, and even then it is restricted to the period of Iddah i.e. ONLY 4 months and 10 days. If this is the case then why did the son of Hinda and his sidekicks mourn Uthman for a complete year? Were they all wives of Uthman?

Let us not forget the comments of the learned advocate of Muawiya

> Ibn al Hashimi who insists
>
> Additionally, comemmorating Ashura with any special ritual would be adding to the faith of Islam, and this is Bidah. Bidah is considered part of Hell-Fire, and whoever invents a Bidah is

promised Hell-Fire as well.

Were these public processions under the auspices of Muawiya wherein Damascans were invited to mourn under Uthman's bloodied shirts and his wives fingers not acts of Bidah? Is Ibn al Hashimi prepare to deem Muawiya and all those participants innovators that shall burn in Hell?

It's very sad that these so called Muslims show sorrow for the killing of this 70 years Bani Umayyah tribesman but when it comes to mourning the family of the Prophet (s), who were slaughtered in state of thirst in Karbala, they become machines of issuing all manner of Kufr Fatwas against such acts.

14.The misuse of Shi'a texts to 'prove' that Azadari for Imam Husayn (as) is Haraam

186.Tradition One

The darling of the Nasibi movement Qadhi Mazhar Husayn in his book 'Ham Matam kyo nahee kartay' [Why do not we perform mourning] said:

Imam Ja'far Sadiq (as) has said that patience and hardships, both comes to the believer, hence on the appearance of hardships, he exhibit patience and adversities impatience comes to kafir hence on the appearance of adversities, he exhibits signs of Jaza'
Al-Kafi, Volume 3 page 223

Reply

The Nasibi does not know the true meaning of 'patience' - its is Nasibi perception that those who stay quite during grief and hardships and refraining from wailing and crying are considered patient. The reality is that wailing and crying does not negate the concept of patience while complaining and holding Allah (swt) responsible for the adversities during hardships constitutes impatience, i.e. commenting on an act due to a lack of knowledge is impatience.

The story of Musa (as) and Khider (as) mentioned in Qur'an serves as a proof for our notion. As Musa (as) asked Khider (as) that He wanted to go with him and wanted to learn the things which Khider (as) had learnt from Ilm-e-Ladunni. Khider (as) told Musa (as) that He didn't possess patience and how would he endure a matter that he lacked knowledge of. Prophet Musa (as) told him that "Inshallah", he will find Khider (as) enduring and would not oppose anything Khider (as) did. Despite this, when Khider (as) made an hole in the boat and Khider (as) said that hadn't, Khider (as) said he failed to maintain patience. The same reply was given to Musa (as) by Khider (as) when he (as) commented on the killing of servant by Khider (as). The verse proves that lack of 'Sabr' involves commenting on mater that you lack knowledge of.

In the eyes of Ulema, the definition of patience is that the 'self' shall not indulge in an unsound act. True patience is that exhibited in war, and refers to not fleeing the battlefield.

The terms 'Sabr' [patience] means not to complain about Allah (swt) before any other than God. We have the example of Prophet Yaqub (as) who maintained this high level of patience even after his lamentation. as he complained about his adversities to Allah (swt) as we have already mentioned.

Unless someone issues a complaint at adversities to persons other than Allah (swt), merely weeping and chest beating does not fall under the category of impatience.

The tradition makes no reference to the prohibition of mourning etc rather the condition of two classes are being discussed that a believer is he who stands firm on his iman and his endurance is unshakable whilst a Kâfir complains and holds Allah responsible for his calamity and suffering and hence shows impatience.

During the pre Islamic era, it was the tradition of these people to wail and cry at adversities blaming all on Taqdir, they would recite poetry wherein they commented on the wisdom of Allah and how they exhibited impatience. The same thing has been mentioned in this tradition. To advance a weak Hadeeth and twist in effort to prove that mourning for Imam Husayn (as) is Haraam is fitting of these Nawasib.

187.Tradition Two - The Definition of Jaza

Jabir said: 'I asked Abu Jaffar (as) about the grief (Jaza). He replied: 'The climax of grief is to scream and woe, beating the cheek, face, chest and pulling the hair. Whoever made a mourning assembly verily he abandoned patience and followed the other way but whoever was patient and mentioned Allah and praised him, verily he is pleased by Allah's will, therefore he will be rewarded by Allah. But whoever doesnt do this, he will be judged and he is condemned and Allah will not reward him'
Furu e Kafi, Volume 1 page 121
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 79 page 89

Reply One - The tradition has been graded as weak

Allamah Majisi in his book Mirat al-Uqool, Volume 14 page 181 has declared it a weak tradition.

Reply Two

Even for the sake of discussion we suppose the tradition was authentic, than the only meaning which we get from this is to mourn while going out of the mentioned limits is impatience and illegitimate. In pre Islamic age people during the adversities and when confronted by clamities, used to wail and cry and create poetries based on inappropriate words for Allah (swt) and the condemnation we just read in the tradition is for the very absurd customs. But in the Azadari of Imam Husayn (as) maintains the high prestige of Allah (swt), we don't commit any blasphemy against Allah (swt) and our lamentation would not be defined by our Imam (as) as Jaza. When it comes to Imam Husayn (as) such mourning is valid and legitimate! The Shi'a do not conduct Azadari for ordinary people, we reserve it for Imam Husayn (as), these acts are in accordance with dictates of the Qur'an and Sunnah.

188.Tradition Three

Abu Abdullah (as) narrated that Allah's messenger (s) said: 'When a Muslim hits his thighs during the time of adversities, his reward is destroyed'.
al-Kafi, volume 3 page 224

Reply

Allamah Majisi in his book Mirat al-Uqool, Volume 14 page 183 has declared it a weak tradition. On the contrary, we read the following statement which is considered to be the words of Imam Abu Abdullah [as]:

وقد شققن الجيوب ولطمن الخدود الفاطميات على الحسين بن علي عليهما السلام، وعلى مثله تلطم الخدود وتشق الجيوب.

"The Fatimi women tore the front opening of their shirts and beat their cheeks over Hussain bin Ali (as) and to do this for some one like him, it is permissible to beat the cheek and tear the front opening of the shirt".
Tahdib al-Ahkam, Volume 8 page 325

Moreover we read in authentic Sunni work Mishkat al Masabih that when an adversity affects a Muslim, he suffers from despondency, even if he is injured by a thorn, Allah (swt) will eliminate his sins for him. Sunni traditions also record the act of our Prophet (s) striking his 'thighs' which means this was his Sunnah, hence this tradition means nothing to us.

189.Tradition Four

Amro bin Abi al-Miqdam narrated that Abu Jaffar (as) said: 'Do you know the meaning of Allah's statement *'{ and will not disobey you in what is good }'*? I replied: 'No'. He said: 'The Prophet (s) said to Fatima (as): 'If I died, do not strike your face, do not open your hair, do not scream and woe, do not invite the women to recite elegies and cry loudly''.
Al-Kafi, Volume 5 page 527

Reply One

This tradition is also weak. Please see Mirat al-Uqool, Volume 20, Page 358.

Reply Two

Had Prophet (s) prohibited Fatima al-Zahra (as) than she would have not lamented and mourned after Prophet (s)'s death. We read in Al Bidaya Wal Nahaya volume 5, page 243:

"When Prophet (s) died on the bed and the women who were around him (s) had made their faces red by beating their faces."

If beating the faces was prohibited by Prophet (s) then why were those women opposing the instructions of Prophet (s)? It is obvious that Prophet (s)'s daughter Fatima Zahra (sa) was among those women she would have at least refrained from this Haraam act and instructed the other women to stop.

190.Tradition Five

Ibn Baboya has recorded from Imam Mohammad al-Baqir (as) that the Holy Prophet (s) bequeathed Fatima (sa) in following words.

"Fatima! When I die, don't gripe your hair due to my separation, don't disturb your hair and do not lament and do not mourn and do not call females who lament and scream."
Jalaliyun (Urdu translation) part 1, page 67, Published in Lucknow

Reply

This tradition is the translation of the same tradition of al-Kafi which we discussed previously and which according to Shaykh Majlisi is a weak tradition [Mirat ul Uqool, Volume 20, Page 358].

Had the Holy Prophet (s) prohibited Fatima (sa) from the above mentioned acts, she would have never insisted on them and would have never preformed them, but besides the Shi'a books, even the Sunni books quote that Fatima (sa) cried, lamented and mourned over her father's death. We read in Mishkat , Bab al Karbaat Fazal, Volume 1, page 336 that Fatima Zahra (sa) recited the a complete elegy that can also be found in Sahih Bukhari, Volume 2, page 641. Shiekh Abdul Haq Muhadith Dehalvi while mentioning the grievious atmosphere after Prophet’s death recorded in his authority work Madarij un Nabuwat, Volume 2 pages 753-754 (Madina Publishing Co. Karachi):

“**After the burial of the Prophet [s], the companions in a state of sorrow were virtually throwing dust of yearning and shame over their lives and living, and were**

burning and crying due to being separated from their beloved of the world and the hereafter. Especially Fatima [ra] was the most aggrieved, the loneliest and was crying and wailing the most, she was looking at the faces of her sons Imam Hasan [ra] and Imam Hussein [ra] and was crying at their plight and herself being orphaned. At the other side Ayesha in the same apartment where Holy Prophet [s] had passed away, was continuously crying and wailing. Days and nights the voices of crying and mourning rose from this house which became house of grief [Bait ul Huzn] and separation."

Madarij un Nabuwat, Volume 2, Page 753 & 754

191.Tradition Six

Imam Husayn (as) said to Lady Zaynab (as) at Karbala:

O' Sister! By the right that I have on you. Be patient on my separation, and when I get killed do not beat yourself and do not gripe your hair, you are the daughter of Fatima e Zahra (sa), show patience the way she showed on the death of Holy Prophet (s).
Jalaliyun (translated) Chapter of 'Qazaaha e Karbala' page 382

Reply One

This is one of the traditions of "Ahaad" (Plural of Ahad, which means one). There no such comprehension or perception in 'Jila ul Ayoon' the compiler of Jila ul Ayoon himself has mentioned on the very first page that there are some weak references in this book, other then that we can perceive that these words have been said for consolation.

Reply Two - The same text has traditions wherein Sayyida Zaynab (as) mourned the loss of her brother

Had mourning (Azadari) not been permissible, the Ahl'ulbayt (as) would have never performed it. Its also quoted in 'Jila ul Ayoon' that after Imam Husayn's (as), Zaynab (sa) and Ume e Kulthum (sa) mourned, lamented and recited elegies. Its also stated that when Zuljanah (Imam's holy horse) came back towards the tents of the caravan, Um e Kulthum beat her head with her hands and repeatedly said **"O' Mohammad!(s)"**.
From: Jila ul Ayoon Page 207

Its is further said that when Zaynab (sa) saw Imam Husayn (as)'s holy head, she hit her forehead to the camel's saddle and it started bleeding, and she lamented.
Jalaliyun, page 311

It's also said that When Zaynab (sa) saw Imam Husayn (as) head in the court of Yazeed she took off her veil, and lamented in a unbearable manner and said **"Oh! Husayn, Oh! Husayn."**

Reply Three

But these are Shi'a traditions, now lets provide references from Sunni books because if we give reference from 'Maqtal e Muhnaf' you would call it Shi'a, and if we give reference from 'Yanabi al Muwaddat' you would call it unauthentic, therefore have a tradition from your beloved Imam Ibn Katheer. He states that:

When the forces of Yazeed planned to attack the camp of Imam Husayn, Zainab came to Imam Husayn and asked that why was there so much noise outside their

tents, Imam replied that I just dreamt of Holy Prophet (s) and he said that you will be meeting me tomorrow, hearing this Zainab started crying and hitting herself on the face.
Al Bidaya wal Nahaya Volume 8, Page 176, printed in Beirut

In the same book a bit further it is mentioned that:

Zainab heard the elegies from Imam, reflecting the tragedy of Karbala and the Martyrdom of Imam Husayn she cried, lamented and beat herself on the head until she fainted.
Al Bidaya wal Nihaya Volume 8, Page 177, printed in Beirut

Now the point is that Zaynab (as) performed these acts twice in the presence of the Imam Husayn (as) himself, and he didn't stop her from doing that, which means there was nothing wrong with lamentation.

192.CRITICISM: Sayyida Zaynab (as) was prohibited to mourn by Imam Husayn (as)

Reply

In Minhaj al Sunnah, Volume 4 page written by Ibn Tamiyah in his discussion on the verses in the Cave, he says the terms 'La-takhzun' (an order not to do some thing) is not always used to prohibit an action but it can also be used for consolation and satisfaction.

If Ibn Tamiyah al-Nasibi takes the Quranic order not to weep, as a consolation, for this forty year old man, then the same applies to Sayyida Zaynab (as) who was after all a modest lady. Her brothers, sons and relatives had been martyred brutally by the ancestors of the present day Nawasib, she was in a far off unfamiliar land, and had been taken as a prisoner, surrounded by enemies, there was only one male member in the house left and he was also preparing for his martyrdom. If under these circumstances Imam Husayn (as) had ordered Sayyida Zaynab (as) not to weep then this order was not an compulsory order but it was for her consolation and satisfaction as appears in the following verses of Quran:

wa la-takhzun alay him wa la tak fee zaka mima yum koroon
"And grieve not for them and be not distressed because of what they plan" *(027.070)*

This order (not to be disappointed) descended as a source of consolation.

If we compare the circumstances faced by Sayyida Zaynab (as) and Abu Bakr then there is a world of difference between the two. Let us give an example:

"A young teenager is killed in a road accident. Friends and relatives attend the home of the deceased sop as to console his parents. The mother of the child is completely overcome with grief she is slapping her face, wailing, in such circumstances it is common in Muslim culture her elders to comfort he, embrace her and tell her to calm down, stop crying"

The action of these elders does NOT mean that her mourning is Haraam; they are simply saying this to console her. Similarly, the order of the Imam Husayn (as) under the given circumstances was for consolation and satisfaction of Sayyida Zaynab (as) because dead bodies of all her family members were in front of her and these include the bodies of her sons, brothers and nephews and she was in a state of journey and nobody intimate and beloved was left alive.

On the other hand Abu Bakar was a male, he was sitting in a safe place in the company of

Apostle of Allah, all his family was safe in his native area, no dead body of any of his beloved was in front of him, under these circumstances act of weeping was timidity for a male so if such a man was asked "not to weep" then it was not for his consolation and satisfaction but it was to act upon in true sense.

In the same way a very biased historian Ibn Katheer states that after the martyrdom of Imam Hussain [as], Umer Ibn Sa`d dispatched the women who were in the camps of Imam Hussain [as]:

"**..They were made to sit on the camels, when they passed by the battlefield, they saw Imam Hussein (as) and his companions, the women started crying and shouting and Zaynab did Nudba for her brother and said:**

"O Muhammad (s)! O Muhammad (s)! May Allah and the angels on the heavens send blessings on you; Hussain (s) is lying on the ground blood-tangled with his organs cut-off, O Muhammad (s)! Your daughters have been made captives and your progeny is killed and lying on the ground with the wind blowing dust onto their bodies."

The narrator says: "By God! Zaynab made every friend and enemy cry."

Qarat bin Qais narrates that when the women passed by the killed, they cried and started hitting their faces.

1) Al Bidaya wal Nahaya, Volume 8, page 1091
2) Tareekh e Tabari, volume 7, page 370
3) Tareekh e Kamil, volume 4, page 42

The confirmation of a staunch Sunni and biased historian like Ibn Katheer is enough to cancel the lame evidences of Nasibis. Now if it is said that earlier two proofs of mourning (Azadari) were before the last will of Imam Husayn (as) then the example of mourning after the tragedy where Sayyida Zaynab (as) was also present is also mentioned above, reported from Qarat bin Qais. Further more in the books of both the sects the elegies are quoted which were recited by the women of Ahl'ulbayt (as) after the tragedy of Karbala. The lamentation and elegies of Sayyida Zaynab (as) and Sayyida Umme Kulthum (as) prove that it was never prohibited and Imam's will was just for consolation.

15.The stance of Ahlulbayt [as] regarding the commemoration of Ashura

We have until now produced number of Sunni evidences to prove that different rituals related to mourning are not exclusive to the Shia This in no way means that the Shia rationale for mourning the fallen Imam (as) is based upon the reliance of Sunni sources, as is the common argument of Sunni polemicists. When they are presented with evidence that Ayesha slapped her face along with other women on the death of Holy Prophet [s] they will respond:

- It was a sudden reaction to a fresh tragedy
- It was never commerated annually as the Shias do

Our reply to the first lame excuse is two-fold. Firstly, if beating oneself through sheer grief is a grave sin according to our opponents, then a sin is a sin whether practised once, twice or more. Do our opponents want to argue that Ayesha and all the other Sahaba committed the alleged sin of mourning at least once during their lives? Let us ask them, when did Ayesha or anyone they revere state that this CANNOT be done when one is grieving over past tragedies?

Secondly, to argue that one can commit the 'sin' of beating oneself when he or she is confronted with resh grief is also a feeble excuse, and is in fact lame conjecture. The reality is that when someone you love more than yourself dies, that too in a tragic manner, that grief / loss will always remain fresh, particularly if you are reminded of the tragedy, if you truly love that person, hearing / recounting the event will make you feel as if it has just happened. We Shias deem Ahlulbayt [as] to be our masters we hold them dearer than our selves, our families indeed everything, not just because we have been instructed to do so but also due to the spiritual affection we have with them [as], that is why whenever we hear the horrific tragedies that the ancestors of the present day Nawasib perpetrated against the Ahlulbayt [as], we find it hard to control ours emotions and thus as a natural reaction we will resort to beating our chests or heads. This reactions is because when we hear such atrocities, our heart goes out to the Imam (as) and his fallen comrades, we feel at one with them, it is as if the Imam (as) has just fallen, the grief once again becomes 'fresh'; the terminology/concept used by the Nawasib to defend Ayesha et al, becomes applicable here.

As for the excuse that none of these Sunni personalities commemorated the tragedy of Karbala on an annual basis, we should once again point out that whether they did or did not on annual basis or not is not our headache, none of these individuals stated that it CANNOT be done on annual basis. Our aim behind citing Sunni evidences was simply to prove that the ancestors of our opponents used to mourn as we do today. As far as commemorating the tragedy of Karbala on an annual basis is concerned, we are only concerned with the stance of the subsequent Imams of Ahlulbayt [as] who did just that without the time constraints, whether annually or not. Let us cite a few examples:

Imam Jafar [as] convened the mourning gathering for Hussain [as] and wept profusely

In Kamil al-Ziyarat by ibn Quluweyh, page 209 we read that gatherings to commemorate Imam Hussain [as] were conducted by Imam Jafar Sadiq [as] who would weep loudly over the same:

عن ابي عبد الله (عليه السلام)، قال: قال لي: يا ابا عمارة انشدني في الحسين (عليه السلام)، قال: فأنشدته، فبكى، ثم أنشدته فبكى، ثم أنشدته فبكى، قال: فوالله ما زلت انشده ويبكي حتى سمعت البكأ من الدار

Abu Amarah said: Abu Abdullah [as] said to me: 'O Amarah, recite elegy about Hussain [as]'. Thus, I recite a elegy and he cried, then I continued with the elegy and he cried'. By Allah I kept reciting elegy and he kept on weeping to the extent

that a weeping voice could be heard from the house'.

We also read:

عبد الله بن غالب، قال: دخلت على ابي عبد الله (عليه السلام) فأنشدته مرثية الحسين (عليه السلام)، فلما انتهيت الى هذا الموضع: لبلية تسقو حسينا * بمسقاة الثرى غير التراب فصاحت باكية من وراء الستر: وا أبتاه

Abdullah bin Ghalib said: 'I went to Abu Abdullah [as] and recited an elegy about Hussain [as], when I come across this part "irrigating Hussain with sand" a woman from behind the curtain cried and said: 'O father'.

The nature of Imam Hussain [as]'s martyrdom over the other martyrs of Ahlulbayt [as]

In Elal al-Sharaei by Shaykh Seduq, Volume 1 pages 225–226 we read that the day on which Imam Hussain [as] was martyred is considered to be more grievous than the martyrdom dates of the other members of Ahlulbayt [as]:

Abdullah bin al-Fadhl al-Hashimi said: 'I said to Abu Abdullah Jaffar bin Muhammad al-Sadiq [as]: 'O son of Allah's messenger (S), how come the day of Ashura is the day of ordeal, sadness, mourning and weeping but not the day on which Allah's messenger (S) died and the day on which Fatima [as] died and the day on which Amirul Mumineen [as] was murdered and the day on which al-Hassan [as] was murdered via poison?'

He (Imam Jaffar) replied: 'The day of Hussain is worse than the other days because the people of the cloak honored by Allah almighty were five, when the prophet passed away, Amirul Mumineen, Fatima, Hassan and Hussain [as] remained behind, they were hence a consolation for the people. When Fatima al-Zahra [as] passed away, Amirul Mumineen , Hassan and Hussain remained as a consolation for the people. When Amirul Mumineen [as] passed away, Hassan and Hussain remained as a consolation for the people. When Hassan [as] passed away, Hussain remained as a consolation for the people. When Hussain [as] was killed no one amongst the people of the cloak remained behind for the people, therefore his departure was tantamount to all of them departing and his existence was tantamount to all of them existing, therefore his day became a great ordeal'.

Regarding those who recite elegies at the atrocities committed by the forefathers of the present day Nawasib against the Ahlulbayt [as], Imam Sadiq [as] said:

"All praise be to Allah, who has placed amongst the people, those who arrive in our presence, eulogizing us and reciting elegies about us"
Wasail al-Shia, Volume 10 page 469

Merely imagining the martyrdom of Imam Hussain [as] and his companions would reduce Imam Zain al-Abdeen [as] to tears

Imam Zain al-Abdeen as-Sajjad [as] said:

"Verily whenever the martyrdom of the children of Fatimah [as] comes to my mind I become choked up with tears "..
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 46 page 109

Imam Raza [as] convened the mourning gatherings for Hussain [as] during the month of Muharram

Once Imam Raza [as] said to De'bil, a poet sincerely devoted to the Ahlulbayt [as]:

"I desire that you recite for me poetry, for surely these days (of the month of Muharram) are the days of grief, that have passed over us, Ahlulbayt"..
Mustadrak al-Wasail, Volume 10 page 386

Whenever food was placed before Imam Zain ul Abdeen [as], he wept for Imam Hussain [as]

Imam Sadiq [as] said:

"As for Ali Ibn al-Husain [as], he cried over Husain [as] for twenty years (after the tragedy of Kerbala); whenever food was placed before him he wept."
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 46 page 108

Imam Ali bin Abi Talib [as] wept for Imam Hussain [as]

Imam Baqir [as] said:

"Amirul Mu'mineen [as], along with two of his companions, happened to pass by Kerbala and as he did so, tears filled his eyes. He said (to them), "This is the resting place of their animals; and this is where their luggage shall be laid down; and it is here that their blood shall be shed. Blessed are you O' Earth, that the blood of the beloved shall be spilled upon you.""
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 98 page 258

Daily chores should be abandoned on the day of Ashura

We read in Elal al-Sharaei, Volume 1 pages 227:

Al-Hassan bin Fadhal said: 'Abu al-Hassan Ali bin Musa al-Raza [as] said: 'Whoever abandoned seeking to fulfill his needs on the day of Ashura, will have all his needs fulfilled by Allah in this life and the hereafter, and whoever considered the day of Ashura as a day of sadness and mourned and wept, Allah (swt) shall grant him happiness in the heavens via us'.

The extent of grief observed by the latter Imams [as] for the entirety of Muharram

Similarly Shaykh Saduq records in another book Al-Amali, page 190:

Ibrahim bin Abi Mahmood said: 'al-Raza [as] said: 'The people of Jahiliyah [pre-Islam period] used to prohibit war during the month of Muharam but our blood was shed during it and our children and women were made captives and our tents were

burned, our possessions were stolen and they didn’t respect the holiness of Allah's messenger, the day of Hussain shed our tears and humiliated our noble ones on the land of Karbala and would pass on sadness to us until the day of resurrection. On some one as Hussain the weepers shall weep, weeping shall erase the sins'.

Then he (Imam Raza) said: 'My father [as] never used to smile when the month of Muharam would arrive and sadness was visible on his face until the tenth day of Muharram. When the tenth day used to come, it was the day of his ordeal, sadness and weeping and that was the day on which Hussain [as] was killed'.

We read in Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 45 page 77:

Imam Ja'ffar al-Sadiq [as] said: 'The sky wept over al-Husayn [as] for forty mornings with blood, while the earth wept over him for forty mornings with darkness blackness. The sun wept over him for forty mornings with an eclipse and with redness, the mountains dispersed, the oceans poured forth, whereas the angels wept over him for forty mornings. No woman amongst us ever dyed with henna, nor used any oil, nor any kohl nor cohabited with her husband until the head of Ubaydullah ibn Ziyad was brought to us, and we are still aggrieved even after all that'.

The reward for expressing grief over the murder of Imam hussain [as] and his companions

Imam Raza [as] said:

" He who deems the day of A'ashura as a day of tragedy, who grieves and weeps, Allah (swt), The Glorious, shall make the Day of Judgment, a day of joy and happiness for him"..
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 44 page 28

Imam Raza [as] said:

"Those who weep should weep over the likes of Husain [as] for surely, weeping over him evaporates one's great sins".
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 94 page 184

Imam Baqir [as] also said:

"He who remembers us, or in whose presence, we are remembered, and (as a result) sheds eyes, even though they may be in the measure of the wing of a mosquito, Allah shall construct for him a house in paradise and make these tears a barrier between him and the fire (of hell)".
Al-Ghadeer, Volume 2 page 202

Similarly Imam Jafar Sadiq [as] said:

"There is none who recites poetry about Husain [as] and weeps and makes others weep by means of it, except that Allah makes Paradise incumbent upon him and forgives his sins".
Rijal al-Shaikh al-Tusi, page 189

Imam Sadiq [as] once said to Masma', one of the mourner of Imam Husain [as]:

"May Allah have mercy upon your tears! Do know that you are regarded as being of

those who are deeply concerned about us and of those who are happy at our happiness and aggrieved at our sorrow. Do know that you shall witness the presence of my fathers near you at the time of your death".
Wasail al-Shia, Volume 10 page 397

Imam Sadiq [as] said:

"The breath of one who is aggrieved upon the injustice and oppression subjected to us, is tasbeeh (glorification of Allah), and his grief for us, is i'baadat (worship of Allah) and his concealing our secrets, is jihad in the path of Allah." The Imam [as] then added: "This tradition ought to be written in gold".
Amaali by Shaikh al-Mufid, page 338

Imam Sadiq [as] while sitting on the prayer mat prayed for the mourners and those going for the ziarat of the Ahlulbayt [as] as follows:

"O' Lord, have mercy upon those eyes, which have shed tears in compassion for us; and upon those hearts, which have been restless and blistered for us; and upon those wailings, which have been for us."
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 98 page 8

And most importantly, the Holy Prophet [as] said to Fatimah Zahra [sa]:

"On the Day of Judgment, you shall intercede for the ladies and I shall intercede for the men; every person who has wept over the tragedy of Husain [as], we shall take him by the hand and lead him into Paradise."
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 94 page 192

Similarly the Holy Prophet [as] said:

"O Fatimah! Every eye shall be weeping on the Day of Judgment except the eye which has shed tears over the tragedy of Husain [as] for surely, that eye shall be laughing and shall be given the glad tidings of the bounties and comforts of Paradise."
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 44 page 193

The Holy Prophet [as] said:

"(On the Day of Judgment, a group would be seen in the most excellent and honourable of states. They would be asked if they were of the Angels or of the Prophets. In reply they would state): "We are-neither Angels nor Prophets but of the indigent ones from the ummah of Muhammad [s]". They would then be asked: "How then did you achieve this lofty and honourable status?" They would reply: "We did not perform very many good deeds nor did we pass all the days in a state of fasting or all the nights in a state of worship but yes, we used to offer our (daily) prayers (regularly) and whenever we used to hear the mention of Muhammad [s], tears would roll down our cheeks"."
Mustadrak al-Wasail, Volume 10 page 318

The reward of attending the gatherings wherein the ordeals of Ahlulbayt [as] are told

Imam Raza [as] said:

"He who sits in a gathering in which our affairs (and our path and aims) are

discussed and revived, his heart shall not die on the day (Day of Judgment) when hearts shall die (of fear)."
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 4 page 178

Similarly Imam Sadiq [as] once said to Fudhail:

'Do you sit together, talk and discuss amongst yourselves?' Fudhail replied:' Yes'. The Imam then said: 'I approve of these sittings. So keep our 'issue' (Imamate) alive. May Allah exhibit mercy on those who revive our issue and mission!'
Wasail al-Shiah, Volume 10 page 391

The pride felt by Ahlulbayt [as] at their Shia that share in their happiness and grief

Imam Ali bin Abi Talib [as] said:

"Surely, Allah has chosen for us followers (Shia), who assist us and are happy at our happiness and are sad at our sadness".
Ghuraral Hikam, Volume 1 page 135

Imam Ali [as] has referred to a natural and logical human phenomenon. When the one you hold dearer than you is happy, you rejoice when he is in hardship or grief or dies, you will not be happy nor will you remain indifferent, the human characteristic inside you will automatically plunge you in to the depths of grief. Thus, in light of Imam Ali [as]'s words, who are the ones that commemorate the grief of Ahlulbayt [as] and who are those that resent and oppose it.

Similarly we read that Imam Raza [as] once said Ibn Shabib:

"O Son of Shabib! If it makes you happy (and you desire) to be with us in the elevated ranks of paradise, then be sad at our grief and happy at our happiness."
Wasail al-Shiah, Volume 14 page 502

According to Holy Prophet [s], 'Mumineen' will never abandon their grief for Hussain [as]

"The Holy Prophet [s] said: 'Surely, there exists in the hearts of the Mu'mineen, with respect to the martyrdom of Husain [as], a fire that never extinguishes'."
Mustadrak al-Wasail, Volume 10 page 318

Even angels shall continue to weep for Imam Hussain [as] until the Day of Judgment

Imam Sadiq [as] said:

"Allah has appointed to the grave of Imam Husain [as], four thousand anguished and grief-stricken angels, who weep over him (and shall continue to do so) until the Day of Judgment".
Kamil al-ziyaraat, page 119

Isa [as] also wept over the killing of Prophet's grandson

Imam Ali [as] said to Ibn Abbas:

"(Once when he happened to pass by Kerbala), Isa [as] sat down and began to weep. His disciples who were observing him, followed suit and began weeping too, but not comprehending the reason for this behaviour, they asked him: "O' Spirit of God! What is it that makes you weep?" Isa [as] said: "Do you know what land this is?" The disciples replied: "No." He then said: "This is the land on, which the son of the Prophet Ahmad [s] shall be killed."
Bihar al-Anwar, Volume 44 page 52

193.Concluding the chpater

In addition to the natural instinct that compels us to lament over the tragedies that befell the Ahlulbayt, being their devoted adherents, the permission as well as the personal acts of the Imams of Ahlulbayt [as] taken towards mourning for Imam Hussain [as] and his companions is another reason for us to do so, particularly in the light of Hadith Al-Thaqlayn. Thus one can say that spiritually its our love and affection for Ahlulbayt [as] that automatically make us mourn for the tragedies befallen on them [as] and technically it is Hadith al-Thaqlayn that make us follow the stance of the subsequent Imams of Ahlulbayt [as] regarding the mourning over the oppression unleashed on Imam Hussain [as]. When our Imams (as) have given us the green light to mourn for our fallen Master we do not need any clearance certificate from any Nasibi mullah!

16.Refuting common Nasibi objections to Azadari

194.First Objection – Martyrdom should be celebrated not mourned

Why do the Shi'a deem the martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as) a tragedy, when it should be a happy occasion?

The slain leader of the Nasibi organization Sipah Sahaba, Azam Tariq in his famed 'Khutbah Jail' sets out a detailed attack on the Shi'a commemorating Imam Husayn (as)'s Shahadath by asserting that Muslims deem martyrdom to be a happy honour whilst Shi'a deem it a tragedy. Below, we will set out a vast array of responses.

Reply One – It is natural to mourn suffering

Whilst there is no doubt that Imam Husayn (as) should be praised for his exceptional bravery, patience and character at Karbala, the hardships he faced and sacrifices that he presented in the way of Allah (swt), is something worth crying and It is natural that commiserate with someone for his suffering and praise him for his success. Our Azadari fulfils both the requirements. It gives credit and appreciation for the success of the mission of Karbala and on the other hand we mourn the adversities and hardships faced by the progeny of the Holy Prophet (s) and their faithful companions.

All schools of thoughts unanimously agree that if a person faces hardships, persecution or death whilst carrying out a noble deed, his service should not be forgotten. The martyrdom of Imam Husayn (as) does not mean that the Shi'a should be happy rather than sad in Muharam.

Reply Two – It is natural to express grief at the plight of fallen heroes

During the Indo / Pak wars of 1965 and 1971 the entire Pakistani nation offered their respects to those killed. At the same time televised pictures of these ceremonies depicted images of relatives crying at the loss of their loved ones. This doesn't mean that they were unhappy at their bravery and success. The media showered praise on their bravery but also expressed grief at the huge sacrifice / loss of life that was undertaken in attaining this objective.

Reply Three – The Sahaba mourned when Umar was martyred

The Ahl'ul Sunnah believe that Umar was martyred, did the Sahaba rejoice at this happy occasion? Let us see the vivid picture painted by Ibn Abbas (ra) as recorded in Tareekh e Baghdad, volume 12, page 357:

"When Umar was assassinated, the people were so grieved that they left eating." Abbas [Ibn Abdul Mutalib] said 'The deaths of the Holy Prophet(s) and Abu Bakr were also great losses but we didn't leave eating, so even now we should eat' and after that he himself started eating and so did the other people."

Such was the tragedy that befell the Sahaba that the people abandoned eating, and it took the efforts of Ibn Abbas to console them and get them back into the eating mode again.

Along the same lines Wahaby scholar Waheed uz Zaman Haiderabadi stated:

"After the death of Umar, Uways Qarni mourned by saying Oh! Umar Oh! Umar Oh!

Umar"
Hadiya tul Mahdi, volume 1, page 23, Published in Delhi

If crying and mourning for a martyr is wrong then why did the Sahaba (including) Uways Qarani (ra) mourn for Umar?

- Did they think that he had failed to succeed in his Islamic duty?
- Did they think that he wasn't a martyr?
- Was their perception wrong?

Reply Four - Lady Hajra mourned when she heard of her son's pending death

Traditions record that Hajra fainted when she visited the spot where her husband intended to slaughter his son. Some of the narrators say that it was this very grief that gradually caused her death. Nasibi logic would dictate that Hajra should have been doubly happy because her son was alive and also got the rewards for succeeding in the examination - she should have kept praising Ismail (as), however, she was a mother and not a foe, the latter would have been happy at the hardships faced by her son and husband. It is natural that whenever a loved one is in trouble, or if he has faced hardships, it always causes pain and sorrow, hence those who love Imam Husayn (as) will mourn and cry and his enemies will praise their persecutors.

Reply Five – Mourning a martyr is part of one's innate nature

Worthy of note are the comments of Sunni scholar Khwaja Hassan Nizami who answered this question as follows:

"A very important question arises that if martyrdom is a blessing and it is something necessary then why cry and mourn for a martyr? What does it have to do with wailing and crying?" But this is not something which has no answer, A person who laying down his life for a noble cause feels no disappointment or grief at his death. However, its effect on the hearts of his relatives is a natural phenomenon provided they possess humanitarian instincts"
An Extract from journal of Shaheed e Karbala, arranged and compiled by Ibrar Ahmed Siddique.

Reply Six – Rasulullah (s) mourned those that were martyred

Many companions were martyred in the battles that took place during the time of the Holy Prophet (s) and of course all of them succeeded in their respective examinations. Hamza was named as the Lord of the Martyrs, and hence received a larger but rather than express joy at what his uncle had attained he cried and lamented over him and asked that the women of Quraysh to likewise.
1) Seerat un Nabi, volume 1, page 345.
2) Ma'arij al Nabuwat, Rukn 4, chapter (Bab) 6, page 123

Similarly we have already cited the incident where Holy Prophet (s) wept over the martyrdom of Jaffar Ibn Abi Talib (as). If mourning for a martyr is incorrect than what do Nawasib think about Holy Prophet (s)? The fact of the matter is that Prophet (s) himself gave best reply of the pathetic Nasibi belief for celeberating the martyrdom rather to mourn it.

The Holy Prophet (s) said : "Yes, Today Jafar has been martyred there, but the troubles and the plight that he went through before being martyred are very

grieving."
Al-Bidayah wa al-Nihaya, Volume 4 page 673

This proves that mourning and lamenting for a martyr was practiced by the Holy Prophet (s) and hence it is Sunnah of the Prophet whilst celebrating the loss of a martyr has no textual proof.

Reply Seven – One can never rejoice over the terrible suffering of the Ahl'ul bayt (as)

Whilst martyrdom is the sign of a great individual, it is also a time of reflection / sadness at an individual's suffering.

When our fourth Imam Zayn ul Abideen (as) was asked that which incident was of most pain to you during and after the Karbala? Imam (as) replied **"Shaam! Shaam! Shaam!"**

Although martyrdom is a high status a fact recognised by our Imams, the unveiling the daughters of Muhammad (s), making them prisoners and parading then bare head and foot through the streets of Damascus, is not a happy occasion, is this something that the Bani Hashim should be proud of? Should they rejoice at such humiliation?

195.Second Objection – You cannot mourn over someone that is alive

Imam Husayn (as) is alive so why do you do participate in mourning rituals for the living?

Reply – This exposes the hypocrisy of the Nawasib

Herein lies clear proof of Nasibi contradictions. When we debate on the concept of using the Imams (as) as a means of approach the same Nasibi object saying that you can't seek help from the dead!

Is this not a blatant contradiction! For these Nasibi Mullah there example is like that of a dog in Surah Araf 007.176

"His similitude is that of a dog: if you attack him, he lolls out his tongue, or if you leave him alone, he (still) lolls out his tongue. That is the similitude of those who reject Our signs; So relate the story; perchance they may reflect."

196.Third Objection – Shia rituals are a waste of money

Shi'a waste money and blood on this Day - why?

Reply – The Eid sacrifice should likewise be deemed a waste of money

At Mina on one day hundreds of thousands of goats are slaughtered and there meat often goes to waste, if its okay for such a waste of money on that day then why the objection to mourning for Imam Husayn (as)? If such spending at Mina is remember the event of Ismail (as) the Shi'a can also do the same on Ashura.

197.Fourth objection – Quran prohibits the visiting of graves

Allah has forbidden us to visit graves, as is clear from Surah Tauba, so why do the Shi'a create image depicting the grave of Imam Husayn (as)?

Reply – This prohibition refers to the graves of hypocrites

In this verse Allah has forbidden the holy Prophet (s) to go to the grave of a Munafiq. Hence a person who thinks that his parents or Imams are Munafiq should abstain from going to their graves and making their images.

198.Fifth Objection – Azadari is an unnecessary waste of public money

The Shi'a population give a lot of money to Ulama and Zakireen, that's why they are not speaking against this. If they don't get this money, then this Azadari will also come to an end.

Reply – Those that donate towards Azadari are duly rewarded by Allah (swt)

[Shakir 9:74] ... because Allah and His Messenger enriched them out of His grace; therefore if they repent, it will be good for them; and if they turn back, Allah will chastise them with a painful chastisement in this world and the hereafter, and they shall not have in the land any guardian or a helper.

Look at how these people are getting jealous. These Mullahs receive no grace for implementing the of bidah of Tarawih, whereas the Shi'a Ulama and Zakireen praise Ali (as) and his family, and Allah blesses them with His grace in this world and in the next. The Nasibi Mullahs are people who keep burning in jealousy here, and also in the next world. Inshallah.

199.Sixth Objection – All symbols associated with Azadari are false

The Shi/'a processions depict false Blood and False Arrows, the blood and arrows is placed over the Zuljanah, upon which Shi'as weep is false.

Reply

When the brothers of Yusuf (as) came Yaqub (as) and told him that their brother Yusuf (as) had been eaten by a wolf, and that all that remained was his bloodied shirt, Yaqoob (as) placed the shirt over his eyes and bloodies his face with it.

Dear Readers, you see that Yusuf (as) was alive and the blood on that shirt was not real but still Yaqub (as) started weeping bitterly after looking at that replica. Can one criticize the Shi'as when they weep when looking at Zuljanah? Whatever Mullah keeps on saying, but it is a Sunnah of one Nabi to look at the replica and weep and kiss it and make his face red with that blood.

And if this action is Bidah or shirk and sin, then apply this fatwa to this Nabi (as) first. The aim of all these Replicas in Ashura is nothing else to make people remember the incident of Karbala, how Ahl'ul Bait (as) got killed by Nasibis. And all this weeping is only and only in love of Husayn (as). If keeping such signs is Haram, then why Yaqoob kept it with him and kept on weeping after putting it in front of him?

200.Seventh Objection – The Shia have musical instruments in their processions

The Shi'a play musical instruments during mourning processions.

Reply – Ayesha had musical instruments in the house of the Prophet (s)

We are quoting from famous book of Ahl'ul Sunnah Sunnan Nisai, Volume 3 page 195:

"Ayesha said that one day two girls came in my home and we singing songs and also playing musical instrument. By chance the Prophet came along and heard the song. Then came Abu Bakr and he started shouting at us how is it possible that we are playing a Satanic musical instrument in Nabi's house. Upon this Rasool (s) told him to let them play."

201.Eighth Objection – The Shia mourn like they are running

When Shi'a do Azadari, they seem to be running.

Reply – Running is the Sunnah of the Prophet (s) and Ayesha

We are quoting from authentic work of Ahl'ul Sunnah Sahih Bukhari Book 14, Number 2572:

Narrated Ayesha, Ummul Mu'minin:
While she was on a journey along with the Apostle of Allah (peace be upon him): I had a race with him (the Prophet) and I outstripped him on my feet. When I became fleshy, (again) I had a race with him (the Prophet) and he outstripped me. He said: This is for that outstripping.

202.Ninth Objection – women are also participants in male gatherings

Shi'a women often also participate in these processions, wherein men often removed their shirts.

Reply – Observing male processions is the Sunnah of Ayesha

Ayesha observed male processions (Juloos).

We are quoting from the following books of Ahl'ul Sunnah Saheeh al Bukharee Volume 1, Book 8, Number 445:

Narrated 'Ayesha:
Once I saw Allah's Apostle at the door of my house while some Ethiopians were playing in the mosque (displaying their skill with spears). Allah's Apostle was screening me with his Rida' so as to enable me to see their display. ('Urwa said that 'Ayesha said, "I saw the Prophet and the Ethiopians were playing with their spears.")

It should be noted why this game of wrestling arranged in Masjid-e-Nabi? Was it a play ground? And that Nabi (s), who told his wives that, that companion is blind, but you are not blind, so go and observe Hijab, can such Nabi himself take his wife to show her the wrestling of Habshis?

On the other hand, when Shi'a women cry in order to reveal the oppressions of Mu'awiya and Yazeed to the world, then this Mullah starts the machine of giving Fatwa against them. And when they hear the incident of Ayesha's watching of wrestling, then all these Nasibis keep silent, while it is a thing of their own house.

203.Tenth Objection – The Shias are responsible for ecological damage when they take out processions

During Azadari, Shi'as stop the roads by taking processions out, and they also cut the trees.

Reply – This is by the will of Allah (swt)

[Shakir 59:5] Whatever palm-tree you cut down or leave standing upon its roots, it is by Allah's command, and that He may abase the transgressors.

204.Eleventh Objection – The Shia don't mourn the other Imams

> Ibn al Hashimi:
>
> We find it interesting that the Shia do not celebrate the death of Ali (رضیّ الله عنه) or any of their other heroes. Ali (رضیّ الله عنه) was stabbed to death, and he suffered a horrendous death. So what is the reason that the Shia make such a big deal about the death of Hussain (رضیّ الله عنه) but not of Ali (رضیّ الله عنه)? Ali (رضیّ الله عنه) is in fact considered superior to Hussain (رضیّ الله عنه) by the Shia. So why the death of Hussain (رضیّ الله عنه) and not of Ali (رضیّ الله عنه)? The reason is obvious: the Shia celebrate Ashura to spite the Sunni Muslims.

Reply

Ibn al Hashimi has through these words exposed himself. He constantly stresses that he is an ex Shia from Iran. Had he ever been a Shia he would have know that the Shia mourn all of their heroes and participate in mourning gathering for all eleven of their slain Imams. This includes mosque gathering and marches. Any Sunni exposed to Shia communities would have known this reality, and for Ibn al Hashimi an Iranian national not to have known this proves that he is a liar, had he even been a Sunni Iranian he would have known that the Shia mourn the martyrdom of all of their Imams! We should not underestimate this level of deception, its like a Muslim living in the West, without any knowledge that Christians celebrate the birthday of Isa (as) during Christmas!

205.Twelfth Objection – The Shia mourn Hussain (as) to antagonise Sunnis

> Ibn al Hashimi:
>
> Shia celebrate Ashura to spite the Sunni Muslims. The Shia attest that it was Yezid who killed Hussain (رضیّ الله عنه), and they say that Yezid was

a Sunni. This is the reason that they mourn Hussain (رضّی الله عنه), because they blame the Ahlus Sunnah for this tragic event. The Shia mourning on Ashura is therefore a spiteful fist in the air against the Sunni majority. The Shia leave no stone unturned in their defamation of the Ahlus Sunnah, and thus they want everyone to remember that it was "Yezid the big bad Sunni" who was responsible.
As can be seen, the Shia mourning on Ashura has little do with their love for Hussain (رضّی الله عنه), but rather has more to do with their hatred of the Sunnis.

Reply – Our mourning is linked to the love for our fallen Imam (as)

This is a blatant lie! The Shia objective behind Azadari is not to stick a proverbial V sign up at Sunnis as this Nasabi suggests, it is linked to our love for our Imam (as) and nothing else. We will evidence this by citing this example:

"*One picks up the Newspaper in the morning to read a headline about a young boy killed in a car accident. The natural reaction will be to read this story and be saddened by it. Those that don't reside in the same city as the boy and have no link with the victim or the area wherein he resided will move on to the next column. Those that live in the same city will stop and think about the area, and wonder if they might know the victims family. Those that live within the same district of the city will think harder, and will ask questions of friends to see if they know the family of the deceased. Those that live within the same locality as the victim, will be saddened and will seek to share in the loss of the bereaved parents, they will attend their home, express their condolences and shall seek to share in their grief, as they sympathize and will share in their loss"*

One can explain mourning for Imam Husayn (as) from this example. The closer you are to the Imam, to his family the more hurt you feel by his loss, the greater the desire to express your grief art his loss, by joining in his grief, by participating ion gatherings wherein his loss is remembered. It is linked to one's closeness and affinity with him. For us as Shias the tenth of Muhurrum is a deeply personal day wherein the believer seeks to create a spiritual bond with his beloved Imam (as). We certainly do not spend hours barefoot in scorching heat marching ths streets just to upset Sunni sensibilities! Why would Sunnis be upset at our cursing Yazeed when the vast bulk of Sunnis hate him like, just like the Shia? The only 'Sunnis' that would be upset with comments of Yazid are those that love him and uphold his Khilafath, now if our marching upsets such people then that is their problem linked to the manner in which they were conceived, not ours.

206.Thirteenth Objection– Imam Hussain (as) would be unimpressed by the practice of Self flagellation

Ibn al Hashimi:

Do the Shia really think that Hussain (رضّی الله عنه) would appreciate people engaging in self-flagellation and self-mutilation? If Hussain (رضّی الله عنه) were alive today, he would think that these people have lost their minds. We ask the reader if he would want his family to commemorate his

own death in such a manner? No sane person would want his death commemorated in such a manner, no matter how unfair or how violent his own death was. So why do the Shia assume that Hussain (رضّی الله عنه) would want his death to be remembered in such a barbaric way?
To bring up a more relevant example, let us assume for the moment that a boy likes a certain girl. In order to impress her, he decides to beat himself up for her to show his undying love for her. Do we think that she would actually be impressed with a boy who beats himself up? Surely not! Rather, the girl would be frightened out of her wits and she would likely call the police to control this boy. Indeed, only mentally insane people beat themselves up. It is a recognized psychological disorder, and there is much medical literature on this topic.

Reply – The Shia seek to be at one with suffering of their Imam (as)

Ibn al Hashimi has in this paragraph shifted from his role as prolific polemical writer to mind reader, and has sought to inform his readers of the intention of those that indulge in self flagellation. This Nasabi's psychic abilities have failed him for the Shia do not seek to 'impress' our fallen Imam (as) they are merely expressing grief over his suffering. The act of self flagellation is a deeply personal one wherein the mourner is pondering over the suffering of his Imam (as), imagining what he would have felt like on that tragic day, thinking about the battle scene and trying to place himself in the midst of the heat of battle at that time. It is a deeply personal emotional ritual wherein the believer seeks to attain a nexus with his fallen Imam (as) by seeking to focus his mind on his suffering. Ultimately, such acts of grief are conducted on account of love that transcends all boundaries and if such love is unacceptable to this Nasabi, then we invite him to issue takfeer against Uways Qarni's violent removal of his teeth that that we shall expand on in the next objection.

207.Fourteenth Objection– Self flagellation is unislamic and barbaric

Ibn al Hashimi:

Because the faith of Islam is perfect, it does not allow for any innovations to the religion. However, the Shia have added many innovations to the faith, and this is why they are called Ahlel Bidah (the People of Bidah). One such Bidah (innovation) is the practise of Matam, in which the Shia beat themselves in Muharram on the day of Ashura. The Shia will slap their chests, beat their backs, and involve themselves in other practises in order to "commemorate" the dead.
.
As for the Ahlus Sunnah, they are saddened by the wrongful death of Hussain (رضّی الله عنه). He is one of the many great heroes of Islam that died in the Name of Allah. However, the Ahlus Sunnah does not engage in self-flagellation or self-mutilation, which are both considered strictly

> Haram (forbidden). The Prophet (صلّى الله عليه وآله وسلّم) forbade barbaric practises like such, and he said: "No harm may be inflicted on oneself."

In another article the author points the negative perception that self flagellation gives to non Muslims:

> Ibn al Hashimi:
>
> As can be seen, the Shia are giving Islam a bad name; the non-Muslims will see this and think that Muslims are nothing but uncivilized barbarians. This is definitely not Islam. Such ridicolous practises are reminiscent of pagan rituals of the most crude design!

Reply – Ibn al Hashimi's arguments mirror those of the enemies of Islam

A typical reason for such writings against the practice of self-flagellation is a frequently a deep-seated jealousy that the Shias love God, His Prophet and the Ahlu'l bayt with such ardent devotion that it causes them to be prepared to lay down their bodies and their lives for Him, His Prophet (s) and his Ahl'ul bayt (as). There is an obvious feeling in the hearts of those who cannot stand such forms of mourning - a poisonous jealousy which they articulate in semi-religious language. That is this feeling - Ali (as)'s Shias are prepared to lay down their lives for him and his sons (the Imams) to this day, a fact correctly sensed from the acts of self-flagellation. Yet Mu'awiya's alleged lovers cannot find within themselves anything like this level of devotion – like a man who sees his neighbour's house is better but will not admit to it. Above all, since love for these iconic religious figures is a manifestation of love for Allah (swt), it implies Ali (as) and the Imams from the Ahl'ul bayt (as) inspire the love of Allah (swt) to a degree that is unthinkable of when it comes to the barren, sterile and paradoxical figures of Sunni Islam. We refer the seeker of deep knowledge to the example that we had cited earlier in this same chapter, that of the revered Sahaba Uways al-Qarni (ra) who upon hearing that the Holy Prophet (s) had lost a tooth at the hands of the Kaffirs (in the Battle of Uhud, mourned this loss by smashing out all of his own teeth with a rock. He did this with his own hands owing to his devotion to the Prophet (s). To extract one of one's own teeth in grief may be an act of raw emotion, but to remove them all out with a blunt instrument is a calculated and well thought through religious mourning ritual. The Shias originate from such men like Oways (ra) who followed Ali (as). Tell us Ibn al Hashimi whose love and devotion was greater for the injured Prophet (s) the extreme bloody act of Uways (ra) or that of Uthman who evidenced his devotion by deserting the army in the midst of battle only to return after 3 days?

The author has failed to provide any reference in the context of self-flagellation and has but highlighted his gross ignorance of the fact that such rituals are permissible in the Qur'an and Sunnah. Famously the former mentions that Hadhrath Yaqub (as) wept so much for Yusuf (as) that he went blind. Further, in the Qur'an Allah (sawt) lauds this as a virtue of Yacoub (as) and a hallmark of his capacity for love for Yusuf (as) who was unlike his brothers a Proof of God. What is more injurious to the body – a few cuts on a back and scalp, or injury to the eyes? Would Ibn al Hashimi not place the act of mourning leading to diasability within the definition of an irreligious, extreme form of mourning?

Obviously, in view of these strong evidences from the Qur'an, Sunnah and Sunni texts which support the Shia ritual self-flagellation (as we have cited), Ibn al Hashimi has had to resort to ridiculous analogies instead. The currency of the latter is flawed logic about sex and barbarism, all of which have nothing to do with the issue and seem pointedly absurd. His mind is pervaded

by watching global television and internet sites wherein the following acts are portrayed as barbaric:

- the Islamic death sentence for murder and stoning for adultery
- the amputation of the hand for theft,
- the halal slaughter of animals by slitting their necks

Curiously here we have an alleged Muslim extending this mode of indoctrination and brainwashing about Islam to self-flagellation by Shias which he wants you to say is barbaric – while in earnest these Muslims are mourning for the tragedies that befell the Supreme Guides to Truth and Salvation, Muhammad (s) and his family, on account of their love of Allah (swt). In doing so Ibn Hashimi has proved that he is no friend of Islam or of Muslims, his mind has simply been moulded in a dysfunctional way by the British-founded Wahabi ideology, which is no friend of Islam or Muslims despite its pretensions. His Islam is full of self-evident contradictions like those just cited. And he fails to note the deeper and horrible truths – that true barbarism is the religion of Hinda and Mu'awiya he signs up to and endorses a belief wherein:

1. To quote Imam Nawawi from his book "Al-Majmo'a Shrah al-Mahdab" Volume 1 page 348 Kitab al-Taharah states:

"Circumcision is obligatory for men and women and many of the Salaf have said so"
The mutilation of the genitals of innocent female girls through female circumcision wherein the followers of Mu'awiya are happy to cut off their innocent infant daughter's clitoris then stitch her vulva up making her urinate through a hole the size of a pea until her husband rips it open when he penetrates her on her wedding night . This despicable act of mutilation is criticised the world over, and is banned in many Western countries, yet this should not unhinge Ibn al Hashimi as it is the Sunnah of the Salaf that he venerates. It is interesting that:

> Ibn al Hashimi:
>
> the Ahlus Sunnah does not engage in self-flagellation or self-mutilation, which are both considered strictly Haram (forbidden). The Prophet (صلّى الله عليه وآله وسلّم) forbade barbaric practises like such, and he said: "No harm may be inflicted on oneself."

If self mutilation is 'strictly Haram' and the Prophet said "No harm may be inflicted on oneself" why is the mutilation of female genitalia a Sunnah in your School of thought?

2. The brutal murder of Hujr bin Adi (ra), wherein one of his companions was buried alive is completely acceptable since to quote

> Ansar.org:
>
> "Muawiya's severity in killing Hijr was because Hijr tried to transgress against the Islamic nation and to break the bond of the Muslims and Mu'awiyah considered it as an endeavor to corrupt the earth especially in Kufah where some groups of the affliction first appeared against Uthman. If Uthman were lenient in this matter, which ultimately lead to his death and lead the Islamic nation to the greatest affliction and caused blood to run like rivers, then Mu'awiyah wanted to cut this affliction from its roots by killing Hijr"

3. The attack on the companions of the Holy Prophet (s) in Madina by Yazeed, when quote Ibn al Kathir from Al-Bidayah Wal Nihayah (Urdu), Vol 8 Page 1146; Nafees Academy Karachi:

"Yazeed committed a major sin by ordering Muslim bin Utbah to make Medina Mubah for three days. This was a most horrible mistake. Many Sahaba and their children were slaughtered".

This was undoubtedly a despicable barbaric act, but no criticisms should be levelled at the commander in Chief Yazeed, as to quote

> Azam Tariq:
>
> YAZID WAS THE COMMANDER OF MUSLIM FORCES WHO MARCHED TO CAESAR'S CITY. THIS EXPEDITION WAS SENT DURING THE REIGN OF HAZRAT MUAWIYAH AND IN THIS TASK FORCE WERE INCLUDED ELDERLY AND ILLUSTRIOUS SAHABA LIKE HAZRAT ABU AYYUB ANSARI WHOSE FUNERAL PRAYER WAS LED BY YAZID ACCORDING TO THE WILL OF HAZRAT AYYUB ANSARI HIMSELF. THIS EXPEDITION TOOK PLACE IN 51 H IN WHICH HAZRAT HUSAYN FOUGHT UNDER THE LEADERSHIP OF YAZID. THIS WAS THE PIONEERING MUSLIM FORCE WHICH LANDED IN CAESAR'S CITY AND ACCORDING TO A HADITH NARRATED BY ABDULLAH BIN UMAR WHICH HAS BEEN RECORDED BY BUKHARI, RASUL-ALLAH SAID: "THE ARMY WHICH WILL FIRST EMBARK ON THE EXPEDITION OF CONTANTINOPLE WILL BLESSED." (BUKHARI).
> YAZID WAS THE COMMANDER OF MUSLIM FORCES ON THIS EXPEDITION WHO WAGED JIHAD IN CAESAR'S CITY AND AS SUCH HE FALLS WITHIN THE PARAMETER OF ABOVE HADITH OF THE PROPHET (SAW). IN VIEW OF THIS IT IS NOT BECOMING ON ANY MUSLIM TO CAST ASPERIONS ON YAZID AS THE ENTIRE ARMY WHICH TOOK PART IN THIS COMPAIGN HAS BEEN BLESSED BY ALLAH IN THE CONTEXT OF ABOVE HADITH.

4. The murder of Malik bin Nuwayra and rape of his wife by Khalid bin Walid is completely acceptable, the perpetrator of such acts is immune from punishment in this world and in the next.

5. The slaughter of the infant sons of Ubaydullah ibn Abbas, by Mu'awiya's general as we find in Tarikh ibn Asakir, Volume 10 page 146 merits no punishment from Mu'awiya or criticism by his advocates.

6. He provides self-implicit support, for the militant wing of Wahabism – the Al Qaeda and Taliban terrorists who have nothing better to do prove their devotion to God than mutilate, torture and murder innocent men, women and children in supreme acts of barbarism anyone can watch on the Internet such as decapitating civilians simply for driving trucks with food in them for grocers (and admitting that that was the person's only 'crime') and nailing boy's heads

to walls with 10 inch nails, as a mechanism to obtain the satisfaction of God and with it a great deal of course, base sexual activity with 70 virgins in the next world.

7. Attacking Shia places of worship, and killing those inside them is not a cause for concern.

8. The Taleban practice of throwing acid at girls seeking to attend school, permanently disfiguring them in the process

9. Conducting mass killings on spectacular scale such as those on September 11 and the murder of countless Muslims and non-Muslims the world over are in complete conformity with the fundamentalist Wahabi mindset.

The above are all examples of barbarism that are part and parcel of the Nawasib faith and the forefathers they revere. Such acts attract far greater level revulsion and hatred on account of their barbarity; they are far more brutal than the Shia acts of self flagellation. If despite this reality all of the above Sunni administered acts are noble deeds committed by noble Sunni men, then Ibn al Hashimi has no right to attack the Shia practice of self flagellation. One only needs to trawl through the internet and television to find graphic, violent, detestable and upsetting images showing:

1. female Muslim circumcision,
2. schools girls being disfigured after being attacked with acid,
3. the aftermath of suicide attacks
4. al Qaeda terrotists reciting the name of Allah whilst indulging themselves in decapitations, torture and body mutilation:

Tell us Ibn al Hashimi do such images create an appreciation of Islam and Muslims?

In light of this to paraphrase Ibn al Hashimi:

As can be seen, the Sunnis are giving Islam a bad name; the non-Muslims will see this and think that Muslims are nothing but uncivilized barbarians. This is definitely not Islam. Such ridiculous practises are reminiscent of pagan rituals of the most crude design!

208.Fourteenth Objection– The Shia should channel grief in a more meaningful way

> Ibn al Hashimi:
>
> In any case, there are better avenues of channeling grief, including reading Quran and being a good Muslim. What better way to commemorate the loss of Hussain (رضىّ الله عنه) than by trying to rid the world of evil and barbarity? A person could donate money to the poor, create a trust fund in the name of the deceased, etc etc….the options for channeling grief are almost infinite, so why beat oneself up? What does it accomplish? We can only wonder why the Shia follow a faith that advocates such barbarity.

Reply – There is no reason why all the above cannot be done alongside self flagellation

This argument is based on some absurd assumption that this method of 'channelling grief' precludes one from indulging in all of the above cited acts. This is indeed an absurd argument, there is no reason why someone cannot do all of the above acts. A Shia could for example could donate to the poor, set up a direct debit in a trust fund and perform self flagellation, so there really should no objection. As for 'trying to rid the world of evil and barbarity' this is one of objectives behind commemorating the tragedy of Karbala, for when we recollect the martyrdom of Imam Hussain (as) his family and disciples, their acts of bravery and resolve against evil and barbarity are cited by our Ulema as a mechanism with which to encourage people to rid the world of tyranny and oppression! When we take out street processions we let the world know that we are at one with all the oppressed peoples of the world whether that be in Chechnya, Kashmir, Burma, Iraq and are one voice against evil and barbarity whether it caused by Muslims or Non Muslims. It were these mourning rituals that have acted as the focal point for socio-political change, to quote Wikipedia:

"**According to the prevailing conditions at the time of the commemoration, such reminiscences may become a framework for implicit dissent or explicit protest. It was, for instance, used during the Islamic Revolution of Iran , the Lebanese Civil War, the Lebanese resistance against the Israeli occupation and in the 1990s Uprising in Bahrain. Sometimes the `Ashura' celebrations associate the memory of Al-Husayn's martyrdom with the conditions of Islam and Muslims (both of which have been historically continually put down by the world powers) in referance to Imam Hussain's famous quote on the day of Ashura: "Every day is Ashura, every land is Karbala".[29]**
From the period of the Iranian Constitutional Revolution (1905-11) onward, mourning gatherings increasingly assumed a political aspect. Following an old established tradition, preachers compared the oppressors of the time with Imam Hosayn's enemies, the umayyads.[30]
The political function of commemoration was very marked in the years leading up to the Islamic Revolution of 1978-79, as well as during the revolution itself. In addition, the implicit self-identification of the Muslim revolutionaries with Imam Hosayn led to a blossoming of the cult of the martyr, expressed most vividly, perhaps, in the vast cemetery of Behesht-e Zahra, to the south of Tehran, where the martyrs of the revolution and the war against Iraq are buried"
http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Day_of_Ashura

May Allah (swt) grant us all the ability to utilise the tragedy of Karbala as the mechanism to rid the world of evil and tyranny – Ameen.

17.Azadari in other cultures

The world in which we are living is a materialistic, mundane entity with a finite and a definite end; that is to say that it is going to come to an end one day or the other. It came into existence and certainly it has to go out of this existence. In the same way, all things connected with this world will also likewise come to an end.

However when this end is going to come, is not what we are interested in at this time but we are going to talk about things connected directly with this " end " which in languages and cultures that exist today and which existed in the distant past is known by the name or phrase called "DEATH".

Again we are not going to discuss the philosophy of Death rather "events" which are directly influenced by this phenomenon called Death.

When deaths occurs to a human being, he dies and all people including his very own dear and near ones pronounce him as "dead" and eventually deal with his "dead" body as per their individual rites and rules and customs. We see that some people bury their dead, some burn their dead and some allow vultures to make a meal of the dead body of the deceased person. It is an everyday affair witnessed by people all over the world and this process of disposing off of the dead body of a dead person has been going on for eons and ages.

Now it so happens that the departed person was an extraordinary person and was held in high esteems by his family, or tribe or clan and some time his country. When such a person dies, people flock together in huge numbers to pay their homage to the departed soul and remain till the end when the cadaver is either buried or cremated etc. Returning back from the last ceremonies, all jointly decide to hold special meetings or hold mass prayers or collectively perform such social gatherings with one sole purpose in their minds -------- to remember the departed soul! All recollect the good things which the deceased might have performed, remember his good words or deeds and all people sometime stand for a minute or two in silence as a mark of respect for the dead person.

Sometime people who might have been very much attached to the dead person do not like even to say or hear that the person has died! All such tendencies depend how important the dead person was and to how many people he was important and to what extent he was important. It is this degree of importance that dictates the action of the people the dead person leaves behind him that sometime stretches to such an extent that the person is even declared a Saint! Mother Teresa in our times is a good example of such veneration and adoration by the people who were so much impressed by her work of loving the downtrodden, the sick, the poor and the destitute that she has been made a Saint after her death!

If we study the civilizations of the past, we come across hundreds of such examples where people have erected monuments, raised magnificent buildings over the graves of the dead persons, built mausoleums in their memory and even set up statues and named streets and roads and highways on their names! All this is done only to show and express the love and devotion of the people of the "living world" for the dead person! There is nothing unnatural about all these ceremonies, edifices, memorials, meetings, condolences etc. which people perform, cutting across barriers of culture, creed, race, colour, caste, religion, ethnicity etc. In fact it is very human and humane and very natural and very "living" to remember a person who has died and who is no more with us in this world.

As we have said, this "remembering the dead" is a universal phenomenon and it is no surprise that Shi'as also commemorate certain exceptional personalities by observing the days of their passing away, by holding meetings in which their lives and their noble deeds are described and remembered. And these exceptional personalities are none but the Godly souls, the Infallible Imams from the Progeny of the Holy Prophet (s).

At times even their trusted followers too, like followers of Imam Husayn (as) in Karbala are held in high regard.

We give below some examples from the Cultures of the West, which boasts of being on the pinnacle of Science and Technology and Cultural Advancement.

209.Prophet Esa (Jesus) donkey's hoof

In an ancient Church in Holland, there is a donkey's hoof kept and preserved and as the legend goes, it is supposed to be that of the donkey of Prophet Esa (as) People flock to see it and it is held in high esteem.

In another Monastery in Holland, there is a part of some body part of Prophet Esa (as) which has also been very carefully preserved and people come every year to have a glimpse of it.

210.Replicas and Commemorative Processions

The natives of Belgium are renowned among the European Christians for their religious fervour and zeal with which they commemorate their religious festivals and anniversaries. One of the most notable of these ceremonies is the **"Procession of Birth of Jesus"**.

Statues depicting Maryam (as) with baby Jesus in her lap and Joseph the Carpenter with two pigeons in his hand are taken out in a huge procession. This scene is supposed to be the replica of the scene when Joseph entered Jerusalem with his wife Mary and their baby Jesus. It was a custom in the tribes of Israel that a new born child was taken to Jerusalem and two pigeons were given as sacrifice for the new born.
From the book, An Apology from Muhammad by Davenport , People of Nation by T.A. Hampton, Part 1, page 364

211.Exhibit of Jesus' Blood

This ceremonial procession in which a drop of Jesus' blood is taken out in a huge procession with great reverence and respect in the city of Burgess in Belgium is an annual event in which the faithful come from all over the world, to take part in the procession and to see with their own eyes, the drop of Jesus' blood.

It is said that Prince Theodore, Count of Flanders brought from Jerusalem, a drop of Jesus' blood and encased it in a glass cage and placed it in a Church in the City of Burgess. It is this glass cage that is taken out annually in a big procession with the faithful following it with deep reverence and veneration. A picture of this procession is shown on page 365 of the book, People of Nation by T.A. Hampton. Looking at the picture, it appears that the glass cage is enclosed inside a box (using an Urdu term, Zareeh) and this is very richly decorated and then the City's Bishops, Priests and such other people of the Church clad in their finest attire and raiment, bare - headed and bare - footed, place this decorated box, encasing the glass case holding the sacred blood drop, on their head and walk slowly in a procession though the streets of the Burgess. Royal cavalry, members of the Dutch Royal family all walk in this procession with utmost solemnity and veneration.
Excerpt from the book, People of Nation by T. A. Hampton, Part 1, page 356

We now with due respect, ask these Nasibi who are against Matam Processions in particular and Azadari in general, are not Zareeh, Taaziyah, Matam and similar such Processions taken out on such similar lines? Do these processions of Shi'as take out objects which are derogatory or un-Islamic? Do these Zareeh, Taaziyah, Matam etc. create inter communal hatred? Do they hurt the feelings of any Muslim brother? No never. What a contrast! Just consider this..... People in Belgium who do not share the same sentiments with the people who celebrate these festivals,

who do not believe in the birth of Jesus tableau procession, do they ever oppose these celebrations, stage protests against banning these processions? Do they ever create communal hatred, disharmony amongst the people of their country? Never! No, never heard of any violation based on narrow communal feelings, of basic Human Rights there or for that, matter any where in European Continent nor anywhere in American Continent!

What a shame for Muslims who pretend to follow Islam, the religion of Peace, yet who haunt, hunt & persecute their own fellow Muslims just because they profess Islam as ordained by Allah All Mighty and His Prophet (s) and who are known by their Qur'anic name of **"Shi'as"!**

Islam itself means peace yet Muslims have created Hell on Earth for the people who perform Azadari for Imam Husayn (as). Open your eyes O! Muslims of the world! After all these Shi'as are Muslims like you and your brothers - in - Islam!

212.Death Anniversary

Saint Vittovitti was a Christian lady from the Christian Community of Morocco who was martyred. So goes the legend that her tomb was washed away by the flood waters and submerged. Devout Christians and the faithful from the community somehow managed to salvage whatever remnants they could, of her body from the burial - casket which was thrown on the Island of Corsica and brought back to Morocco. Accordingly, January 7 has been proclaimed as the Martyr Day in her remembrance and a huge procession is taken out through all the roads and streets of the City as a sign of benediction and blessing.
From the book, People of Nation, Volume 1, Page 351

213.Buddha's Tooth

It is believed that a tooth of Buddha, the founder of Buddhism is buried in a Temple in Sri Lanka. Devotees in their thousands flock each year to that Temple from India, Japan, China and other countries of the world to pay their respect and have a glimpse of the tooth with utmost devotion.
From the book Yaadgaar, Page 110

214.Zareeh, Taaziyah, Matam

There is the example of a funeral procession which is taken out annually in Tibet to commemorate the death of Japan's Crown Prince. It is the biggest procession in Tibet with a record number of people joining it and no other procession is as large and lengthy as this one even though the Crown Prince died 1300 years back! The main part of the procession is a casket carried very reverentially by the devotees and which looks like an exact replica of a Taaziyah!
From the book People of Nation, Volume 1

215.Death of King Edward VII

King Edward VII, Emperor of Great Britain died on May 6, 1910 but the mourning period lasted full one year! His faithful subject remained clad in mourning black for complete six months! They tied black arm - bands during this period and all Government stationery had black borders on all papers including all Government Letters and Envelopes, as a mark of mourning! The day when Edward was buried, it was a standing Government Order that all Offices, Employees in fact all people should stand still! It is said that all trains in not only erstwhile United India but in the entire British Empire came to a complete halt wherever they were at the moment and remained still for fifteen minutes! Why all this ado? Why so much melodrama? It was nothing but to show the people's love and affection for the departed King or Leader.

18.The tragedy of Karbala

We have given these examples of Non - Muslim people only to show how commemoration days, memorials and anniversaries are celebrated the entire world over and how such remembrances are given universal importance. In our present times too, we see that customs of mourning, celebrations of death anniversaries etc. are still being staged and managed with full sincerity and respect and adulations befitting such occasions and all this in Our Age, which is said to be the Age of Scientific advancement, the Age of Enlightenment! If the Shi'as by upholding the spirit of Universal Brotherhood commemorate in their own way, days of mourning, anniversaries of martyrdom of their Spiritual Leaders and Guides, why should they be vigorously criticized and opposed?

Nasibi propaganda is totally uncalled for and unjustified! The Civilization of our world today, has given every ethnic group, every religious minority, complete freedom of thought, expression in their native language, freedom to practise their religious festivals, rites, customs & practices peculiar to their own creed, culture and religious / social background. No one has any right whatsoever to interfere in their affairs, to castigate them, to impose any kind of restrictions upon them merely because they happen to be different from the main - stream style of living, or do not practice the state -sponsored religion , or for any other reason. Upholding this Universal Right accorded to all people of the world, gives the Shi'as too, absolute freedom to perform Azadari, perform Matam, and bring out Flags, symbols etc. if all this helps them in perpetuating the memory of the Holy Prophet of Islam (s) and his Holy Progeny (as). And upholds the sanctity and sacredness our Imams. Nasibi Mullah's should know that this is a purely religious matter for the Shi'a and as such, no man made law, can ever usurp this Right from them for this will be constituted as interference in our religion.

Why do these Nasibi express outrage when they see the Shi'a?

Commemorating the tragedy of Karbala by holding religious gatherings, crying profusely at the suffering, thirst and hunger of Imam Husayn (as) and his faithful followers.

We appeal to those with hearts to think about the scenario:

the burning sands of Karbala, thousands of merciless killers surrounding a small band of faithful Muslims with Imam Husayn (as) in their midst who have been deprived of not just food but even water for at least three days, little children withering from thirst in the scorching air of Karbala, even the most valiant warriors, men of grit and courage being sapped of their energy and stamina all because of a drop of water!

What do your hearts say now on reading these few lines which have hardly described the affliction, the pain and agony which those 72 brave souls endured? Words fail to describe the calamities they faced, the hardships they endured and the chivalrous bravery they showed on meeting their death?

Can we even contemplate how each of these valiant soldiers fought against the well - fed, hired killers of the enemy in the most exemplary manner that defies all rules of war ? Children as young as 11 years 13 years old, were fighting against men three times, four times their age, their throats parched dry from thirst, hunger killing them from inside and with the sun in the sky raining down fire on these thirsty, hungry band of soldiers. How long could they last, and how long could they fight? They died... no, they were killed in the most brutal manner, their chests were pierced with lances and spears, they were shot with piercing arrows, and their heads were clobbered with clubs.

When all his brothers, sons, nephews, friends in fact all his army was wiped out, Imam Husayn (as) brought his baby son who was just six months old and who was near death because of thirst, to get some water for him. The Imam showed the pitiable condition of the baby and asked for water for the little one, when instead of giving the baby some water, they shot a

19.Conclusion

We would like to conclude our article with these wonderful lines of poetry:

Az Fikr-e-Aaqibat Rahidam,
Jins Ghum Aal Tu Khareedam

"O Master! I have been liberated from worry about the afterlife because I have bought the gender of grief of your pure descendants.

Thus, every year, neigh every second is dedicated to reiterating the sufferings of Imam Husayn (as) so that efforts of Mu'awiya's admirers to hide the truth are frustrated at every turn. We mourn the brutal slaughter of Sayyida Fatima (as)'s beloved son and recall the unmatchable sacrifice the greatest example of truth overcoming falsehood whatever the cost; this was not an event to be careless or reluctant about. Those who want to erase the memories of Imam Husayn (as) are either not blessed with the love of him (as) or they want to hide the identities of his killers why else would mourning Imam Husayn (as) cause such outrage to them?

The Azadari of Imam Husayn (as) is permissible and rewarding Islamicaly, ethically, culturally, traditionally, and is legitimate by every law and canon. May Allah (swt) encourage and strengthen us to follow these rites of Azadari more firmly, and may He ameliorate those who are against the Azadari of the oppressed Imam (as)-Amen.

Mourning Imam Husayn (as) does not breach the Deen of Allah (swt). Those who consider a thing to be illegal should present the proofs of its illegality because according to the rules of Shariah (Islamic Law) everything is considered permissible until proven otherwise.

No doubt King Mu'awiyah and Co. if "Bani Umayyad Hadith Works (Ltd.)." fabricated traditions against mourning practices but these Nasibi should know that any hadith that goes against the Quran is not considered reliable in the sight of any Muslim. If Nasabi are going to insist that our actions are those of the people of Hellfire, then we suggest that they mull over this Hadeeth from Saheeh al Bukharee Volume 8, Book 76, Number 500:

Narrated Sa'd bin Sahl As-Sa'idi:
"...A person may do deeds that seem to the people as the deeds of the people of Paradise while infact, he is from the dwellers of the (Hell) Fire: and similarly a person may do deeds that seem to the people as the deeds of the peopleof the (Hell) Fire while in fact, he is from the dwellers of Paradise.Verily, the (results of) deeds done, depend upon the last actions."

Verily we the Shi'a wear black attire, cry, place dust in our hear, hit our chests, shed blood, recite elegies for Imam Husayn (as), but (as attested in this Hadeeth) our actions may seem Hell bound to the people (Nasabis) in reality they are actions reflect those of the people of Paradise. Acts that these Nasabi might deem good may in fact be acts that shall fan the flames of Hell. This Hadeeth provides a great judgement, but these shameless Nasabi have no dignity they raise objection at others without looking at themselves!

In the same way that Rasulullah (s) practically taught the way of praying, fasting, making pilgrimage to the House of Allah, and giving of alms. He, by naming the year of the death of his dear uncle, Abu Talib (as) and beloved wife, Khadija tul Kubra (as), "Aam-ul-Huzn", that is, by mourning the whole year; and by weeping and ordering the women of Ansar to perform Matam on the martyrdom of the master of the martyrs, Hamza (ra); and by soaking his eyes with the tears, in the grief of his son, Ibraheem, institutionalised the Sunnah of wailing and lamenting.

Lastly, visiting the town of 'Uhud with the companions every year, and praying there for the martyrs of 'Uhud, if this is not a practical way of teaching how to take out the yearly mourning procession, then what is it?

Those, blessed with the power of sight, can see the glimpses of the Sunnah of Prophet Muhammad (s) in these citations, but what can be done about the blind, the deaf, and the dumb?

We ask those with open minds, tell us does any form of social custom exist where the bereaved express their displeasure towards those that come to console them for their loss? Can any example be advanced where the bereaved have expressed anger at mourners who offer support? We challenge our opponents to produce any evidence of a household that insulted or misbehaved with people whose only 'wrongdoing' was to offer condolences at their misfortune. Do you therefore believe that the Leader of all Prophets, would be displeased angered at those that cry for his slain grandson. We are talking of the Seal of all Prophets about whom Allah has revealed in His Holy Book, Verse 4,

Chapter Al Qalam, The Pen, Part 29 of the Holy Qur'an:
And most certainly thou standest on sublime morality

Would not the Holy Prophet (s) be thankful and feel obliged to people who gather and hold mourning functions only to commemorate the martyrdom of his beloved grandson Husayn (as) and to offer their sincere condolences to him and to his only daughter Fatima (as), to his son - in - law Imam Ali (as) and to his first grandson Imam Hassan (as) on the merciless killing of his beloved Husayn (as) at the hands of his own Nation, the Muslims! We are adamant that Rasulullah (s) would never express his outrage at such mourning.

216.The Prophet (s) guaranteed Paradise to those that mourn Imam Husayn (as)

In Shi'a texts we find the words of the Holy Prophet (s) to his beloved daughter Fatima (as):

The women of my Nation shall mourn the calamities of women of my Ahlulbait and the men of my Nation shall cry on the misfortunes and miseries of men of my Ahlulbait. This they shall do generation after generation, remembering the trials and tribulations of my Ahlulbait and on the Day of Judgment, O my Daughter! You shall intercede on behalf of these women while I shall do so on behalf of the men. Whosoever weeps and cries for Husayn (as), we shall take them by their hand and lead them into the Garden of Paradise.
Bihar al Anwaar, Volume 10 page 167

This Hadeeth of the Holy Prophet (s) guarantees Paradise to all men and women who are the Azadaar of his Holy Progeny (as).

Thus faith in his Prophethood dictates, that Azadari on the calamities and hardships of his Ahl - e - Bait (as) should be performed with all sincerity of faith and religious zeal so as to stand with a clear conscious and full confidence in front of the Holy Prophet (s) on the Day of Reckoning and thus expect salvation through his intercession and thereby gain entry into Paradise for Eternal Bliss.

We have presented an abundance of proofs and feel that we have proven our case beyond doubt.

Be it clear to one and all, that we, The Shi'as, do Matam because we are Muhammad' s (s) Ummah. So if we turn our faces from performing Azadari of his Holy Progeny (as) today, then The most Beloved of Allah's Creation, Muhammad Mustafa (s) will also turn his face away from us on the Day of Accounts!

May Allah Bestow His Choicest Blessings upon His Most Beloved Prophet & his Holy Progeny (s)

and May He Damn the Tyrants with His Choicest Punishment & Chastisement and Throw them in Hell forever. Amen.

20.Copyright